communication
interaction
influence
COMMUNICATION

INTERACTION

INFLUENCE

Cracow 2015
“Maska” is a peer reviewed academic journal. According to requirements of MNiSW (Ministry of Science and Higher Education) a full annual list of article reviewers is available on the following webpage: www.maska.psc.uj.edu.pl/maska/listy-recenzentow

Full texts and summaries of published works are available on-line in the international database “The Central European Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities” (cejsh.icm.edu.pl).

This project was financed by Council of Students Scientific Associations at the Jagiellonian University (Rada Kół Naukowych UJ).
Table of Contents

Introduction 5

Gregory Stephens
Foucault’s New Clothes: Revisionist Perspectives 7

Agnieszka Sell
Poe – Hansson – Przybyszewski. The Wandering “Imp of the Perverse” 23

Justyna Dąbrowska
Gaze and Stare as Tools Expressing More than Words: Looking Interactions as a Means of Communication in Brian Friel’s “Dancing at Lughnasa” 35

Izabela Bierowiec

Ewelina Twardoch
Faces of the cultural conflict and “barbarism” in J. M. Coetzee’s “Waiting for the Barbarians” 59

Anna Kuchta
Memory and influence. A story of trauma transmission in Anna Janko’s “Mała Zagłada” 73

Łukasz Dziura
I am Right, You are Wrong. Evaluation of the “Exporting” of Morality Theory 83

Katarzyna Kleczkowska
Bird Communication in Ancient Greek and Roman Thought 95

Monika Sawicka
Of Roles And Gifts – Brazil’s Quest For A Redefined Relationship With African States 107

Ewa Kobylecka
Religious Education in Polish Schools: Teachers’ Intercultural Competence? 119
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Justyna Górniak</td>
<td>Variety shows – a carnivalized platform of communication for the LGBTQ community in Japan</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Szymon Pietrzykowski</td>
<td>Making Politics and TV News Entertaining: Jon Stewart’s “The Daily Show” as (Reflective) “Infotainment”</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kamila Midor</td>
<td>Navy Blues: How Contemporary American Sailors’ Wives Cope with Separation or Losing Their Husbands to Sea by Finding Support on the Internet</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kamil Burski, Jaryna Smertyha</td>
<td>The influence of society on spatial planning in the commune – legal aspects</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Dear Readers,

We would like to present you with the twenty eighth volume of MASKA, which is also the second edition of our periodical with all papers written in English. We are glad that the idea appealed to our authors and we hope that the second edition, similarly to the first one, will find favour with both domestic and foreign readers.

The present volume focuses on the topics of communication, interaction and influence. Communication is perceived mostly as the subject of philosophical and linguistic studies, but in conjunction with the themes of interaction and influence it becomes a significant topic in many other fields, including sociology, psychology, education, and cultural studies. The theme of communication and interaction is no less important in comparative literature.

We will start our investigation with the revisionist article on Michel Foucault. Afterwards, we will focus on the issue of interactions between Ola Hansson and Stanisław Przybyszewski. We will also investigate the theme of communication and influence in the play by Brian Friel, the novels by Hanif Kureishi and J. M. Coetzee as well as the non-fiction prose of Anna Janko. Subsequently, we will focus on the morality theory and the attitude to animal communication in ancient thought. We will also study Brazil’s relationship with African states, the need of teachers’ intercultural competence in education, and LGBTQ community in Japan. Afterwards, we will analyze The Daily Show, and the ways in which wives of American sailors cope with separation from their husbands using the Internet. Finally, we will concern ourselves with the legal aspects of influence that the society exerts on spatial planning.

We hope you will find this volume interesting and pleasant to read. We would also like to wish you many successful further investigations in the topic of communication.

MASKA’s Editorial Staff
In an interview titled “Can We Criticize Foucault?” Daniel Zamora remarks that Foucault (also known as “Saint Foucault”) has “become sort of an untouchable figure within part of the radical left”. Zamora edited a collection of revisionist essays recently published (in English) by Polity Press: Foucault and Neoliberalism. The longer French original version appeared in late 2014, under the title Critiquer Foucault: Les années 1980 et la tentation néolibérale. Zamora’s project has the potential to help mainstream a revisionist view of Foucault that has been building for years. Even while Foucault was alive, some historians criticized his “self-consciously opaque pyrotechnics”. Such revisionist views bring to mind the Hans Christian Anderson’s tale of “The Emperor’s New Clothes”.

Zamora was a doctoral candidate in Sociology at the Université Libre de Bruxelles as his book went to press. His view of “Foucault’s new clothes” spurred me to reflect on my antipathy to Foucault and his followers, beginning with my entry to grad school in 1989, at the University of California-San Diego. In this essay I query my skepticism while surveying some growing criticisms about “Foucault euphoria”. These critiques include the reassessment of Foucault’s ideology by Zamora et al., and criticisms of Foucault’s writing. Moreover, in the revisionist view, “a hostility to the subject runs throughout the Foucault’s œuvre”. Foucault’s crusade to “efface the idea of the self-constituting subject” was blinkered. However, his missionary zeal can

---

6 Ibidem, p. 43.
be seen as corrective to the era’s “heroic individualism,” and understandable within the context of an “anti-humanist wave” that swept Europe in the post-war era.

The answer to the question about whether one can criticize Foucault has been no, more or less, aside from polemical attacks (Camille Paglia decried Foucault’s “disastrous influence on naive American academics”)\(^8\). But the attitude approximating worship, or using Foucault as a shield to fend off criticism, or as a tool allowing young scholars to swim with the big theoretical fish, has not been limited to the “radical left”. For years Foucault has been the most cited author in humanities research\(^9\). Even Foucault’s disciples comment on the mindless way in which he is incessantly cited. David Halperin, author of the “gay hagiography” *Saint Foucault*, remarked on “the almost ritualistic invocation of his name by academic practitioners of cultural theory”\(^10\).

When I entered grad school in California in 1989, in a Critical Theory seminar we were assigned Foucault’s *Archeology of Knowledge*\(^11\). The book struck me as a great billowing cloud of abstractions. We also read Habermas’ *Legitimation Crisis*, and Lyotard’s *The Postmodern Condition*\(^12\). I marked Habermas and Lyotard thoroughly, but I found almost nothing tangible in Foucault. Habermas was difficult, but offered concepts I could work with. Lyotard’s discussion of a “distrust of grand narratives” made a broad social and intellectual turf immediately intelligible. He was also a joy to read. Foucault, by contrast, just seemed to be blowing hot air.

I saw that grad students who wrapped themselves in Foucault were usually pursuing one or another form of victimization studies. That was the level at which Foucault was assimilated: Power Screws Us. Foucault’s theory of power and discourse supposedly gave marginalized people’s tools to “resist” that oppressive power. He was a god in the romance of resistance, which was a growth industry in the academic world in the 1990s.

Those were the two main reasons that I did not board the Foucault bus: 1) writing that was not only clotted, but “simplistic and over-generalized,”\(^13\) 2) the sense that this “Emperor,” or secular saint, was being used to legitimize a sort of theology of victimization. In my view, it had a deleterious effect on the writing, scholarship, and “critical thinking skills” of grad students, who often went on to force-feed Foucault to their own students.

---


Foucault took pains to hide any personal context to his theoretical project. He and French post-structuralists mostly seem to have missed the “ethnographic turn,” i.e. self-reflexive ethnography’s argument that researchers needed to voice their situatedness, or positionality, in relation to their subjects. But Foucault, who “liked to present himself as a detached positivist,” lacked an “appropriate notion of the subject” as Žižek argues. In Foucault’s “political history of truth,” there is no place for the human agency. Foucault wishes to rid us of the delusion of subjectivity. He claims that “the individual is an effect of power.” Similar to Lévi-Strauss, Lacan, and Althusser (the four main figures in French anti-humanism), Foucault stressed “the part played by unconscious structures in the determination of thought and behavior.” In a sense, his project follows a template similar to Marx and Freud, and all those who have sought a grand theory that explains the “preconditions of thought”. However, for Foucault “discourse” became a new metanarrative to displace the fathers of class and the unconscious. Ironically, Foucault’s theory of power became the new grand narrative. Foucault himself became, in the hands of his loyal disciples, the “the last great dinosaur,” as Baudrillard saw it.

Foucault’s animus against the humanist subject was such that he became a patron saint of post-humanism, famously prophesying that “man, as a modern subject, would be erased, like a face drawn in the sand at the edge of the sea.” Opposing romanticized notions of truth and freedom, in The History of Sexuality Foucault argued that “truth is not by nature free” and that the production of knowledge is “thoroughly imbued with relations of power.” This is a truism in contemporary cultural studies, often used to beat down those who think they can change “the order of things,” or to discipline those who question the reigning theories (or faith) of how individual subjects are constrained by an oppressive social context.

Foucault’s “long silence following The History of Sexuality” may have been related to Baudrillard’s take-down in Forget Foucault. There was a sense in which Foucault became trapped in his theory of power, which developed elements of

---

21 I am thinking of the rhetoric and composition ideologues who held sway about 1990–2005.
23 For a counter-argument, see: D. Halperin, op. cit.
self-parody. When he returned, Foucault offered an aesthetic mode of countering power. While he still largely forfeited on the plausibility of meaningful political resistance, the late Foucault offered the Graeco-Roman notion of “care of the self”\textsuperscript{24}. Essentially, Foucault told his disciples that they could resist repressive power through a “stylisation of self, an aesthetics of existence”\textsuperscript{25}.

Such aesthetic, self-styled resistance proved to be popular in identity politics. It is easy to picture the centralized authority – the panopticon – which sees and controls people. Yet through “oppositional identity” and critical consumption, we resist the bad old central power (Eurocentric, patriarchal, or however defined). Resistance through style became a default position in mainstream cultural studies for about two decades after Foucault’s death. The man offered revealed almost nothing about his private self. The portrait that has emerged is rather cold: Foucault’s friend Paul Veyne wrote that Foucault seemed to have “no principled position (...) on the vast problems of the Third World, consumerism, capitalism, American imperialism”\textsuperscript{26}.

By contrast to Foucault and the practice of self-effacement, I’m going to tell my readers about my own cultural context, which I feel legitimates my own skepticism towards Foucault, and a tradition of theory-clotted writing that has followed in his wake.

**FROM POPULAR CULTURE TO ACADEMIA: AN AUTO-ETHNOGRAPHIC SKETCH**

There comes a time when, if recent grad students are to develop their own voice, they need to let go of the theoretical superstructure. They need to become “ex-slaves to theory”.

I spent most of the 1980s in Austin, Texas, where I was an award-winning songwriter and journalist. My memory of those years is centered on how often those two professions were put in the service of social justice issues, but usually in an “edutainment” style. The three dominant issues of the decade, as I experienced them, were racial equality (both the afterlife of civil rights, and the end game of apartheid in South Africa), protests against United States foreign policy in Central America, and environmentalism. As a journalist, I interviewed refugees from Central America and spokespersons for the African National Congress. As a songwriter, I wrote about issues including apartheid. As an organizer and activist, I put together or publicized many anti-apartheid benefits. Those were issues that made journalism and songwriting come alive for me. I worked on the assumption that like-minded individuals could join to affect social change.

This was some of the personal and social context that I brought to graduate school, when I moved to the San Francisco Bay Area in 1989. The writers I admired


\textsuperscript{25} B. Hofmeyr, op. cit., p. 106. See also: J. Baudrillard, op. cit.

\textsuperscript{26} P. Veyne, *Foucault: His Thought, His Character* quoted in: D. Zamora, op. cit.
most were journalists and novelists. Many of them were committed to social justice, and variants of interculturalism. But none of them utilized the kind of theory that would cause a mass audience to tune out.

I knew what I wanted to do in grad school. My aim was to study multiracial audiences, and focus on the communication necessary to mobilize mixed publics. But I never imagined the language of theory as a way to do so. Having been a sort of non-academic public intellectual during the 1980s, my idea of public scholarship came primarily from social scientists who wrote with a literary flair. Little did I realize that the co-existence of academic scholarship and good writing had become almost impossible. Looking back on the kinds of public scholarship I read during the 1980s, compared with what I encountered in grad school during the 1990s, I can concur that that many of the best works of social science prior to the 1980s were “monument[s] to a time when social scientists were able to think large thoughts and write elegant English.” That reappraisal was published in 1997, during a decade when the readability of the mainstream of social sciences and humanities research took a nose dive from which it has not recovered.

In sociology seminars for a Masters and then a PhD in Communication in California (1989–96), the unreadability of most newer social science writings shocked me. By the time I entered graduate school in 1989, when post-structuralism was all the rage, it was increasingly difficult to find writers who could speak in both voices – the specialized discourse of their discipline, and in a more literate “public sphere” voice. The blame for all this cannot be laid entirely at Foucault’s feet, but he certainly was a major tone setter for the human-less and often humorless “unpopulated writing” that Geertz called “author-evacuated” prose, which took over much of humanities and social science scholarship from the late 1980s.

Recently I did an in-depth study of the “theory wars” in the field of rhetoric and composition over the course of a quarter century, from 1990 to the present. The field pitted those who valued pedagogy and personal style, against those in the “social turn” who were inspired by Foucault and other theorists. I found that endorsement of more personal styles often went hand-in-hand with critiques of the monological character of high theory – often seen as a masculinist discourse. Jane Tomkins expressed a perspective similar to mine, when she quoted Ursula K. Le Guin on “the father tongue” vs. “the mother tongue”:

---


Gregory Stephens, *Foucault's New Clothes: Revisionist Perspectives*

the father tongue is spoken from above. It goes one way. No answer is expected, or heard. (…) The mother tongue, spoken or written, expects an answer. It is conversation, [which] means ‘turning together.’ The mother tongue (...) connects.

I was exhilarated when Tompkins applied this lens to books by Felix Guattari, Harold Bloom, and Michel Foucault, which she takes off her shelf, and “reads” to her readers. Tompkins finds Foucault’s *History of Sexuality* “disappointingly magisterial”. Ah, a frank reader response to a god of theory! Foucault’s endless “generalizations” and “the imperialism of description from a unified perspective” lead Tompkins to a fork in the readerly path:

I am not eager to read on. The point of view is discouraging. It will march along giving orders, barking out commands. I’m not willing to go along for the march, not even on Foucault’s say-so.

I identified with Tompkins’ essay, *Me and My Shadow* because I too have been force-fed Foucault; watched grad students genuflect to him; watched colleagues who imposed Foucault on freshman English students. From my observation, Foucault is often treated as the author of a “secular revelation” that can be applied to almost any circumstance, but cannot really be questioned. However, having grown up around fundamentalists, I can recognize sacred cows in various guises – whether clothed in religious iconography, or leftist theory.

For an example of the opposite of Foucault’s “imperial generalizations,” I would point to Linda Brodkey’s classic essay *Writing on the Bias*. Brodkey gave me a new perspective on how the personal can be a form of positionality which allows for a more honest engagement with readers. Brodkey uses personal and family history, without footnotes, to build a sophisticated theory about the importance of “bias,” both in a literal, and a metaphorical sense. The authority of her personal experience is recounted with a precision and analytical skill that does not need to be “underwritten”. She uses “bias” (cloth cut diagonally so that it hangs better on the body) in a metaphorical sense, which can also apply to “bias” as a personal grounding that avoids the “stiffness” of one-size-fits-all theories.

I would like to draw a historical parallel about the need to outgrow slavish devotion to theory. It was a breakthrough when Frederick Douglass included “written by

---


31 J. Tompkins, op. cit., p. 2139.


himself” as part of the title of his Narrative. The time was passing when newcomers to Narrative (ex-slaves) needed to be underwritten by authorities in the publishing field. Now let us leap forward to contemporary writers who need “sponsorship”. In the last quarter century there has been an increasing dependence on “high theory” in the humanities and social sciences. One can hardly introduce any perspective without having it “underwritten by Foucault,” or one of the other theoretical gods, in the language of the fathers. But there comes a time when, if recent grad students are to develop their own voice, they need to let go of the theoretical superstructure. They need to become “ex-slaves to theory”. One has to pay homage along the way to the appropriate theoretical gods. That is part of the academic rite of passage. But that rite has been disfigured by an over-dependence on theory which becomes an end in itself.

While researching rhetorical “theory wars,” I concluded that the issues raised by this fusion of American pedagogy and European theory raised importance issues which could play a role in helping academic writing resolve its “epistemic crisis”. But for this to happen, the warring tribes would have to lift their sights. “If we want [to] become/remain a legitimate knowledge-making field, then we need to make knowledge that ‘travels outside the field’ to affect larger publics,” argued Kurt Spellmeyer. The same could be said of Foucauldian scholarship.

FOUCAULT’S NEW CLOTHES, REDUX

As indicated, I want to query my own skepticism about Foucault. My initial resistance was largely aesthetic. During intellectual discovery, I expect an element of craftsmanship and style in any writer to whom I am going to commit significant time. I expect a narrative, with actors who embody/perform the ideas in question, rather than an endless juggling of theoretical concepts. And I expect to get a sense of how the writer operates out of lived experience. On all those accounts, Foucault was a writer who tried my patience, and who did not inspire my confidence. But I also found Foucault’s ideas used by people I respected, in ways that at times made sense – even if they remained opaque, and devoid of people/lived experience.

Revisiting the development of Foucault’s thought, “Foucault’s new clothes” has acquired a double meaning. Towards the end of his life, the man undertook an “ethical turn” via his “so-called return to the subject”. Foucault’s final volumes of the History of Sexuality trilogy, the last of which was titled The Care of the Self, outlined an “aesthetics of existence”. This included both aesthetic definitions of resistance and Epicurian notions of self-care. The degree to which this constituted a turn has been

---

34 G. Stephens, ‘To Write My Own Pass’: Douglass’ Post-Narrative Trajectory, Afterword to The Narrative of the Life of Frederick Douglass, New York 2005.
debated. From one perspective, Foucault’s turn illustrated the truth: Nature abhors a vacuum. Having killed off the self-constituted subject, what would go in its place? Foucault’s answer was: “From the idea that the self is not given to us, I think there is only one practical consequence: we have to create ourselves as a work of art”.

Grounding his “turn” in Graeco-Roman precedents, Foucault argued that properly understood self-care served as “the matrix for dedicated moralities.” As elaborated by scholars such as Edward McGushin, caring for one’s self, both in the aesthetic sense of self-creation, and in the sense of maintaining a healthy structure, was a precondition for social living – for full relations with others. “Care of the self was the preparatory work, the means, to the telos of living a noble existence.”

Some feel this turn to a self-fashioned subjectivity was “too little too late,” or was out of character with his life work. I would see it as akin to the aesthetic and ideological ends of traditions as diverse as anarchism, and post-apocalyptic literature and film.

There is a biographical component missing here, which is by Foucault’s design. But he did leave hints. In Volume 2 of *The History of Sexuality*, titled *The Use of Pleasure*, Foucault argued that there can only be a value for the “passion for knowledge” if it resulted in “the knower’s straying afield of himself”.

As Keith Ansell-Pearson translates this idea, in his comparison of Nietzsche and Foucault:

> The task is to break with accustomed habits of knowing and perceiving, so that one has the chance to become something different than what one's history has conditioned one to be, to think and perceive differently.

There are surely biographical and social reasons for Foucault’s urge to “stray afield of himself”. I will address this “running away” from my own embodied cultural position, which I define as interculturalism. From this stance, Foucault’s thought often seems quite Eurocentric. This notion that the outcome of our search for knowledge should lead us outside of our own self and cultural orientation, would seem foreign to people from many cultural traditions.

---

One can agree with Foucault that “such a critique of values must destroy the idea of a fixed human identity, so that instead of positing solid identities we learn to engage in a radical experimentation with ourselves”\(^\text{44}\). But surely such a project of moving away from fixity would require an embodied position, rather than the “view from nowhere”?\(^\text{45}\)

For evidence of what set him on this trajectory I want to turn to Foucault’s student days. Foucault on several occasions declared himself to be a Nietzschean. This was an affiliation he shared with others in his generation: in French academic culture after World War II “those who sought recourse to Nietzsche (…) were looking for a way out of phenomenology”\(^\text{46}\).

Phenomenology was seen as being grounded on the idea of a sovereign, founding subject. In interviews Foucault remarked that he was “not only skeptical of this position, but also deeply hostile to it”\(^\text{47}\). Adopting a “hermeneutics of suspicion” as a student in the early 1950s, Foucault rebelled against Hegel and phenomenology. He recalled: “I chose not to be a historian of philosophy like my professors (…) I decided to look for something completely different from existentialism”\(^\text{48}\). He found this in Nietzsche (and the work of Bataille and Blanchot).\(^\text{49}\)

Foucault’s life project had its origins in an intellectual crisis, it seems. All of this was in his head: philosophical reference points. The admiration of Bataille seems a bit disturbing – a shared admiration of human sacrifice. But he reveals nothing (other than being a Nietzsche fan) of any cultural traditions that nourish him. He seems only interested in destroying dominant paradigms, the “illusion of subjectivity”. In fact, I don’t perceive that Foucault was a part of any living culture. He seems to have his head immersed in dead intellectual traditions. No wonder he wants to break free of the dead weight of European philosophy.

The outcomes of living in mental abstractions can be seen in Michael Billig’s dryly humorous analysis of Foucault’s concept of “governmentality,” and its proliferating afterlife in social theory. This section builds on Billig’s critique of “unpopulated writing” in social sciences, specifically the eradication of verbs and human agency. There are no more human actors doing actions: the people and the verbs are replaced by “big izations and ification,” such as “mediatisation”: “a concept built on other concepts, an abstraction of abstractions”\(^\text{50}\). Such is the nature of Billig’s skewering of “governmentality as a sociological thing”.

44 K. Ansell-Pearson, op. cit., p. 418.
49 K. Ansell-Pearson, op. cit., p. 413.
50 M. Billig, Learn to Write Badly: How to Succeed in the Social Sciences, Cambridge 2013, p. 110.
The concept originates in lectures Foucault gave during his Security, Territory and Population course at the Collège de France, 1977–78. The “governmentality” lecture was translated into English and published in 1979. Nikolas Rose and David Miller published an analysis of “governmentality” in the *British Journal of Sociology*, which became the most cited article in the journal’s history, while “governmentality” has metastasized in social theory. Quoting Foucault’s definition of governmentality, Billig finds in one sentence “fifteen nouns, two verbs, and no people (...) We do not see anyone exercising power: there is instead a made up thing – ‘the exercise of power’”. As taken up by Rose and Miller, “governmentality” becomes “a guiding principle for understanding the nature of power”. But in Foucault and Foucauldians, “there is an absence of people exercising power”. Citizens are merely “the objects, not the agents, of power”. These sorts of “abstractions of abstractions” constitute the predominant mode in which Foucauldian discourse operates.

Foucault’s new clothes were a relative thing, it seems. His late turn towards an aesthetics of the self does not change the direction, content, or location of Foucauldian discourses. But what, in fact, is Foucault’s embodied position? Does it grow out of, or speak to, his relations with his friends, lovers and work colleagues? Is his family anywhere in the picture? Did he ever keep any pets? Do any of these thoughts emerge during his walks in Paris, or during visits to San Francisco’s gay bath houses? I am not aware that Foucault ever addresses any personal sources for his philosophy, other than the young student’s devotion to Nietzsche, and the aging/dying scholar’s recognition that the self still needed to clothe itself and present some sort of persona. I see no trace of other social theory which explores this terrain, nor any move to contemporary examples of self-creation and care. While Foucault “turned” towards aesthetic subjectivity, the social sciences and the humanities were immersed in the ethnographic turn. This seems to have had no influence on Foucault whatsoever. Žižek’s critique of “Foucault’s failure to theorise the generative principle of socio-symbolic formations” reinforces my view that Foucault is blind to contemporary culture. This blind spot, and Foucault’s move into neoliberal positions, make it doubly ironic that Foucault has become the go-to philosopher in much of cultural studies. The man perceived as a rebel and a subversive has become, as Regis Debray wrote in *Modernes catacombs*, an “official philosopher”.

53 M. Billig, op. cit., p. 146.
54 N. Rose, D. Miller, op. cit., p. 149.
55 A more hopeful engagement with Foucault’s “ethical subjectivity” turn: E. McGushin, op. cit.
57 Debray in D. Zamora, op. cit.
CONCLUSION

1989 is recognized as a watershed. But aside from political realignments, the declarations of the “end of history,” etc., I have come to understand, through studying the “theory wars,” that there was also a re-alignment of how higher education was conceived of around 1990–1992. But for a brief time, advocates of ethnographic methods and rhetorical principles made a sort of “last stand,” before the “high theorists” – spearheaded by the Foucauldians – finalized their coup, cleaned house, and achieved hegemony for the next two decades.

While the theorists and the ethnography-pedagogy advocates were in pitched battle, Michael Kleine published “Beyond Triangulation: Ethnography, Writing and Rhetoric”58. After surveying anthropology’s evolution towards being accountable for the observer’s subject position, Kleine called for composition theorists to engage in their own “radical critique”. His concluding call-to-arms was frankly polemical:

> We must…allow ourselves to write even more in the first-person singular, to write personal diaries— even confessions—about our experiences as ethnographers. Perhaps these diaries should…supplant formal academic articles for awhile. By studying ourselves, we will come to terms with our own rhetoric.59

Clearly, most scholars are not going to “supplant formal academic articles” with diaries “for awhile”. But Klein’s polemic has a pragmatic point: many academic writers have a “rhetorical blind spot”. To be more honest about our rhetorical aims – less “false,” in Geertz’s terms60 – requires us to be accountable for our own subject position in the “rhetorical situation”. This shift, in perspective has been widely acknowledged in various fields of academic research, but has been largely ignored by Foucault and the Foucauldians.

Part of what sent me back to the study of Foucault was an article by Ellen Quandahl, titled “The Anthropological Sleep of Composition,”61 in which she brought Foucault and innovations in ethnography into dialogue with students as subjects of research. Quandahl’s synopsis of Foucault’s argument in *The Order of Things* is that that “we attend to systems that are not consciously held but that seem to organize us” (415). She suggested that, “despite their broad generality,” Foucault’s theories about unconscious systems are “richly illustrated” by contemporary composition


60 To represent ethnography “as though it were a laboratory study of some sort” is “almost in a kind of positivist sense false”. G. Olson, *The Social Scientist as Author: Clifford Geertz on Ethnography and Social Construction*, “Journal of Advanced Composition” 1991, No. 11.2, pp. 245–268.

I was particularly interested in the way Foucault’s comments on an “anthropological sleep” (*Order* 341) were applied by Quandahl to issues such as “a resistance to examining pedagogy itself” (418). Drawing on Foucault and Patricia Sullivan’s “Ethnography and the Problem of the ‘Other’,” Quandahl suggested that many educators treat students as colonial subjects, forcing them to efface their own cultures, so that students were not allowed to “convey otherness in its own terms”.

This sent me back to the section of Foucault’s *The Order of Things* subtitled “The Anthropological Sleep”. Foucault almost seems, in his typically diffuse manner, to be advocating embodied knowledge, which is to be acquired through anthropology. But there is a sense that anthropology is something we will outgrow. It is “an analytic of man” which has “played a constituent role in modern thought, since to a large extent we are still not free from it”.

Here we are still deep in Foucault’s anti-humanism. But he seems to provide an opening towards “embodied” subjectivity. Regarding Kant’s question: “what is man?” Foucault suggests the limits of philosophy. Perhaps an intervention from anthropology could wake us from our self-infatuated slumbers. Ethnography would define “man,” wrote Foucault, as “a living being, an individual at work, or a speaking subject...”

In other words, humans are creatures of “embodied experience”. I would suggest that Foucauldians who want to re-think subjectivity in terms that can “travel,” should decenter Foucault and put his thought into exchange with Kenneth Burke’s rhetorical theory, and the Latin American philosophy of “interculturalidad,” as a post-ethnocentric means of thinking about liberation. Moreover the work on embodied knowledge (reading, writing, and rhetoric) undertaken by scholars such as Jane Hindman. Giving up the claim to mastery may be asking too much for some academics following in Foucault’s wake. But such forms of dialogue would constitute a real change of clothes, which would be a pre-condition for moving from disembodied monologue to an embodied dialogue.

---

65 Ibidem.
66 Interculturalidad: see note 43.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Aman R., Why Interculturalidad is not Interculturality, “Cultural Studies” 2014, No. 29.2.
Brodkey L., Writing on the Bias, “College English” 1994, No. 56.
Habermas J., Legitimation Crisis, Boston 1975.


Kopelson K., *Sp(l)itting Images; or Back to the Future of (Rhetoric and?) Composition*, “College Composition and Communication” 2008, No. 59.4.


Stephens G., *'To Write My Own Pass': Douglass' Post-Narrative Trajectory*, Afterword to *The Narrative of the Life of Frederick Douglass*, New York 2005.


SUMMARY

This essay criticizes the abstracted, disembodied writing of Foucault and his followers. This is in part a review essay of "Foucault and Neoliberalism" (ed. Daniel Zamora & Michael Behrent, Polity Press, 2016). However, to oppose disembodied writing infers an allegiance to embodied writing. This piece uses a good deal of allusive language, to demonstrate a more literary alternative, in keeping with my profession as a teacher and practitioner of Creative Nonfiction. As a meta-narrative, this is intended as a species of inter-generational dialogue. Hence, I advise editors or grad students half my age: "There comes a time when, if recent grad students are to develop their own voice, they need to let go of the theoretical superstructure. They need to become ex-slaves to theory".
In 1889 Ola Hansson published in the “St. Petersburger Zeitung” a study entitled *Edgar Allan Poe*. He called Poe the creator of “psychological-artistic” direction in literature – the “direction that future course of literature would take”. He wrote the following about Poe:

He is also one of those few, great and sick, who stand out from the whole of humanity. He is sick, because the greatest beauty and nobility of soul at its most developed form is sick. The ideal of his art is sick [...].

In his essay Hansson also noted that “Poe portrays only the dark states of the human soul – pathological states of duality and disintegration, deviations and anomalies”. A few years later, in 1892, another writer characterised Hansson in a very similar way. In the study *Zur Psychologie des Individuums. II. Ola Hansson* (On the Psychology of the Individual. II. Ola Hansson), Przybyszewski wrote about volume *Parias: fatalistische Geschichten*:

This book is a psychophysiology of the subconscious, most elusive processes occurring in the human soul. It is a book about the brain of an idiot. Its regions terminated all connections between themselves and now each functions on its own; a book about the states occurring in an overgrown, morbidly intensified soul, inside of which, without any cause, most diverse eruptions appear [...].

---

1 In 1894 this study had been published in a German-language collection of Hansson’s essays entitled *Seher und Deuter*. Nine years later it was translated into Polish as *Jasnowidze i wróżbici*.
Interactions between Ola Hansson and Stanisław Przybyszewski began as a result of one publication. It was Przybyszewski’s essay *Zur Psychologie des Individuums. I. Chopin und Nietzsche* from 1882 that caught the attention of the Swedish author. Their relationship survived only two years; however, as many literary researchers point out, it was one of the most important periods in Przybyszewski’s life, and the study about Hansson “contained guidelines that Przybyszewski respected throughout his life in his literary work”.

As an editor-in-chief of “Życie”, Przybyszewski not only promoted Hansson’s work but also mediated the Polish reception to Poe. In the first issue in 1899, he published Hansson’s essay on Poe as well as his own piece of work – a manifesto entitled *Confiteor*, whose parts “resemble Poe’s poetics”. David R. Hume pointed out that “Hansson’s conception of the short narrative form grew out of his understanding of the works of Edgar Allan Poe”. Their similar means of artistic expression make it much easier to see Poe’s impact on Hansson’s stories – especially those included in *Parias: fatalistische Geschichten* – than on the works of Przybyszewski. Gabriela Matuszek however calls Poe “Przybyszewski’s favourite writer”, which is a statement that cannot be ignored. The impact of the works of Poe on Hansson and Przybyszewski is an issue that remains poorly studied. The influences of the author of *The Tell-Tale Heart* are not, at least at first glance, as obvious as in the case of e.g. Herman Melville or August Strindberg but they are undeniably present. The purpose of this paper is to provide deeper insight into the relationship between the literary works of Poe, Hansson, and Przybyszewski as well as to elucidate several motifs that are common to these writers and similarly developed in their works. Due to its limited length, this paper is based only on a few selected prose works of these three authors: *William Wilson*, *The Black Cat*, *The Fall of the House of Usher* and *The Imp of the Perverse* by Poe, *Brandstifter – ?*, *Heimlos, Kindesmörderin* and *Muttermörder* by Hansson and *De Profundis*, *Krzyk*, *Mocny człowiek* and *Requiem aeternam* by Przybyszewski.

---


7 S. Helszyński, op. cit., p. 58.


10 D. R. Hume, op. cit., p. 49.

11 This resemblance was noticed by Wieńczysław A. Niemirowski (op. cit., p. 83) and Erik Ekelund (*Ola Hanssons ungdomsdiktning*, Stockholm 1930, p. 159).


William Wilson’s Doppelgangers

Ola Hansson described William Wilson’s doppelganger as:

A kind of a twin brother of Medard from The Devil’s Elixirs. Chamisso’s Peter Schlemihl where a man lost his shadow, Hoffman’s short story about the “lost painting” where the protagonist leaves his own painting in some place […] – these are all branches of the same underground roots14.

The protagonist of Hansson’s Heimlos (The Homeless), one of the stories from Parias: fatalistische Geschichten, could easily be added to this list of names. Erik Ekelund wrote the following about this story:

Psychiatrists described some cases of split personality, but it was a doppelganger motif from Poe’s William Wilson that meant the most for Heimlos. Heimlos is an evidence of the magnetic force that Poe’s writings affected on Hansson15.

The narrator recalls a story of his friend – a man so tired with the hustle and bustle of the big city that he decides to search for some peace in the countryside. On a ship he meets Agnes, his former lover and a modern, passionate woman who loves life in the city. She tries to stop him, but he is determined to stick to his plan and eventually goes to a small village where he marries the preacher’s daughter, Anna. After several years, when he starts to feel that well-known, unbearable ennui, Agnes comes to see him. He is torn between the two women that come to symbolise two different worlds. Finally, his inability to decide, his quandary, and his regrets take an anthropomorphised form:

Some bright point lit up in the distance, approached, stopped, and finally left; it was my wife. I called her, but she did not return. I understood what made her so angry – and everything in me that was love for her, everything she owned wanted to run after her […]. And yet I didn’t rise from the bench – I let her go! Because inside me there was a second one who was stronger than one who desired her. Suddenly I saw that some figure was walking next to Anna […] I saw myself16.

Both Agnes and Anna eventually leave, and the man is left alone with a doppelganger that does not want to go away: “I started to run to get rid of him but he would also run, I walked slowly to let him go past me but he would adjust to my pace”17. Only death can release the protagonist from the double that is haunting him: “one morning”, says the narrator, “shortly after sharing the sad story of his life with me, he was found dead. The blood was dry already and there was a self-inflicted wound in his heart”18.

15 E. Ekelund, op. cit., p. 162.
17 Ibidem, p. 152.
18 Ibidem, p. 155.
We can find a similar ending in the story of William Wilson, a demoralised nobleman who made deception and taking advantage of people the essence of his existence. There is also a doppelganger that follows his every step, an anthropomorphised remorse that tries to reveal Wilson’s true amoral personality. Eventually, William Wilson kills his other self. The dying one tells him:

You have conquered, and I yield. Yet, henceforward art thou also dead — dead to the World, to Heaven and to Hope! In me didst thou exist — and, in my death, see by this image, which is thine own, how utterly thou hast murdered thyself.19

How stunned William Wilson is when he notices that these words are coming from no other mouth than his own. Only in this moment does he realize that he and the doppelganger that tormented him for so long are one person.

Maria Podraza-Kwiatkowska writes that the “externalised state of mind that follows the character ‘like a shadow’ often is evidently unwanted and seen as a fiendish being.”20 Fiendish traits are seen in doppelgangers from Heimlos and William Wilson but only by the antiheroes of these stories who are being tormented by them. In both cases their externalised state of mind shows up when they are trying to commit some injustice and tries to thwart their malicious intentions. The reason for this is, as Ola Hansson writes in his essay on Poe, that:

A man whose physical selfhood is affected by a disease transfers his moral scruples, warning voice of conscience outside of the body and, in moments in which the contrast between positive sides of his nature and an excess of evil inclinations is most enhanced, the conscience takes on a real shape and lives its own separate life.21

The greatest number of characters that can be considered doppelgangers or doppelganger-like fill the pages of dramas and novels by Stanisław Przybyszewski; therefore it is not a surprise that a “recipe” to construct such a figure may be found in his writings:

from the soul of the person I take everything that makes up the tragedy of his life and I create a new character; I create thus the projection of internal struggles and dilemmas and I immediately have two strong characters constantly affecting each other.22

These characters appear in numerous dramas such as Złote runo (Golden Fleece), Dla szczęścia (For Happiness), Matka (Mother), and in novels such as De Profundis,

---

21 O. Hansson, Edgar Poe..., p. 46.
Homo sapiens, and Krzyk (Scream). The closest to the doppelgangers of Poe and Hansson is, however, presented in the novel Mocny człowiek (Strong Man).

The protagonist of the story, Bielecki, steals dramas left by the deceased writer Górecki, submits them to a literary contest, and puts on performances of these works under his own name. He succeeds, but with his newfound fame and fortune comes a fear that someone may discover and expose his secret. He starts covering his tracks by murdering the lover who had witnessed his theft. After that, Bielecki thinks he is relatively safe but then he hears that Górski’s friend, Surzycki, has come to town. Gossip is the only proof of his existence, and Bielecki starts to think that he might be just a figment of his imagination: “maybe this Uhera – this Uhera – Surzycki doesn’t exist just like so many other things in this mundane world do not exist”.

Just as in Poe’s William Wilson, Górski’s friend becomes an anthropomorphised form of remorse. Edward Boniecki writes about the relationships between Przybyszewski’s characters and their doppelgangers:

Przybyszewski’s literary characters are of dual nature, in each of them there are two characters. One of them is controlled by the brain and the other one is a “naked man” ruled by a “naked soul”. The first of them loves, kills, betrays and the second one, this essential man, has nothing to do with it because he himself is thrown into the world, trapped in the body, and suffers a lot because of it.

Bielecki tries to re-evaluate his relationship with Surzycki-Uhera and to absolve himself of guilt by placing the blame for his own sins on his double:

Now I don’t have to separate the old and the new Bielecki – myself, I mean Bielecki, I’ll leave in front of the door of lady Tańska’s delightful palace and the one who will walk inside will be that not-myself. Let’s call him Uhera! Everything that’s not me, I’ll call with an invented name: Uhera!

The appearance of Surzycki-Uhera drives Bielecki to madness. Eventually, he confesses to all of his crimes and then dies, shot by the painter whose paintings he had ordered burnt. The pseudonym that Bielecki gives to his tormentor sounds particularly familiar. Krystyna Kralkowska-Gątkowska points out that “it might be an allusion to The Fall of the House of Usher by E. A. Poe”. This observation turns out to be quite accurate when we look closely at Bielecki’s inner monologue, right after he leaves town:

---

25 S. Przybyszewski, Mocny człowiek: Święty gaj..., p. 250.
With every kilometer he moved away from the town, his soul grew in him with a belief that he’s becoming something better, getting rid of something disgusting, that he’s coming out of old dirty skin, that he’s leaving far behind an old hovel where he lived, where he constantly felt like he was covered in wet dust – yes! hovel – and suddenly it popped into his head: yes, yes! Uhera!

Uhera – hovel [Pol. rudera] – that’s the meaning connoted by the imaginary name of Bielecki’s (imaginary) tormentor. When the narrator from the short story The Fall of the House of Usher comes to his friend Roderick’s residence, he sees that there is preceding damage to seemingly strong walls:

perhaps the eye of a scrutinizing observer might have discovered a barely perceptible fissure, which, extending from the roof of the building in front, made its way down the wall in a zigzag direction, until it became lost in the sullen waters of the tarn.

In the last scene, when lady Madeline rises from the dead to kill her brother, the narrator runs away and from a safe distance watches the “mighty walls rushing asunder.” Przybyszewski brings to his novel a character whose name unequivocally connotes with the fallen house of Usher from Poe’s tale. For the reader it is an evident sign that the end of Bielecki’s story – different than the almost equally-amoral protagonist from Homo Sapiens – will be tragic.

**DISEASED ART**

Ola Hansson called Jean des Esseintes from Huysman’s À rebours (translated into English as Against Nature) a “descendant of the protagonist of Poe’s story The Fall of the House of Usher.” Roderick Usher composes music and writes poetry. He is characterized by his “highly distempered ideality” which is at least seemingly capable of constraining his moral nihilism. In fact, however, the theme of this story is the liberation of the artist from ethical standards, and also, as Louise J. Kaplan notices, the “unusually close affinities between creativity and perversion.” Eccentric artists value their aesthetic pleasure more than anything, and no one less perverse than Usher appears in the various stories of Parias: fatalistische Geschichten, as well as in many of Przybyszewski’s other novels. Eryk Falk, the protagonist from Homo sapiens, whose demeanour led four people to suicide, seduces women for the sole purpose

---

27 S. Przybyszewski, Mocny człowiek, Święty gaj..., p. 41. In Polish version there is a rhyme between “Uhera” and “rudera” (hovel) – that’s the reason why Uhera’s name “pops into” Bielecki’s mind.


29 Ibidem, p. 98.

30 O. Hansson, Edgar Poe..., p. 27.


of finding inspiration for his new books. In the novel *Krzyk*, the painter Gasztowt waits for a suicidal jump of a young prostitute, because he wanted to hear her scream:

Suddenly he heard a horrible scream. – No! not heard – he saw it – he saw clearly how the air was rent, plight by a plow of a huge lightning: it seemed to be a fire-breathing dragon's mouth – the sky howled with a flood of enraged colours, not seen by a human eye [...].

When Gasztowt experiences an aesthetic ecstasy, flames appear in his mind’s eye. For Ada, a character from another of Przybyszewski’s novels – *Mocny człowiek* – fire itself is already a finished work of art:

You see, I am a natural born arsonist. I was fourteen when I set fire to my guardian’s barn for the first time. [...] All of it was burning so wonderfully – those giant stacks from which flames billowed out into the dark sky – those sparks bursting like fireworks that were flooding everything around like blue manna, and at the same time that strange infernal music of cracking beams, collapsing roof trusses, the horrifying hiss of flames suppressed with water, oh! It was strangely beautiful – I would like to experience it once more.

Bielecki, who is not a real artist, dreams about experiencing similar emotions:

At least you had something out of it – a great artistic pleasure, some amazing growth of strength, [...] artistic ecstasy in that moment, because with your soul you were embracing the immensity, power and beauty of fire – ah! I envy you that so much.

There is also a character in Hansson’s stories who feels artistically stimulated by fire. *Brandstifter – ?* (Arsonist – ?) is the only piece in *Parias* in which a question mark appears in the title. The faults of the protagonists in the other stories – infanticide (*Kindesmörderin*) or matricide (*Muttermörder*) – are unquestionable, so why is there no certainty for the arsonist?

There was a fire in the neighbourhood. It seemed as if an enormous black bird was sitting on the top of the roof, hitting the straw with its red claws while fizzling loudly and waving its huge red wings.

The narrator, who gives the impression of being a neutral observer in other stories, falls out of his role this time, not only creating an aestheticization of the destructive flames, but also revealing himself as a former tormentor of the alleged arsonist – now an emotionally unstable cripple. Ultimately, it is the “pariah” who confesses his guilt, even though he doesn't really know what had happened.

---

So was it him who threw a match into the haystack? The memory of this deed disappeared right after committing it, he was then like a sleeping person and completely unconscious that he did something dangerous.

The perpetrator of infanticide also forgets the moment that the crime was committed: “she acted like a madman, a lunatic; she killed her child feeling the same powerful, blind compulsion that a man immersed in hypnosis is subjected to.” Hansson writes in his essay on Poe: “consciousness of the body is only one of two factors that create a personality; the other one is memory.” The personalities of the antiheroes from Hansson’s *Paria* are coming undone. These “primal, semiconscious states of mind” present in Hansson’s writings were something that drew Przybyszewski’s greatest interest. Characters from Przybyszewski’s prose inherited the tragic mark of death from “pariahs”. They lose consciousness and have constant fevers, hallucinations, and inexplicable body pains. These states tend to be treated as an excuse for their criminal acts. Also, the narrator of Hansson’s *Kindesmörderin* sees the woman charged for an infanticide as only one part of her split personality, and asks the question: “what was her relationship with the being behind the haystack, strangling the newborn child during a summer morning?” The answer, quite perverse, is provided by Edgar Allan Poe.

**“THE IMP OF THE PERVERSE”**

Induction, *à posteriori*, would have brought phrenology to admit, as an innate and primitive principle of human action, a paradoxical something, which we may call *perverseness*, for want of a more characteristic term. [...] Through its promptings we act without comprehensible object; [...] through its promptings we act, for the reason that we should not. In theory, no reason can be more unreasonable; but, in fact, there is none more strong. With certain minds, under certain conditions, it becomes absolutely irresistible.

Lust is the factor responsible for a great many deeds committed by the characters in Przybyszewski’s works. But it rarely occurs alone. Most of the time, it is accompanied by a radically different and – seemingly – even stronger stimulus, which also plays an important role in the stories of both Poe and Hansson: *disgust.*
“She was used to submitting herself to his lust; in endless pain and deep sexual disgust [...] I was conceived”\(^{44}\) – states the narrator of *Requiem aeternam* about the relationship of his parents. A complex relationship between lust and disgust is a part of the incestuous brother-and-sister affair of *De Profundis*. There are striking signs of rape in each and every one of their sexual encounters\(^{45}\), morbid passion making them destroy each other like when Agaj “tucked into the skin on his neck and tore it”\(^{46}\). Disgust that is born from love also leads to the desire for destruction in Poe’s *The Black Cat*:

> For my own part, I soon found a dislike to it arising within me. This was just the reverse of what I had anticipated; but — I know not how or why it was — its evident fondness for myself rather disgusted and annoyed. By slow degrees, these feelings of disgust and annoyance rose into the bitterness of hatred\(^{47}\).

The man kills the animal, which returns a while later as a living form of remorse – the same case as with William Wilson’s doppelganger. Disgust, this time revolving around human physiology, drives the character to matricide in the Hansson’s story:

> He loved his mother passionately, but it was an unnatural love – morbid, manifested by convulsive bursts of tenderness, but in the moments of warmest caresses he would turn away from her in disgust. [...] One evening [...] he looked up at her when she was swallowing a piece of fruit that she was eating. With an almost superhuman effort he stood up and tried not to look at his mother, despite an insurmountable force leading his sight to the throat of the eating woman. [...] Day and night he would see the esophagus of the one who was the most important part of his soul [...] One day in January, when he returned from the garden, he found his mother lying on a chaise lounge. With her eyes half-closed, she seemed asleep... He saw a thin, long neck [...] and a moment later he squeezed this bare neck strongly. The woman shook convulsively and looked with terror in her eyes. He did not understand, he did not feel, he did not understand anything – his soul and body did not exist at all, there were only two fists squeezing some pulp\(^{48}\).

The mother becomes completely dehumanised; in the eyes of her murderer she is only a disgusting piece of meat, just like the newborn child in the story *Kindesmörderin*:

> Before her she saw a small red thing that was moving and shouting, living piece of meat that she had to silence and immobilize. She strangled it to death, as you smash a frog or trample a snail. Maybe she felt a shiver of disgust [...]\(^{49}\).

---


\(^{45}\) W. Gutowski, *Nagie dusze i maski. O młodopolskich mitach miłości*, Kraków 1997, p. 82.

\(^{46}\) S. Przybyszewski, *De profundis*, Lwów 1900, p. 89.


\(^{49}\) O. Hansson, *Kindesmörderin...*, p. 28.
This disgust that pushes characters to murder, this “imp of the perverse” awakened by uncontrollable disgust and requiring characters to commit crimes for absurd, rationally-inexplicable reasons, seemingly only appears all of a sudden. The characters from all of these literary works have even more in common. As Hansson writes, they are “sick, born with a kind of predisposition which only awaits for an opportunity to appear in a form of abnormal impulses and murderous acts”50. “From the very beginning shame – disgust – indignation”51 – this is the beginning of life in *Requiem aeternam*. The matricide from Hansson’s story is also born from “bad blood”:

The young man came into the world stigmatized, he was a child of misfortune. In his veins flowed degenerated blood, inside of him there was an irritating embryo, his soul was tormented by an ulcer, ensued from depraved ancestors. He was cursed, cursed irrevocably while still in his mother’s womb.52

William Wilson feels disgust towards his real, stigmatizing name:

I had always felt aversion to my uncourtly patronymic, and its very common, if not plebeian prænomen. The words were venom in my ears; and when, upon the day of my arrival, a second William Wilson came also to the academy, I felt angry with him for bearing the name, and doubly disgusted with the name because a stranger bore it53.

His disgust caused by the sudden appearance of a second one cursed with the same shameful name is even greater. Such an escalated disgust is unbearable – both for him as well as for other characters marked with “the imp of the perverse”. Such an accumulation of similarities should not be ignored by literary researcher.

Characters in both Przybyszewski’s and Hansson’s prose are in a way descendants of protagonists from Poe’s short stories. They share a dark side of personality that emerges unawaresely, followed by the irresistible, incomprehensible urge to destroy. This paper introduces only a few signs of their kinship – further reading reveals even more similarities. Poe’s mark can also be found in Hansson’s *Sensitiva amorosa* (1887) and *Alltagsfrauen* (1891) – those stories, alongside *Parias: fatalistische Geschichten*, caught Przybyszewski’s greatest attention. Due to this penchant for Swede’s writings Przybyszewski’s novels carry not only the imprint of Poe. They also carry the imprint of Hansson’s reading of Poe’s short stories.

51 S. Przybyszewski, *Requiem aeternam...*, p. 53.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Przybyszewski S., *De profundis*, Lwów 1900.
SUMMARY

The purpose of this paper is to mark the importance of the influence that the writings of Edgar Allan Poe had on Ola Hansson and Stanisław Przybyszewski. There are some motifs that are common to these writers and were similarly developed in their literary works, but they weren’t yet a subject of deeper academic insight. In this paper I focus on several of these themes, such as the existence of a doppelganger, the relationship between art and perversity, the loss of consciousness, the criminal impulses, the stigmatisation and the feeling of disgust. All of these issues seem to deeply concern Poe, Hansson and Przybyszewski, and they had been reappearing almost obsessively in the majority of their works.
The play *Dancing at Lughnasa* by the Irish playwright Brian Friel premiered in Abbey Theatre in 1990. It is one of Friel’s most successful and most frequently staged works—it was also adapted for the screen by director Pat O’Connor with Meryl Streep playing one of the lead roles. It is a memory play which presents the story of five unmarried sisters (Chris, Rose, Kate, Maggie and Agnes) who live together on the outskirts of a small Irish town. Their social interactions are rather limited, and only one of them, Kate, works in town. They are all unmarried and live solely with Michael, the son of one of the sisters. This strictly female environment gets changed when their brother Jack, who was a priest at a leper colony, comes back home. The Mundy sisters are also visited on two occasions by Chris’s past lover – Gerry, Michael’s father. Michael is a narrator who relates the events in the play and influences the readers’/audience’s understanding of them. The sisters are bored with their mundane household chores – the only moment when they free themselves from the typical female obligations like ironing or cleaning is the scene in which they engage in a wild dance in their kitchen. This is one of the rare moments of happiness, as towards the end of the play the readers/audience observe the dissolution of the Mundy family (their brother Jack dies, Gerry departs from Ireland never to be seen again, and Rose and Agnes leave the house forever).

In the play, the characters closely watch one another. Michael constantly observes his aunts and sees them not only performing some household chores, but also dancing in a wild, ecstatic manner. The sisters look at one another, keeping their behaviour and emotions in check; and finally, when Gerry arrives, he is watched by Michael, his son, and the other sisters, especially Chris, who still has some feelings for him. The characters in the play influence each other by means of looking and gazing at each other. Men look at women and thus create their images as the ones who are
inferior according to male, patriarchal standards. Michael watches his aunts and thus interprets their behaviour.

The focus on looking and seeing in Friel’s dramatic text has not escaped the attention of critics. Anna McMullan, for instance, notes that in *Dancing at Lughnasa* “[i]ndividuals scrutinise each other: Michael watches his father and *vice versa*, the other sisters watch Chris and Gerry as they dance, all of them watch Jack (in various senses of the word), Chris watches Agnes and Gerry, and the audience watches all of them”. Young Michael exercises many different ways of looking and thus communicates with others in many different ways. He interprets the other characters’ behaviour, then as an adult narrator describes what he saw in his childhood and thus helps the audience gain an insight into the play. Michael communicates with the audience, shares his thoughts and feelings with them. Michael’s slightly fearful and curious gaze directed at the aunts as they dance their mysterious dance, which becomes the moment of their rebellion, can be analysed as an instance of baroque staring as discussed by Martin Jay and Rosemarie Garland-Thomson. Moreover, his constant observation of the aunts from the position of a male viewer watching female actions and behaviour can be compared to the male gaze as defined by Laura Mulvey.

Before the analysis of the above-mentioned looking interactions, it is important to make a distinction between the gaze and the stare. While gaze is a tool of control and shows power relations, stare expresses a more positive attitude of an observer who wants to get more information about the object of his look. Some traces of staring can be found in the scene in which Michael watches his father and in this way shapes the reader’s/viewer’s understanding of the character. The way of communication with Gerry is for Michael to look at him and interpret his behaviour. Michael thus adopts different ways of looking at different persons in the play and in this fashion interacts with them. He also communicates with the past by recalling the events that he saw as a child. All the images from the past that are projected on the stage give him an insight into the world that he tries to understand. These images inform his narrative through which the readers/audience make sense of the world presented in the play. Various gazes and looking relations that he was involved in as a child help him to comprehend this world, communicate nonverbally with others around him and cope with the harsh reality of his parents’ separation or the lingering financial problems of the family.

Taking recourse to the Jay’s and Garland-Thomson’s concept of baroque staring and Mulvey’s notion of the male gaze, I argue that the numerous looks exercised by the characters in *Dancing at Lughnasa* are for them a source of knowledge about others, as in the case of Michael watching his aunts or Gerry. The gaze can also be a means of manipulation, especially when used in an interaction between a male viewer (Gerry) and a female character (Chris or Agnes). Moreover, all the aforementioned concepts give the reader/viewer an insight into the characters’ reasoning – they

---

reveal their fears, thoughts, and motives behind their actions, they also shed light on
the various visual interactions in the play and the relations which these interactions
shape. By studying such relations, the reader/viewer can understand the play better
and grasp the purely visual interactions between the characters. These interactions
show their need to express some lingering feelings of desire and love – feelings that
are suppressed by patriarchal norms visible in language and culture around them. As
a narrator, Michael is the one who describes the interactions between the characters.
It is necessary though to visualize them, as the words fail to present the minute deta-
ils in the relations among the dramatis personae. The eyes, not mouth, are the means
of communication in Friel’s drama – it is so even despite the fact that Dancing at
Lughnasa is similar to a typical Irish play, where long monologues and story-telling
are traditionally the dominant form of expression. It is communication through
sight that is the real foundation of the interactions between the characters.

In order to trace and analyse some of the acts of looking present in Dancing at
Lughnasa, it is worthwhile to look at selected fragments of Martin Jay’s Downcast Eyes.
The Denigration of Vision in Twentieth-Century French Thought. Jay refers to the im-
portance of visual experience throughout centuries while also describing its relevance
and significance throughout the epochs. He observes that

\[\text{[u]nlike the other senses of smell, touch, or taste, there seems to be a close, if compi-
lcated, relationship between sight and language, both of which come into their own at}
\approx \text{the same moment of maturation. As Robert Rivlin and Karen Gravelle note, “The ability to visualize something internally is closely linked with the ability to describe it verbally. Verbal and written descriptions create highly specific mental images… The link between vision, visual memory, and verbalization can be quite startling.”}^2\]

The exact thing can be noticed in case of Michael looking at his aunts and father.
He starts the play with a monologue describing what happened during the summer
of 1936. His speech is immediately associated with visual images, and the readers/
viewers can see before their eyes what they read/hear. Michael says:

And when I remember the kitchen throbbing with the beat of Irish dance music… and
my mother and her sisters suddenly catching hands and dancing… At the same time
I see that forlorn figure of Father Jack shuffling from room to room… during those
Lughnasa weeks of 1936 we were visited on two occasions by my father, Gerry Evans,
and for the first time in my life I had a chance to observe him^3.

Not only the audience can instantly project these words as images in their minds
but Michael does that himself too. He now speaks from the perspective of a mature
man but all the memories previously contained in his mind seem as if they belonged
to the present-day reality. He communicates with the past thanks to his memories

^2 M. Jay, Downcast Eyes. The Denigration of Vision in Twentieth-Century French Thought, Berkeley,

which helps him create a bond with the audience and win their sympathy. As Joan E. Robbins points out:

“[the p]lot is minimal, and the emotional arcs of the characters shape the play, punctuated by certain events or objects that Michael highlights in his first narration: the wireless radio, the Festival of Lughnasa, Uncle Jack’s return, and Gerry Evans’ visit”

He sees his aunts in a wild dance, his uncle, who is totally lost in his old and long-forgotten home, and his father, visiting twice. The significance of the connection between visual perception and verbal expression is also highlighted by Anna McMullan – she claims that Friel’s play “incorporates a tension between the voice and vision”. She additionally implies a close relation between Michael and Friel himself, speaking of “the author-narrator”. What is most important here though is the fact that in the play Michael acts like an artist who uses words to create the whole picture of his past and show it to the audience. He tries to express his ideas verbally but it soon becomes apparent that words fail to demonstrate the complicated relations between the characters and one needs to look at them to get to know more.

Baroque staring, which has been investigated by Martin Jay and closely examined by Rosemarie Garland-Thomson as well, is a concept relevant to the discussion of visual communication. Garland-Thomson’s study is transhistorical and general, whereas for Jay baroque staring is closely connected with the Baroque epoch. Jay refers to Christine Buci-Glucksmann’s reading of Baroque visual practices as “disorienting, ecstatic [and] dazzling [in their] implications”. He mentions an important aspect of Baroque vision, namely “the madness of vision” (the expression taken from Buci-Glucksmann):

[It] dazzles and distorts rather than presents a clear and tranquil perspective on the truth of the external world. Seeking to present the unrepresentable, and of necessity failing in this quest, baroque vision sublimely expresses the melancholy.

By generalizing these remarks beyond the specificity of the Baroque epoch – a critical procedure also used by Rosemarie Garland-Thomson – one could argue that this is exactly what happens to Michael watching his aunts and then remembering this sight for the rest of his life. In one of his monologues he states:

---
5 A. McMullan, op. cit., p. 90.
6 Ibidem, p. 90.
7 M. Jay, op. cit., p. 47.
8 Ibidem.
9 Ibidem.
[b]ut there is one memory of that Lughnasa time that visits me most often; and what fascinates me about that memory is that it owes nothing to fact… everything is simultaneously actual and illusory.10

Michael is aware of the contradictory nature of his vision, and the reader/audience can obviously see the melancholy resulting from his inability to represent an experience that is transitory and transcendent.

When Rosemarie Garland-Thomson mentions baroque staring in her book, she refers back to Christine Buci-Glucksmann and her “madness of vision”. She does also provide a more sensuous, ritualistic and vivid account of such a look though. Enchanted by the appearance of his aunts dancing and the memories connected with the summer of 1936, Michael is also amazed and positively disturbed by them. He recounts the dance as “a spontaneous step-dance and laughing – screaming!”11. He compares his aunts to “excited schoolgirls”12, and he then goes on to state that “even though I was only a child of seven at the time I know I had a sense of unease… of things changing too quickly before my eyes, of becoming what they ought not to be”13. He recalls that this could have been caused by the fact that Uncle Jack ceased to be an ideal role model that he remembered from a photo. The sense of chaos is also evoked when Michael recalls his aunts surrendering to the loud music beaming from the radio which “derange[s] those kind, sensible women [his aunts] and transform[s] them into shrieking strangers”14. This quote is especially important when we bear in mind that Garland-Thomson observes that baroque staring “is a giving over to the marvellous”15. She also adds that “unconcerned with rationality, mastery, or coherence, baroque staring blatantly announces the states of being wonder-struck and confounded”16. This is exactly how Michael feels when he watches his aunts, or when he relates the whole story. His memory takes him away to the time when he had an opportunity to observe his aunts, see their interactions with each other and with him. He communicates with the past and, in a way, with his aunts by means of remembering what he saw and recalling his feelings at the time. He is “wonder-struck” by the past events as much as he is aware that his aunts’ dance was a very rebellious act to do by women living in a patriarchal environment. Only now he sees that his aunts yearned for a change in their mundane lives.

Moreover, “[b]aroque staring entangles viewer and viewed in an urgent exchange that redefines both”17. In the play this actually takes place when in their wild dance

---

10 B. Friel, op. cit., p. 107.
12 Ibidem.
13 Ibidem.
14 Ibidem.
16 Ibidem.
17 Ibidem.
the Mundy sisters appear to Michael as new and extraordinary, “shrieking strangers”\textsuperscript{18}, quite alien to what they seemed to be before – aunts immersed in their household chores. Michael too changes his perception, and his memories influence his adult thinking. Baroque staring facilitates the aforementioned “exchange” between the viewer and the viewed – it becomes a medium of communication between Michael and his aunts. After many years Michael is able to discern what his aunts’ dance communicated – it was their strong rebellion against the oppressive parochial environment that trapped them. It was also their resistance against the patriarchal model of a woman, according to which they should behave in a modest and rational way.

In her essay “Visual Pleasure And Narrative Cinema”, which focuses on the notion of the male gaze, Laura Mulvey states:

> pleasure in looking has been split between active/male and passive/female. The determining male gaze projects its phantasy on to the female figure which is styled accordingly\textsuperscript{19}.

Her description of the gaze can be associated with some of the looks in \textit{Dancing at Lughnasa}. The male gaze is discernible in the play in Michael looking at and thus communicating with his aunts, also when we see Gerry’s behaviour towards Chris or Agnes.

Shohini Chaudhuri reflects that Mulvey’s “political use of psychoanalysis enables her to turn her focus from the mere description of woman as spectacle to the male psyche whose needs the spectacle serves”\textsuperscript{20}. This pertains to the women in Friel’s play just as much as it does to the women on screen analyzed in Mulvey’s essay. They surrender to male control and are in fact subjected to and influenced by men’s vision of their lives. They perform actions that men expect of them and play roles assigned to them by men. This is especially visible in Kate’s reluctance to go to a harvest dance. She is so afraid of what the other people, especially the local priest, will say about their participation in the dances that she rejects her sisters’ suggestions to go there: “No, no, no! We’re going nowhere!”\textsuperscript{21}, and later adds: “It’s a sorry day to hear talk like that in a Christian home, a Catholic home!”\textsuperscript{22}.

Yet, the sisters’ desire to dance takes over and they finally dance at the privacy of their home. Claudia W. Harris suggests that “[i]n this scene [the sister’s wild dance], and in the structure of the play as a whole, Friel has unwittingly, no doubt, created a multi-layered expression of the male gaze”\textsuperscript{23}. She also adds that Michael recalls the dance scene as a mature man,

\textsuperscript{18} B. Friel, op. cit., p. 8.
\textsuperscript{21} B. Friel, op. cit., p. 24.
\textsuperscript{22} Ibidem, p. 29.
so the play demonstrates two layers of male interpretation of the female. And behind this, of course, is a third layer as the mature Friel watches himself in the writing remembering these women during the summer of 193624.

Harris then goes on to claim that “the seven-year-old Michael is a character within the play hiding behind the bush watching his mother and his aunts, but the narrator Michael is also the camera’s lens, the filter through which to view the action”25. All Harris’s comments are valid, especially in the light of the fact that Michael starts the play with his narration. His long monologue shapes the readers’/viewers’ understanding of the play, and is later broadened by Michael’s looking at sisters’ actions. He thus provides space for the sisters to present themselves to the audience. Michael is, in fact, facilitator of the male gaze, as he gives the audience an opportunity to exercise it on his aunts.

From the very beginning of the play the stage directions stress the fact that it is Michael who will be the observer and narrator of his aunts’ actions: “Michael is standing downstage left in a pool of light. The rest of the stage is in darkness”26. This emphasises Michael’s active role as an almost god-like figure looking at his people and carefully watching their actions. Kiberd sees it as “a Frielian device of control – that of the male narrator who frames a female experience”27. The means by which he interacts with his aunts is almost only his watchful gaze. As Helen Lojek points out, “Michael’s retrospective gaze perpetuates the typical male gaze that has historically defined images of women”28.

Michael is an active 
voyeur

but his father, Gerry Evans, is also an interesting figure in this respect. He is both the one who uses the male gaze as well as the object of a kind of gaze and a curious stare. When he appears in Ballybeg for the first time in the play, he is observed by the sisters and by Michael. The stage directions say:

Gerry Evans enters left. His step jaunty, swinging his cane, his straw hat well back on his head. He knows he is being watched. Although he is very ill at ease the smile never leaves his face29.

Gerry is here the object of the look exercised by the sisters, who watch him insightfully. He is aware of being watched so passionately and acts as if he was not bothered with it. He presents himself to his sisters who yearn for a male presence in their lives. He has the opportunity to communicate his masculinity and amaze the sisters. Thus,

24 Ibidem.
26 B. Friel, op. cit., p. 7.
29 B. Friel, op. cit., p. 43.
the sisters’ gazes, in a way, trap Gerry – he becomes the object of their intense and even desirous look.

The sisters watch carefully every moment of Chris’s conversation with Gerry as well as their spontaneous dance. When Gerry hears the music from the radio, he suddenly grabs Chris in his arms and dances, and this immediately meets with Chris’s terrified comment: “Oh God, Gerry –” and later: “They’re watching us… Maggie and Aggie. From the kitchen window”\(^{30}\). The gaze of the sisters in the window is further foregrounded by Michael’s aunts’ comments:

- MAGGIE: They’re dancing together
- KATE: God forgive you!
- MAGGIE: He has her in her arms
- KATE: He has not! The animal! (She flings the paper aside and joins Maggie at the window)\(^{31}\).

It can be observed that the sisters’ watchful eyes scrutinise the pair during their intimate interaction.

Gerry himself is also an active observer when it comes to Chris, with whom he has an illegitimate child, Michael. Gerry constantly adores Chris and, as it turns out later, he is also attracted to Agnes. When talking to Chris, Gerry repeats some compliments: “You’re looking wonderful, Chrissie. Really great. Terrific”\(^{32}\). When Chris tries to rebuke him and shun his pestering comments by answering: “My hair’s like a whin-bush”\(^{33}\), he immediately throws a flirtatious remark: “Looks lovely to me”\(^{34}\). It can be noticed that Gerry exercises the power of his compliments on Chris and is an active observer of her appearance. It can also be noticed here that “[t]he image of woman as (passive) raw material for the (active) gaze of man”\(^{35}\) is captured in Gerry’s attentive look. He thus verbally creates a vision of femininity on the basis of what he sees and imposes the said vision on the defenceless image of Chris. He shapes her image and adopts it as an attractive object of his look. The interaction between Chris and Gerry is often intimidating for Chris, as she holds an inferior position in this type of relation.

Nevertheless, Gerry is not only the source of the framing gaze, as we can call it here, but he is also subject to some curious staring on Michael’s part. When Gerry and Chris talk, he suddenly observes that his son is watching them. He says: “Don’t turn round; …he’s watching us from behind that bush”\(^{36}\) and adds: “Pretend you

---

\(^{30}\) Ibidem, p. 52.
\(^{31}\) Ibidem, p. 53.
\(^{32}\) Ibidem, p. 44.
\(^{33}\) Ibidem.
\(^{34}\) Ibidem.
\(^{35}\) L. Mulvey, op. cit., p. 756.
\(^{36}\) B. Friel, op. cit., p. 47.
don’t notice. Just carry on”37. It can be argued that Michael is a keen observer of his father and thus exercises a scrutinizing look on him – father becomes for Michael an object to be looked at and contemplated, since the boy is curious and wants to know more. This is similar to what Garland-Thomson points out about the intense look at somebody, the “stare”: “we stare when ordinary seeing fails, when we want to know more”38. Michael’s look is definitely a stare as he observes his parents, especially the father whom he has not seen for a great while. Michael shapes and influences our (readers’/viewers’) and his own understanding of his father. He controls the way his father is perceived by first looking at him and then revealing Gerry’s doings in his long narrative monologues. During his conversation with Chris, Gerry states:

Anyhow I’ve still to enlist… He’s still watching us. He thinks we don’t see him. I wouldn’t mind talking to him39.

Immediately after this comment Chris says that Michael is a shy boy, implying that the conversation with him could be hard. This highlights the fact that the only tool for Michael to get to know his father – and, in a way, to nonverbally communicate with him and show his interest – is a long and protracted stare. Michael does not talk with his father, thus the only tool to get to know him is to observe his father’s actions and behaviour.

Gerry dances with Chris but later in the play he also grabs Agnes and induces her to dance with him. His actions, and especially the kiss Gerry lays on Agnes’s forehead, is carefully watched by Chris:

*He [Gerry] bends down and kisses her [Agnes] on the forehead. All this is seen – but not heard – by Chris at the kitchen window*40

As in the scene with Chris, Gerry compliments Agnes while dancing: “You should be a professional dancer”41, and “You could teach dancing in Ballybeg”42. In these comments a trace of the male gaze focused on Agnes is discernible – we may assume that while making such statements about Agnes’s dance skills, Gerry is probably looking at her body, hips, legs. Presumably, to use Mulvey’s words, he “live[s] out his phantasies and obsessions through linguistic command by imposing them on the silent image of woman still tied to her place as bearer of meaning not maker of meaning”43. In this scene Chris is a *voyeur* immersed in her gaze which traces every

---

37 Ibidem.
38 R. Garland-Thomson, op. cit., p. 3.
39 B. Friel, op. cit., p. 51.
40 Ibidem, p. 98.
41 Ibidem.
42 Ibidem.
movement of interaction between Agnes’s and Gerry’s bodies. She, in a way, interacts silently with them, being a part of their intimate meeting. She observes them and becomes a “peeping Tom” who cannot dodge the desire to watch others. Agnes and Chris are both attracted to Gerry, which leads to the growing tension and jealousy between the sisters.

What appears as the final image in Dancing at Lughnasa are kites made with great precision by Michael. They serve as a framework of the play by marking their presence in its beginning, when Kate takes a close look at what Michael is doing and asks: “And what’s all this? It’s a kite, is it?”\textsuperscript{44} She praises the kites and notices some of the designs that are painted on them: “And what are these designs?”\textsuperscript{45} As indicated in the stage directions, the audience is not aware of what these designs look like – they are visible only to Michael and his aunt who exclaims:

\begin{quote}
(\textit{pretending horror}) Oh, good Lord, they put the heart across me! You did those? Oh, God bless us, those are scarifying? What are they? Devils? Ghosts? I wouldn’t like to see those lads up in the sky looking down at me!\textsuperscript{46}
\end{quote}

The audience or the readers learn that Michael’s visions are grim-looking and may not be appropriate for such a young boy. There is some impending doom that lingers behind those kites, as the peace of the family will collapse in the end – Father Jack is going to die, Chris will stay unmarried, Kate will lose her job at the local school, while Rose and Agnes are going to leave their home forever.

The visages on Michael’s kites are finally revealed only at the end of the play: “One kite, facing boldly out front, stands between Gerry and Agnes; the other between Agnes and Jack”\textsuperscript{47}. This is the ultimate visualisation on Michael’s part – it communicates that the gloomy future that troubled his mind and the minds of others (the collapse of the family and depressing scenarios) took place in all actuality. As McMullan observes:

\begin{quote}
[\textit{a}t the end of the play the child Michael finally finds his voice, or rather his vision. The kites that he has been making are his response to the summer’s events, which he has transformed into representation, but of a conscious, »cruel« kind\textsuperscript{48}.
\end{quote}

We can see that the visual communication between the characters is now manifested at the end of the play in the form of initial incarnation of Michael’s kites – it is his own way of communicating the events in the play to the readers/audience.

To sum up, Dancing at Lughnasa is rich in acts of looking performed by many characters, which help them communicate, interact with each other, or sometimes

\textsuperscript{44} B. Friel, op. cit., p. 18.
\textsuperscript{45} Ibidem.
\textsuperscript{46} Ibidem.
\textsuperscript{47} Ibidem, p. 106.
\textsuperscript{48} A. McMullan, op. cit., p. 97.
exert influence on others. The play is full of references to vision, sight and acts of looking that many characters seem to either exercise or be subjected to. Michael’s kites are closely connected with memories and mental visualisation. The characters watch one another, Michael stares at his aunts and is a witness of their private rebellion. Moreover, the fact that men look at women, and that sometimes even women look as if they were men with such a powerful insight is developed by the use of Laura Mulvey’s theory of the male gaze. Michael scrutinizes his aunts as the narrator, but his father also watches Michael’s mother and her sister, Agnes, with interest.

The proposed analysis shows that the characters’ gazes are a source of knowledge about the other characters in the play, their emotions, fears and behaviour. They can also serve as a tool to manipulate others, deceive them or interact and communicate with each other. The presentation of many visual interactions emphasises the role of looking in the play and creates an opportunity for the readers/viewers to ponder over the meaning of sight in drama. In Friel’s play looking is either a form of control and patriarchal domination – as in the case of male gaze – or it emphasises the role of memories – as in the case of Michael who watches his relatives in retrospect and then describes the meaning of their contacts. All the visual interactions unveil the social relations. They also hint at the fact that looking is always a form of subjective interpretation involving control on the part of the viewer. Gaze and stare are never neutral and they influence the person being watched. Robbins is right to suggest that: “this play represents an inspirational effort to go ‘beyond language’ in O’Toole’s words”⁴⁹. Dancing at Lughnasa certainly succeeds in this respect, for it presents a plenitude of looking relations between the characters – relations which serve as a means of non-verbal communication and interaction between them.

BIBLIOGRAPHY


**SUMMARY**

Brian Friel’s play *Dancing at Lughnasa* depicts various looking relations between its characters. These looks, stares, or gazes help them interact with each other. This is conspicuous, for example, in the case of narrator – Michael – and his aunts. Analysed in reference to such cultural concepts as baroque staring or theory of the male gaze coined by Laura Mulvey, the act of looking at another person proves to be a form of communication between the characters, which is one of the key elements in Friel’s play.
The following article is an attempt to analyse the process of de-assimilation\(^1\). The analysis will be conducted on the basis of a literary personage presented in Hanif Kureishi’s\(^2\) novel "The Buddha of Suburbia. The main character’s process of forming one’s identity may be regarded as an unseen example of a reversal from the mentality of a fully assimilated individual to that of a second-generation immigrant. In order to understand this occurrence, I will apply Paul Ricœur’s hermeneutic approach which shall allow me to interpret the psychological alternations resulting from the individual’s relation with the surroundings.

Depending on how accurately assimilation is analysed, it may be subdivided into various stages which frequently overlap with one another or, as Robert E. Parks believes, may create a race relation cycle\(^3\). Most sociologists consent that acculturation (sometimes also called accommodation) is the first phase of adjustment and “may take place even when none of the other types of assimilation occurs simultaneously.

\(^1\) A term developed by the author of the article.
\(^2\) Hanif Kureishi is an English-Pakistani writer, playwright and director. He published his debut novel "The Buddha of Suburbia" in 1990. In his works he touches upon the subject of race, nationalism, immigration, and sexuality.
\(^3\) R. E. Park quoted in M. Gordon, *Assimilation in American Life*, New York 1964, p. 64. The race relation cycle is a sociological theory of adaptation developed by Robert E. Parks, according to which accommodation is a process based on four constantly reoccurring phases, namely contact, competition, accommodation, and assimilation. Contact is the initial phase in which representatives of diverse cultures meet face-to-face, hence establishing conflictual relationships. During the second stage both individuals and groups compete to satisfy their needs in order to survive among other people. These phases are followed by a rapid accommodation which Parks understood as the stabilisation of relationships between the hosts and minority groups. Eventually, accommodation leads to assimilation or a process of fusion of two distinct cultural segments.
or later”⁴. During this sub-process people attempt to learn each other’s unfamiliar habits and accept their usage in order to peacefully co-exist. However, acculturation occurs only when individuals are prepared to accept alternations.

According to Milton M. Gordon, integration (structural assimilation) is the next phase of assimilation which is characterised by the immigrants’ willingness to become part of specific social groups. During this stage representatives of minority groups first enter informal social structures, for instance clubs, cliques, or friendship groups, and afterwards become part of official institutions as well as organizations of the dominant society⁵.

The following phase of successful assimilation, considered by most sociologists as the final one, is amalgamation which is described as “a biological process, the fusion of races by interbreeding and intermarriage”⁶. It may be stated that it is related to the dismissal of the social stigma of being from an alien community and unconditional acceptance of the minority ethnicity expressed by the hosts by giving their consensus for marriage between people from two different cultural groups.

Nevertheless, it has to be highlighted that assimilation is a sociological process of accommodation, initiated when representatives of two diverse cultural segments residing on the same area “collide” with one another. It depends on the willingness of individual members of the minority group to acquire specific cultural traits. That is to say, assimilation is based upon the relationship between the individual (or the Self) and the dominant ethnicity (the Others) which causes specific alternations in the mentality of the member of the minority group, socially reflected in the degree of assimilating to the wider cultural segment.

Be that as it may, not all processes of assimilation correspond with the presented pattern. In his novel *The Buddha of Suburbia* Hanif Kureishi presents the process of de-assimilation in which an assimilating second-generation Indian immigrant with an English heritage is forced by the British society to acquire an Indian selfhood.

At the very beginning of the novel the narrator introduces himself saying:

> My name is Karim Amir, and I am an Englishman born and bred, almost. I am often considered to be a funny kind of Englishman, a new breed as it were, having emerged from two old histories. But I don’t care – Englishman I am (though not proud of it), from the South London Suburbs and going somewhere⁷.

The quoted fragment features three major points of particular relevance to the analysis of the protagonist. Firstly, despite his dual cultural heritage as well as the general societal viewpoint, Karim perceives himself as an Englishman rather than an Indian immigrant. Secondly, the use of the word *almost* points to the awareness of

---

⁴ M. Gordon, op. cit., p. 77.
⁵ Ibidem.
⁶ R. E. Park quoted in M. Gordon, op. cit., p. 64.
not being fully assimilated. Thus it may be stated that Karim realizes the imperfection of his English image. Finally, the knowledge of the mentioned deficiency pushes the main character into a metaphorical journey, a quest which goal, like in the case of most second-generation immigrants, is to become accepted by the host society.

Ricœur believes that the relation of the world to the flesh, which is understood as the sensible body, is the first phase of forming one's identity. Every person has a distinct personality, a selfhood characterised by a particular Otherness that is supported by the flesh, which is the means of mimicking the observed reality. The body, thus, becomes the primal connecting line with the world that enables the formation of the Self of every individual.

Elahe Haschemi Yekani and Jörg Helbig consent that Karim acts as a typical seventeen-year-old English teenager. The minor dresses, talks and behaves in a similar manner as most young adults in Britain. Nahem Yousaf has noticed that this conduct is a direct result of Karim's upbringing which is connected with the familial structural model constructed by the Amirs. Being residents of suburban London, an area dominated by white English middle-class families, the Amirs created a seemingly stable nuclear family in which Haroon (Karim's father) was the main breadwinner and his wife Margaret was a working housewife. Helbig agrees with Wolfgang Reidel that "Karim knows »next to nothing about India« and he is notoriously unconcerned about his ethnic background." Unlike most first-generation immigrants, Karim's father willingly rebuffed his Indian identity while attempting to become entirely assimilated. In order to achieve his aim, the man acquired all of the cultural traits of the English people, moulding an image of a civil service worker. Consequently, Karim was reared in a typical English family in which the Indian traditions were entirely replaced by the British customs.

Apparently, the lack of motivation or possibilities to learn about the India that his father migrated from caused Karim to automatically acquire an English lifestyle. Therefore, the protagonist created in his mind the vision of being purely English. This, in turn, contributes to the understanding of his behaviour. The teenager is not at all drawn to neither the popular during the 1970s Indian fast food nor the fashionable Buddhist philosophy with which many were enchanted. Instead Karim drank various kinds of spicy tea that kept him awake while listening to music, including "the most British of British pop bands, the Beatles." What is more, the young man engaged himself in the usual British pastimes such as cycling around the

---

11 J. Helbig, op. cit., p. 77.
12 Ibidem.
Izabela Bierowiec, *An English outsider in England – the struggles…*

neighborhood, watching TV long into the night and spending time with his friends. While deciding on his future career, the protagonist took into consideration his own well-being and could only envision the most typical vocations in England of being a famous guitarist, footballer, or Custom Officer.

On the physical level of integration, a significant role is placed upon the language of the main character. Ricœur perceives speech as well as behavioural patterns as belonging to the realm of the flesh which are used to mimic the admired Other\(^\text{13}\). Undeniably, Karim speaks only English, it is his first language, the primarily acquired mother tongue. In his article John Mullan observes that “Karim has as extended a vocabulary as any of the would-be bohemians or theatre-folk he meets”\(^\text{14}\). It is evident that the novel is strewn with numerous instances of foul language, applied in dialogues as well as the narration. Karim mostly uses informal grammatical structures which confer a shallow impression on the presented statements. However, the common manner of expressing one’s thoughts is combined with a certain type of literary mannerism. Thus, elaborate literary inclinations are perceivable in the young Amir’s narratives. Presumably, Karim, as a knowledgeable person familiar with numerous English writers, has a much better developed lexis than he is prone to admit to the readers. Nonetheless, whenever his speculations seem to attain a certain depth of meaning, the effect is immediately relinquished by the use of colloquial terms as “or something”, “or anything”, or ending with improper expressions usually heard among the English youth.

The language used by the narrating hero constitutes a certain parallelism with his behaviour. The mentioned manner of speaking is a reflection of his attempt to accommodate to the surroundings. The presented method of formulating one’s viewpoints is a specific evidence of the concealment of Karim’s true nature in favour of the commonly accepted way of speaking. The young man strives to become similar to the dominant society by imitating one of the fundamental cultural traits – language. It is through speech that Karim wants to highlight his English heritage during his performance as Mowgli:

I sent up the accent and made the audience laugh by suddenly relapsing into cockney at odd times. ‘Leave it out Bagheera,’ I’d say. I liked being recognized in the pub afterwards, and made myself conspicuous in case anyone wanted my autograph\(^\text{15}\).

The described situation may be viewed as a specific type of sign; Karim’s sudden language shift expresses his desire to be recognised not only as an actor but also as an Englishman rather than an Indian immigrant.

\(^{13}\) P. Ricœur, op. cit., p. 329.


\(^{15}\) H. Kureishi, op. cit., p. 158.
Generally, Karim is a bored teenager whose attitude towards other people is that of disrespect and mockery. The young man does not have any noble values or aims in life. Apart from attaining a particular place in society, Karim lacks any type of ambition. The hero avoids being involved both in conflicts or problematic issues which he rather was not aware of. His existence may be compared to a floating leaf that is directed by the unpredictable current of the stream of life, an approach most often developed by the youth of the 1970s. It may be, thus, stated that Karim has acquired not only the cultural traits of the host society but also the mindset prevalent among the British youth, hence feeling “like an average »English bloke«.”

Therefore, it is not surprising that Karim finds himself misunderstood by the surroundings that relate to the minor on the basis of his external features. Little is known about the outward appearance of Kureishi’s main character. It is certain, however, that Karim at least partially resembles Haroon. Throughout the novel Jamila, the protagonist’s childhood friend, refers to Karim as ‘Creamy’. The sobriquet indicates that the young man’s skin colour was neither white nor black but rather white with a specific yellow tone. Karim himself believes that he is ‘beige’, a hue obtained by combining pale brownish or yellowish colours. Needless to say, the cast of the teenager’s skin differed from the British whiteness, thus visibly marking the racial hybridity of the second-generation immigrant and as Bromley believes, locating him between two ethnicities. As a result, the society denies young Amir his own Englishness, the reason being that his body bears a certain tangible Otherness when compared with the British citizens. According to Ricœur’s theory, this division marks the next phase of the relation to the foreign which ideally should be based on equality between the Self and the Other.

Nevertheless, a distortion may be observed in Karim’s relation to the surrounding society. On the basis of the skin colour, the minor is being grouped together with representatives of different cultural segments:

The thing was, we were supposed to be English, but to the English we were always wogs and nigs and Pakis and the rest of it.

It is evident that due to his skin colour, Karim has become a victim of racial prejudice which prevails even at schools where the teachers’ improper conduct creates tensions among the mixed-race students. Such situations frequently result in the

---

16 The 1970s was a period of cultural changes which greatly influenced the young generation all around the world. Punks, bikers, hippies, skaters, dirt bags were only the few most popular subcultures developed at that time. What is most significant, is that every of the mentioned subcultures was set on providing the youth with various means of expressing or even attaining freedom without compromising to the general societal rules but rather living their lives day by day.


19 P. Ricœur, op. cit., p. 329.

20 H. Kureishi, op. cit., p. 53.
use of violence as well as verbal abuse that the protagonist experiences through his life. The society regards Karim as unequal and unworthy of being a part of it, hence making the young man feel resentment towards his own surroundings.

What is most surprising is that even the representatives of the black population in Britain deny Karim his Englishness by automatically placing him among themselves, whilst not only rejecting his British identity but also Indian cultural heritage. Such a situation is most vividly depicted when Tracey, Karim’s black co-worker, criticises his portrayal of the Indian behaviour:

‘Your picture is what white people already think of us. That we’re funny, with strange habits and weird customs. To the white man we’re already people without humanity, and then you go and have Anwar madly waving his stick at the white boys. I can’t believe that anything like this could happen. You show us as unorganized aggressors. Why do you hate yourself and all black people so much, Karim?’ (…) ‘We have to protect our culture at this time, Karim. Don’t you agree?’ ‘No. Truth has a higher value.’ ‘Pah. Truth? Who defines it? What truth? It’s white truth you’re defending here. It’s white truth we’re discussing’

The presented situation points to two major facts: Karim is being regarded as belonging to the black cultural segment of the English society by both the white and the black. Due to her position as a representative of the minority group, Tracey feels justified to refer to Karim as a person of the same ethnicity, simultaneously disregarding his Indian roots and denying his English identity. Furthermore, the woman forces Karim to modify his standpoint, to perceive the world with the immigrants’ eyes and not the way of his English Self that he strongly identifies with. It is as if Karim undergoes a specific categorisation on the part of both the white as well as the black members of the English society which despite numerous contradictions seem to concede with the race divisions.

Yekani highlights that in certain situations Karim’s exotic Otherness could be regarded as an advantage. The minor debuts as an actor by performing Mowgli in The Jungle Book due to the position acquired by his own body. The inexperienced man’s only attitude was his Indian origin, reflected in his outwards appearance:

‘You’re just right for him’, he [Shadwell] continued. ‘In fact, you are Mowgli. You’re dark skinned, you’re small and wiry, and you’ll be sweet but wholesome in the costume.

What made Karim the ideal Mowgli was not his talent but rather authenticity which to Shadwell equaled the teenager’s body. Subsequently, Yekani points to the fact that Karim’s own Indianess is not authentic enough. It is the body of a young

---

23 Ibidem, pp. 142–143.
Indian adult which enables Kureishi’s protagonist to become accepted into the troop. However, in order to personate the “real Mowgli”, Karim is obliged to further adjust both his image and manner of speech. The English-speaking minor is forced to acquire a distinct accent characteristic for the representative of an Indian diaspora. At this moment Karim realises that the society not only rejects his English roots, but also forces him to become Indian. Therefore, the inexperienced actor invents his own Indianess. Sabrina Brancato has observed that this newly-developed cultural background is by no means an actual reflection of the customary Indian behaviour. This artificial identity is simply a compromising vision of the society’s expectations, it is not the hero’s self, but a mask created in order to perform a different role on stage. This untrue selfhood is Karim’s futile attempt to make himself marketable to the audience. The dominant cultural group accepts the protagonist as an immigrant as long as he conforms to the norms governing its racial hierarchy.

Brancato and Yekani state that according to Karim, the only means by which the youth may prove his equality as well as strive to gain his own identity is by engaging into relationships with both white men and women.

Barry Langfort is of the opinion that

(…) although Karim has numerous different sexual partners in the course of the novel, his two most important relationships are those with Charlie and with Eleanor.

Both Charlie and Eleanor are treated by the minor as objects of desire, for their acceptance equals general acknowledgment. Charlie is a figure with whom Karim does not engage in an actual physical relationship but rather admires from afar, envies the way in which he “fixes upon himself the gaze of others.” Karim wanted to obtain that charisma as it would allow him to be viewed by the society as an equal. However, Charlie refuses to come in close contact with his peer. This situation may be interpreted as the refusal of the white men, hence the English society, to accept the protagonist within its ranges. It is also worth mentioning that ultimately Karim loses his admiration for Charlie when he realises that Charlie himself is by no means fully integrated with his surroundings but rather seeks a return to his suburban roots.

Similarly to Karim’s relationship with Charlie, the minor’s first adult affair with a colleague from Pyke’s troop is based on his desire to be recognised. Although the relation with Eleanor seems to possess a deep emotional accent, it is treated by the young man as a means of attaining acceptance by using the vulnerability observed in

28 Ibidem.
Izabela Bierowiec, *An English outsider in England – the struggles…*

the woman. Karim is aware that Eleanor is gentle and helpful to people, therefore he is drawn to this delicate countenance which allows him to engage in a liaison with the white woman. The budding actor perceives his fruitful affair with the representative of the upper-classes as a confirmation of his own Englishness. It is a peculiar type of informal amalgamation that results with Karim briefly achieving general acceptance. However, the price he pays for this fleeting moment of victory is greater humiliation followed by the realisation that the British will not accept him as equal.

Until this point the relationship between Karim and that of the Others was not founded on the Golden Rule of loving your neighbor as yourself advocated by Ricœur. Despite the fact that Karim struggles to maintain contact with the society by exhibiting his Englishness, the surroundings consistently locate the young man among the black ethnic group. Constantly humiliated and disregarded, the protagonist develops a resentment towards the white majority who shames the Indian seen in Karim’s external image. This mutual dislike inhibits Karim’s search for justice and pushes him to develop a false Indian identity based on the existing suppositions.

Nevertheless, Karim’s improper conduct does not remain unnoticed. The protagonist’s steps are being constantly scrutinised by his childhood friend Jamila who together with Changez plays an important part in the young man’s process of assimilation. As the person closest to Karim, Jamila becomes his “confidante, friend, lover and counselor”. So great is the Indian woman’s influence that Karim perceives her as his own visible voice of conscience that supports his development in search for acceptance, which from Ricœur’s perspective may be identified with the desired *good life*. Karim exhibits a strong fondness towards Jamila whom he admires as no other encountered figure. The childhood friend objectively summarises Karim’s actions and points out his imperfections. It is through Jamila’s outburst of revulsion and anger that the protagonist realises the pretentious nature of his false Indian identity:

’And it was disgusting, the accent and the thing you have smeared over you. You were just pondering to prejudices – ‘

’Jammie – ‘

’And clichés about Indians. And the accent – my God, how could you do it? I expect you’re ashamed, aren’t you?’

’I am, actually’. 

Presumably, this situation caused Karim’s subsequent attempt to include in his further personifications only the observable truth rather than to comply with the deeply rooted assumptions. Whenever Karim behaves in an improper or egoistic

---

manner, Jamila is the one to inform him about this fact and she forces the minor to alter his conduct by considering the other’s feelings.

Apparently, Jamila’s character is the one who decides to struggle for recognition as the hybrid Self, hence opening up the Indian society to cultural and social changes. Needless to say, it is Jamila who presents to Karim the reality that the first-generation immigrants as well as their children live alongside the British. She is the young hero’s anchor to their shared Indian heritage, the voice of the culture that is unknown to Karim but which duns for him from beyond his selfhood. By maintaining contact with Jamila, Karim is exposed to the Indian diaspora both physically and mentally, until, as Radek Glabazňa\(^{33}\) has noticed, it dawns on him that he is partially Indian and that by avoiding his Indian brethren, he deprives himself of a significant Selfhood, thus forging an incomplete identity. It is at this particular moment that Karim gradually begins to accept his Asian roots. It may be thus stated that Jamila is the voice of to the main character’s Indian ethnicity or what Ricœur termed as the voice that calls for justice on the level of institutions\(^{34}\).

Similarly to Jamila, Changez also plays a major role in the formation of Karim’s identity. It is a personage who may invoke unwanted feelings of guilt and shame in the protagonist. Jamila’s Indian husband is the authentic, yet comic representative of the Asian minority and is frequently belittled by Karim on numerous occasions. The young adult is prone to commit immoral acts towards Changez without any consideration of his feelings, for instance being intimate with his wife or employing the naïve man’s image into his role. However, every time afterwards Karim unexpectedly encounters Changez face-to-face. It is during these encounters that Karim registers Changez’s vulnerability which is the Otherness of the Indian immigrant, the pure Indianess mostly unaffected by the Western culture. Every encounter evokes in the hero emotions that most often result in him attempting to flee or conceal his presence so that Changez would not look at him, would not force him to re-think his behaviour. These futile attempts to avoid the anguishing sensibilities of embarrassment enable Karim to decide between what is good and what is bad, thus aiding the gradual forging of his own system of values.

On the other hand, Michael L. Ross believes that the significance of this relationship lies in the fact that only through his mocking acts towards Changez and the invention of a role based on this personage does the protagonist realise “the common qualities linking him to his peculiar friend from overseas”\(^{35}\). During the preparation to develop the role based on Changez’s character, Karim was advised to merge part of his Self with that of the model, subsequently revealing a specific connection with his Indian heritage that awakens within him. It may be, thus, inferred that Changez is the Other that seeks solicitude in a face-to-face encounter, it is the third party in


\(^{34}\) P. Ricœur, op. cit., pp. 254–257.

\(^{35}\) M. L. Ross, \textit{Race Riots: Comedy and Ethnicity in Modern British Fiction}, Canada 2006.
a circle of relations that calls to Karim’s conscience and persuades him to accept the Indian Self that exists beyond him. Karim acquires a new, altered mindset in which he feels both English and Indian. Therefore the young man is able to free himself from the constant desire to search for means of recognition (seen when he is finally released from Charlie’s charismatic influence) and begins to understand the importance of his dual cultural heritage in situating himself in the British society (viewed when he willingly accepts the role of an Indian taxi driver in a soap opera).

In conclusion, the presented interpretation of Karim Amir’s relation to the Other suggests that Kureishi’s protagonist has undergone a process of reverse assimilation. However, it has to be pointed out that this process of accustoming to a distinct cultural group is by no means that of simply acquiring visible cultural traits. From the very beginning of the novel Karim thought of himself as an Englishman. Surprisingly, the stereotypes existing within the British society of the 1970s enforced a specific modification relating to his cultural identity. According to the universal schema, assimilation is a procedure that results in the individual belonging to a minority ethnicity, and who does not consider himself to be a member of the dominant ethnic group, acquiring the traits of the dominant cultural segment. Nevertheless, in Karim’s case the majority of the English society did not recognise the young man as an assimilationist, thus denying his Englishness while imposing upon him the stereotypical assumptions connected with Indians. Consequently, Karim had to not so much alter his behavioural patterns as his mentality. From an entirely assimilated individual, Karim Amir has reversed to a typical second-generation immigrant, a person remaining under the subsequent influence of two diverse cultures: of the dominant cultural segment and the Indian minority group. He becomes a hybrid being that seeks acknowledgement from the hosts but is also aware of his prevailing difference which result in Karim feeling neither fully Indian nor English.

36 In the 1970s the British society exerted a visible hostility towards the immigrants from the ex-colonies as they believed them to be inferior to the white, civilised man. Members of other nations in the UK were isolated, mistreated and their cultures were frequently considered to a degree as intolerant or even threatening. However, it is worth pointing out that despite the presence of various cultures, all migrants were labeled as ‘Black’ and described in the same manner.

37 By applying the term ’universal schema’, the author of the article refers to the frequently occurring conviction that assimilation compromises various stages. These stages have been briefly described at the beginning of the article.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


ONLINE SOURCES


SUMMARY

First published in 1990, Kureishi’s The Buddha of Suburbia presents the processes of acculturation as well as assimilation from a slightly different perspective that may be found in similar British-Asian novels. The aim of this paper is to conduct a detailed analysis of the mentioned process of accommodation observed in the personage of Karim Amir, the protagonist of Kureishi’s debut novel, who undergoes the process of de-assimilation. Despite being of half-English descent as well as acquiring an outside appearance and conduct typical for a 1970s British youth, Karim is constantly denied the status of an English citizen. Although Amir thinks of himself as belonging
to the London suburban youth, he is expected to behave in the same way as all Indian immigrants who compromise the segment of the Black population in the United Kingdom. As a result, the young man is confronted with numerous stereotypical expectations concerning his seemingly Indian heritage and cultural identity, particularly the language he speaks, customs, lifestyle or even beliefs. Consequently, Karim, the unacknowledged English figure, strives to become accustomed to the life of an alien which inseparably is connected with the processes of assimilation and acculturation, however experienced backwards.
Ewelina Twardoch

FACES OF THE CULTURAL CONFLICT AND “BARBARISM” IN J. M. COETZEE’S “WAITING FOR THE BARBARIANS”

Institute of Audiovisual Arts, Jagiellonian University

INTRODUCTION

Due to his African descent and upbringing in Afrikaner culture, John Maxwell Coetzee is usually categorized by critics as a writer preoccupied mostly with the problems of his country and continent. Although Africa is present in the writer’s works, reducing their meaning to coming to terms with the apartheid policy and contemporary political turbulences in Africa makes them superficial, blurring the universal message arising from the writer’s reflections. It is rightly emphasized by Jerzy Koch, one of the most conscientious and interesting commenters of Coetzee’s works. Problems of the African continent have been presented by Coetzee in a metaphorical, allegorical but also nuanced way, being a thorough analysis supplied with philosophical, historiosophical and existential commentaries, often understandable only to people who know much about the history of Africa and its political and cultural conditions. It does not change the fact that the stories created by the author always have some metatextual and parabolic dimensions thanks to which we can interpret them in a broader intertextual, anthropological and philosophical contexts. What is more, J. M. Coetzee is generally considered as a writer who does not designate the boundaries of morality or gives clear answers to ethical questions, but rather multiplies doubts and shows morally complicated situations. For this reason, he is sometimes accused of ethical relativism.

1 In order to learn more about the biography of the author, see e.g.: A. Sak, J. M. Coetzee – mapa twórczości, “Znak” 2007, No. 12, pp. 14–15.
The scope of the problems addressed by Coetzee is very broad: it encompasses the most intimate problems of man, such as his or her reflections (but also physiology), as well as historical, political and cultural processes governing the lives of human beings who try to oppose them in a heroic and, usually, unsuccessful way. In Coetzee’s works such self-referential motifs as reflections on the role of language, the status of the writer trying to capture a feature of reality which keeps on escaping, or the morality of writer’s actions recur as well. It is thus difficult to limit reflections on the author’s writings to one motif or category because they are complementary and closely connected to each other.

In spite of this, in this very outline I would like to focus on the analysis of the category of “barbarism” in a broader context of the problem of the cultural and civilizational conflict which is present in Coetzee’s prose under various forms. It is an interesting issue because, as Maria Boletsi notices,

Barbarism and civilization are opposed and interdependent concepts. In this opposition, the notion of the barbarian operates as the constitutive outside of civilization and feeds the superiority of the civilized.

The subject of my analysis is J.M. Coetzee’s novel Waiting for the Barbarians.

FRONTIER CONFLICT AS A FIGHT FOR POWER AND IDENTITY

The main topic of the novel are the preparations of the authorities of an unspecified Empire for a war with brutal “barbarians” who are going to invade the surrounding countries, including the Empire. The events are presented from the viewpoint of the administrator of one of the districts who summarizes the history of his reign in the Empire in the following way:

I did not mean to get embroiled in this. I am a country magistrate, a responsible official in the service of the Empire, serving out my days on this lazy frontier [my emphasis – E.T.], waiting to retire. I collect the tithes and taxes, administer the communal lands, see that the garrison is provided for, supervise the junior officers who are the only officers we have here, keep an eye on trade, preside over the law-court twice a week.

The judge’s (not called any specific name) role is, therefore, reduced to a peaceful administration over the fate of a quiet place which is somehow isolated from history. It does not have any features of “hegemony” described by A. Gramsci as a relationship
between the ruling class and the rest of the society\textsuperscript{10}. The judge says elsewhere that he has never had to deal with any serious crimes in his district because it is inhabited mostly by farmers, breeders and tradespeople whose relationship with the tribespeople inhabiting the terrains outside the borders of the Empire is based on the exchange of goods. Therefore, an information about the dangerous “barbarians” preparing to invade the Empire deeply confuses him. The complete incomprehensibility of the power apparatus, a member of which the protagonist has been so far, deepens more and more when Colonel Joll, new chief of the power apparatus of the Empire who is trying to nip the alleged invasions in the bud, brings “barbarian” prisoners into the district. It appears that the “enemies of the Empire” are the nomads, mostly interested in peaceful life and afraid of other people, who are forced to confess to their affiliation with the imaginary armed invasion of the “barbarians”. The information about the attacks from “wild people” spreads panic among the locals. It results in aggression and scorn toward people belonging to different groups. In this way, the illusionary project of the conflict between the tribes which has actually not occurred becomes a fact. Samuel Phillips Huntington states that:

> The clash of civilizations thus occurs at two levels. At the microlevel, adjacent groups along the fault lines between civilizations struggle, often violently, over the control of territory and each other\textsuperscript{11}.

This pattern is partially implemented by Coetzee in his novel. Critics frequently simplify the aforementioned issues recognizing them for the settlement of the writer of colonialism\textsuperscript{12}, but in my opinion it is not such an obvious diagnosis. What is more, colonialism, being one of the most important contemporary phenomena, is described from so many perspectives (e.g. feminist in the context of postcolonialism and postmodernism\textsuperscript{13}), that it is really hard to say what it exactly means. Colonialism, or nowadays rather neocolonialism\textsuperscript{14}, also became a key term which covers complex relations between power, domination and culture. This interpretation is especially visible among African studies. As Rita Abrahamsen pointed out, “the field of postcolonial studies, such perspectives occupy at best a marginal position in explanations and investigations of contemporary African politics and society”\textsuperscript{15}. And, as Abrahamsen says further, postcolonialism is too textual and too discursive to become a primary study on this continent\textsuperscript{16}. Therefore, I prefer to consider cultural conflict


\textsuperscript{12} C. Barnett, op cit., pp. 298–300.


\textsuperscript{14} Ibidem, pp. 8–9.


\textsuperscript{16} Ibidem, p. 190.
and “barbarism” in Waiting for Barbarians in a broader, philosophical and anthropological perspective.

How does the relation of power and domination look in Coetzee’s novel? The native people, living in their own cultural circle, peaceable toward the “newcomers” (it is emphasized that to the autochthones the residents of the Empire are colonists of the virgin territories, pushing their native inhabitants to the edges of the area), are suddenly attacked by the Empire and separated from their customs. Therefore it is not a mutual conflict, although the authorities of the Empire want to see the violation of cultural diversity in this way, and this is how they present it in their reports for the civilians. In the novel there is no direct information what the aim of the seizure of the frontier people’s culture is. Following Huntington, one may suppose that it is driven by the willingness to control the people and their territory, which, in practice, is reduced to ethnic cleansing, preceded by a massacre of the oppressed. The preventive actions taken by Colonel Joll look exactly as Huntington wrote – as a result, dozens of defenseless tribespeople are tortured and murdered by the military apparatus of the Empire. According to Edward Peters: “Paradoxically, in an age of vast state strength, ability to mobilize resources, and possession of virtually infinite means of coercion, much of state policy has been based upon the concept of extreme state vulnerability to enemies, external or internal.” This ambiguous position of the Empire, correctly described by the theoretician, causes such defensive actions toward the outsiders.

Huntington also says that during a larger conflict countries often try to gather peoples belonging to other civilizations on their territories due to security reasons. This observation describes how Colonel Joll justified his behavior toward the first nations. It causes the judge’s objection and indignation. The judge knows (he has been working in the district for about 20 years) that the Third Bureau does not intend to defend the Empire. It has not been attacked, after all, and each day the man collects more and more evidence that the alleged attacks by the “barbarians” on the houses, fields and breeding farms of the residents of the Empire are faked by the power apparatus. The Third Bureau, then, aims at seizing the cultural and physical power over the frontier areas. Huntington understands power in the following way:

\[P\]ower is the ability of one person or group to change the behavior of another person or group. Behavior may be changed through inducement, coercion, or exhortation, which require the power-wielder to have economic, military, institutional, demographic, political, technological, social, or other resources.

18 S. P. Huntington, op. cit., p. 386.
20 S. P. Huntington, op. cit., p. 243.
21 Ibidem, p. 83.
This way of understanding the power that the “government” (it is difficult to say what its structure is and how it functions as the novel provides no details) wishes to obtain is, from its perspective, obvious and legal. The judge says: “We think of the country here as ours, part of our Empire – our outpost, our settlement, our market centre”\(^{22}\), and recalls the history of great empires’ colonization of various areas inhabited by tribespeople. The actions taken by the authorities of the Empire undoubtedly show features of imperialistic policies, and postcolonial motifs are frequently recalled by critics discussing Coetzee’s works\(^{23}\). Imperialism is, as Edward Said wrote, “the practice, the theory, and the attitudes of a dominating metropolitan center ruling a distant territory”\(^{24}\) which leads to colonial activity. I believe that in the context of the quoted definition and the history of Africa, the “frontier conflict” presented by Coetzee may be perceived as a part of imperialistic actions which represents them in a *pars pro toto* manner. I would like to also show that Coetzee complicates the relationship between the natives and the residents of the Empire in other aspects. These two communities are not that different from one another. They trade with each other, and their cultural diversity is not a problem for them. It does not cause conflicts until they are created by the Empire. Then it quickly occurs that diverse languages, customs, clothing, gestures and appearances arouse fear and contempt in the settlers. In spite of the fact that the whole conflict is imaginary, to both the Empire and the nomads the situation appears to be a fight to preserve one’s group identity. This also confirms Huntington’s notion that frontier conflicts do not have a broader political or ideological basis but are particularistic in nature\(^ {25}\). Barbara Eckstein says that “in the context of Coetzee’s novel and in South Africa, both crucibles of colonial ideologies, no such dignity, identity, or equality is granted indigenous peoples as objects of torture”\(^ {26}\) – and it is true, because in this fight for national identity, personal existence is replaced by the position of an object. Tortures and mutilations are efficient tools for this.

It is the relationship between the communities through which Coetzee seems to present the essence of the conflict. The attitude of people ruling the “others,” the “foreigners,” the “barbarians,” is the most important problem in the novel. Interestingly, the author presents it on two levels: the behavior of one group toward the other, and the relationship between a man and a woman, that is between the judge and the “barbarian girl” mutilated by the authorities of the Empire.

\(^{22}\) J. M. Coetzee, op. cit., p. 70.
\(^{25}\) S. P. Huntington, op. cit., p. 252.
A “BARBARIAN” AS “THE OTHER”

When the “barbarians” enter the city/country for the first time, they are an “object of observation” to the locals. The panic has not spread among the residents yet, and thus they do not feel endangered upon seeing a harmless group. The natives, as the surprised judge notices, quickly adapt themselves to the conditions in which they are because they are fed and left unharmed – yet. However, they disturb the normal functioning of the center of the country. The natives, unaccustomed to such things as sewerage system, bring their own habits, polluting the courtyards with various waste and feces and walking all day from place to place without any purpose. “Then, all together, we lose sympathy with them. The filth, the smell, the noise of their quarrelling and coughing become too much,” says the judge. According to Maria Boletsi:

The barbarian threat to civilization is always there in “scarcely visible», «obscure people. The more invisible and obscure they are, the more they tantalize the civilized imagination. Their invisibility fosters the myth around them and enhances its threatening force.

Boletsi aptly points out the reason of the situation of the “barbarians” in the Empire. The attitude of the locals toward the autochthones evolves toward greater aggression and scorn. The initial friendly approach (feeding, providing old clothes) is replaced with a wish for revenge, venting the fear encouraged by Joll’s subordinates on the “barbarians”. The behavior of the society shows an interesting pattern: it looks for a scapegoat, and at the same time personifies the fear that could not find its object before. One may interpret the change in the attitude of the residents of the Empire toward the autochthones as an attempt at protection of their own identity and the laws which govern the reality that they know. I will try to develop this interpretation in the following paragraphs.

When Joll’s division brings more “barbarians” to the city and accuses them of more and more serious crimes, the locals demand punishment of the prisoners who represent the “barbarians,” staying outside their own territory, at the mercy of un-known people.

The barbarians come out at night. Before darkness falls the last goat must be brought in, the gates barred, a watch set in every lookout to call the hours. All night, it is said, the barbarians prowl about bent on murder and rapine. Children in their dreams see the shutters part and fierce barbarian faces leer through. (…) The barbarians have dug a tunnel under the walls, people say; they come and go as they please, take what they like; no one is safe any longer. The farmers still till the fields, but they go out in bands, never singly. They work without heart: the barbarians are only waiting for the crops to be established, they say, before they flood the fields again.

---

27 J. M. Coetzee, op. cit., p. 27.
28 Ibidem, p. 28.
29 M. Boletsi, op. cit., p. 67.
30 J. M. Coetzee, op. cit., p. 163.
This lengthy quotation presents the mechanism of how the imaginary danger works. As history has shown, the paradox of the conflict consists in the fact that it is not the invaders who destroy western empires, but the fear of them. It is the mere state of danger that paralyzes the people’s activity and, as a result of the imprisonment of the autochthones, leads to a trade crisis. As Paul Rich pointed out, “Coetzee’s novel thus reflects the tradition of cultured defensiveness of Western civilization against external invasion and fails to offset this against any wider historical understanding of empires and their rise and fall”\textsuperscript{31}. The economic impasse worsening the situation in which the locals are causes a greater need to punish the culprit. The punishment serves also as a cleansing ritual. This ritualistic character will be found in public whippings and sophisticated tortures, the victims of which will be not only the “barbarians” but, finally, the judge himself, suspected of treason against the Empire. Of course, the rule that “the joy arising from the possibility of punishing the culprit is much more important than the pain suffered by the victim”\textsuperscript{32} [my translation – E.T.] works here. Meanwhile, the armed escapades against the alleged invaders became more aggressive and ceased to resemble defensive actions. The judge states:

These men have not been to war: at worst they have been roaming the up-river country, hunting down unarmed sheep-herders, raping their women, pillaging their homes, scattering their flocks; at best they have met no one at all – certainly not the gathered barbarian clans from whose fury the Third Bureau is engaged in protecting us\textsuperscript{33}.

The imaginary defense against the enemy resembles a fight against diversity, as well as against physiological, cultural and behavioral differences. According to Huntington, the basic difference separating nations or communities is usually not political or ideological, but cultural in nature\textsuperscript{34}, and it is natural for humans to divide societies into “us” and “them”, our civilization and the “barbarians” – foreign in a cultural and social way\textsuperscript{35}. People with whom we do not feel communal solidarity are easier to accuse of the failures of our own group, and we also find it easier to focus our frustration on them. However, there is more to it. The autochthones who try to create an equivalent of their own customs in prison are trying to preserve their identity which is based on a long tradition. As one may read in various records of the life in concentration camps, this is one of the most natural behaviors of people remaining in a lockup, far from their own culture. But the residents of the Empire are also trying to protect their communal identity by hurting the “barbarians”.

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{32} B. Chyrowicz, Pies z kulantą nogą się nie obejrzał…, “Znak” 2007, No. 12, p. 59.
\item \textsuperscript{33} J. M. Coetzee, op. cit., p. 122.
\item \textsuperscript{34} S. P. Huntington, op. cit., p. 21.
\item \textsuperscript{35} Ibidem, p. 34.
\end{itemize}
The failure of trade and communications to produce peace or common feeling is consonant with the findings of social science. In social psychology, distinctiveness theory holds that people define themselves by what makes them different from others in a particular context: one perceives oneself in terms of characteristics that distinguish oneself from other humans, especially from people in one’s usual social milieu.\(^{36}\)

Huntington’s words excellently present the relationship between the societies in *Waiting for the Barbarians*. In the face of a danger to the whole civilization of the Empire, the danger which is blurred and amorphous, the Empire tries to destroy things that do not fit in its culture in order to preserve it. Huntington adds that people who are faced with a danger to their civilization tend to appreciate things that are close to them, such as family, blood relations, faith, law or institutions. They distance themselves from diversities.\(^{37}\) It is paradoxical because personal identity can be defined only in relation to the “other – foreign”\(^{38}\). It is probably caused by an increase in the harassment of the otherness in the novel’s conflict and lack of an unambiguous relationship between the Empire and the autochthones. The peculiar fascination with the “barbarians” in relation to which the civilization of the Empire has been formed, is gradually replaced by scorn, always present in perception of the “other”. The judge is aware of this fact:

> It is this contempt for the barbarians, contempt which is shown by the meanest ostler or peasant farmer, that I as magistrate have had to contend with for twenty years. How do you eradicate contempt, especially when that contempt is founded on nothing more substantial than differences in table manners, variations in the structure of the eyelid? Shall I tell you what I sometimes wish? I wish that these barbarians would rise up and teach us a lesson, so that we would learn to respect them.\(^{39}\)

The judge knows that, as Clifford Geertz wrote, “foreignness begins at the skin’s edge.”\(^{40}\) Otherness and foreignness has its roots in different looks (appearance, sex) and ends in the different cultural and social behaviors, which is one of the major problems addressed by Coetzee. What is also quite obvious, the concept of “the Other” is closely associated with the postcolonial discourse.\(^{41}\) As I have mentioned, in the novel it is shown both on the macro-level of the relationships between communities, and on the micro-level of the relationship between a man and a woman.

At the very beginning of his acquaintance with the “barbarian girl” the judge realizes that his approach toward her is peculiar and thus difficult to understand. The first feeling that the woman arouses in him is pity because of her disability which was caused by tortures. Undoubtedly, he feels also some guilt and shame that she

\(^{36}\) Ibidem, p. 67.

\(^{37}\) Ibidem, p. 175.

\(^{38}\) Ibidem, p. 178.

\(^{39}\) J. M. Coetzee, op. cit., pp. 69–70.

\(^{40}\) See: A. Burzyńska, M. P. Markowski, op. cit., p. 528.

was tortured by people just like him, the officials of the Empire. When he takes the woman to his place in order to employ her as a maid, his aim is actually to learn the “truth” about her sufferings. Yet he quickly realizes that this peculiar interrogation is as painful and disparaging as her oppressors’ attempts at forcing her to admit to be one of the “barbarians”. Therefore, the judge decides to desist from his investigation and takes care of the girl as if she was a child or a pet. This comparison is made by the judge himself and is not accidental: he bathes her, rubs oils into and massages her massacred feet. However he is still surprised by the fact that although these activities do give him some pleasure, there is no erotic fascination on his part. With time this ambivalence of feelings becomes a representation of his attitude toward the autochthones in general, and begins to exhaust him. It becomes completely unbearable when the girl gives him clumsy and uncertain signs that she would like to begin an intimate relationship with him. Then the judge moves out of his room and seeks fulfilment and comfort in the arms of a young girl whose “services” he had used before he met the “barbarian girl”. The comparison of the two women allows the protagonist to draw conclusions that he would not have expected earlier:

Smiling with joy, sliding into a languorous half-sleep, it occurs to me that I cannot even recall the other one’s face. ’She is incomplete!’ I say to myself. Though the thought begins to float away at once, I cling to it. I have a vision of her closed eyes and closed face filming over with skin. Blank, like a fist beneath a black wig, the face grows out of the throat and out of the blank body beneath it, without aperture, without entry. I shudder with revulsion.42

And:

The thought of the strange ecstasies I have approached through the medium of her incomplete body fills me with a dry revulsion, as if I had spent nights copulating with a dummy of straw and leather. What could I ever have seen in her?43

These are the most representative thoughts of the judge in which he describes the woman and his relationship with her. It is easy to notice that they do not show only his animosity toward the woman who seems unattractive and unappealing to him. The barrier that the judge cannot break is actually the cultural distance which separates the two. The girl has a different skin color, mutilated eyes and feet and, what is more, she moves, eats and sleeps in a way characteristic to the primitive people, which the judge automatically associates with animals. The lack of a sexual relationship with the woman stems also from the fact that she appears to him as someone inferior, an animal, deprived of soul and feelings. In his other book Coetzee states that for people the difference between a human and an animal consists in, among others, the fact that people do not have sex with animals because this kind of relationship

42 J. M. Coetzee, op. cit., p. 58.
43 Ibidem, p. 64.
is impure. The judge is ashamed of his thoughts because he has suffered for his opposition to torturing the autochthones and treating them as if they were animals. Still, he cannot treat the woman as his equal and their coitus takes place only when he sets off to fetch the woman back to the “barbarians”, that is when he is far from the Empire and aware that she will soon disappear from his life forever.

The judge gradually begins to realize that his attempt at protection of the natives contradicts his attachment to the culture in which he has been brought up and for which he has worked his entire life:

And do I really after all believe what I have been saying? Do I really look forward to the triumph of the barbarian way: intellectual torpor, slovenliness, tolerance of disease and death? If we were to disappear would the barbarians spend their afternoons excavating our ruins? Would they preserve our census rolls and our grain-merchants’ ledgers in glass cases, or devote themselves to deciphering the script of our love-letters? Is my indignation at the course that Empire takes anything more than the peevishness of an old man who does not want the ease of his last years on the frontier to be disturbed?

Through these words Coetzee reveals the paradox present in the whole postcolonial theory: behind the acceptance of the primacy of the colonized tribes/nations, there is always a threat of degradation of one’s own civilization, the risk of reversal of the roles of the oppressors and the oppressed. Theoreticians appear to be blind to the other side of the coin which bases the multicultural conflict and the distance arising from it on a much more complicated mechanism, which is virtually impossible to suppress or eliminate. Culture and civilization are created in opposition to already existing, foreign cultures and civilizations, just as an individual creates his or her identity in opposition to the identity of another person. The frontier conflict depicted by Coetzee exceeds the frames of local fight, gaining the status of a parable of the intercommunal and interpersonal conflict.

Regardless of various meanings of (post)colonialism, it is also worth to quote Abrahamsen who stated that “Hybridity thus draws attention to the way in which the colonizer and the colonized are forged in relationship with each other” and it is because “The white man’s self-perception as moral, rational and civilized required the image of the negro as barbaric and uncivilized, and the notion of hybridity in this way helps to break down the essentialized, binary opposition between the colonized and the colonizer, between black and white, self and other.” What is more, as Homi Bhabha shows – colonized people were victims, but colonizers could not reveal their real stories, so they could not dominate them totally. It means that the

---

46 R. Abrahmsen, op. cit., p. 204.
native people retained their original identity framework – as barbarian girl in her relationship with the judge.

CONCLUSIONS

By revealing the mechanism of how conflicts arising from cultural differences work and by showing the paradox of postcolonial studies (which is forgotten by most Polish critics who classify Coetzee as a postcolonial writer), Coetzee establishes a place for someone like the judge in his novel. The protagonist of *Waiting for the Barbarians* has some features that are typical for characters of Coetzee’s novels. The judge is a person who, in spite of his or her attempts at taking a stand on one of the sides of the conflict and conducting a rational analysis of the phenomena taking place around, cannot find a place for himself or herself in the historical process, a part of which he or she still remains. Here I would like to quote an excerpt from the novel:

I think: ‘I wanted to live outside history. I wanted to live outside the history that Empire imposes on its subjects, even its lost subjects. I never wished it for the barbarians that they should have the history of Empire laid upon them. How can I believe that that is cause for shame?’

(…)

I think: ‘But when the barbarians taste bread, new bread and mulberry jam, bread and gooseberry jam, they will be won over to our ways. They will find that they are unable to live without the skills of men who know how to rear the pacific grains, without the arts of women who know how to use the benign fruits.’

I think: ‘When one day people come scratching around in the ruins, they will be more interested in the relics from the desert than in anything I may leave behind. And rightly so.’

(…)

I think: ‘There has been something staring me in the face, and still I do not see it’49.

History fills the judge with fear because a single person is unable to confront it or escape it. People that examine history in various ways may only focus on the artifacts from which the so-called course of history is formed, even though the essence of the past may be present in a completely different place and thus remain forever undetected and undiscovered. However, the protagonist still hopes that a multicultural dialog or reconciliation which will not result from cruel warfare nor complicated legislation, but from interpersonal understanding, compassion and respect toward works of culture is possible. The judge is aware of certain naivety and impossibility of this idea. But he also knows that any other road will be “a road that may lead nowhere”50, as it will end in escalation of the cruelty and suffering and, as a result, in a new division of power, which will have little to do with actual peace.

---

50 Ibidem, p. 207.
Bibliography


Summary

The aim of the article is to introduce the vision of cultural conflict and the category of “barbarism” in J. M. Coetzee’s novel *Waiting for the Barbarians*. The author analyses these problems mostly in the socio-political context, referring to Huntington’s statements and thesis, but also considering philosophical dimensions of the aforementioned problems. What is more, the author also asks questions about identity, otherness and compassion (Abrahamsen, Eckstein, Post). In the text also appears a reflection on the categories of power, violence, and the meaning of the process of creating civilization and empire – as the political and cultural entities (Barnett, Xie, Boletsi). Therefore, in the article the phenomenon of cultural conflict has many faces and its analysis is treated by the author as an universal diagnosis of the evolution of civilization and barbarism.
On June the 1st 1943 a small village, Sochy, located in Zamość County (Lublin Voivodeship, Poland), was methodically annihilated and its inhabitants, about two hundred people, were brutally slaughtered during the process of the Germanisation of the region. The carnage began early in the morning and continued mercilessly for a “few apocalyptic hours”, until the village was almost completely destroyed. According to the relations and reports left by the survivors of the massacre, only one household remained intact, the other parts of the village were either burned or demolished during the German pacification. Where once was a lively village, only cinders remained. And a small number of survivors (mostly children) were left traumatized, scarred with unforgettable images of genocide lingering for the rest of their lives... or perhaps even longer, as “the war never dies” and its consequences never fade away, states Anna Janko, the daughter of Teresa Ferenc, one of the children who survived the massacre in Sochy. Born twelve years after the war, Janko learned about...
the tragedy in Sochy only through the accounts provided by her family (mostly – her mother), yet the image of the massacre had been returning so strongly and so often in other people’s memories, that she describes her own childhood as growing up “in the shadow of war”7 which “never disappears, not even at the equator at high noon”8.

Trying to analyze the phenomenon of trauma transmission, Marianne Hirsch invented the term “postmemory”, which in her article, entitled, *The Generation of Postmemory*, she explains as “the relationship that the generation after those who witnessed cultural or collective trauma bears to the experiences of those who came before, experiences that they »remember« only by means of the stories, images, and behaviors among which they grew up”9. While this term is primarily used in the historical context of the Holocaust, as Hirsch states herself, postmemory may take various forms and may be extremely relevant in describing numerous other generational trauma transmissions. Such examples can be easily detected in many literary works, however the aim of this article is to analyze the connection between inherited memories and one’s own narrative using Janko’s *Mała Zagłada*10 as an illustration and research material.

What Hirsch adds and what is also very important, is that:

> the descendants of survivors (of victims as well as of perpetrators) of massive traumatic events connect so deeply to the previous generation’s remembrances of the past that they need to call that connection memory and thus that, in certain extreme circumstances, memory can be transmitted to those who were not actually there to live an event.11

This so-called “second” or “next” generation is virtually shaped and defined by the damage that occurred in their parents’ lives and becomes immersed so deeply in the others’ memories of trauma, that, as a consequence, such memories begin to influence their own imagination and narrative:

---

7 Ibidem, p. 86 [own translation].
8 Ibidem. It is worth noting here that the metaphor of shadow Janko uses to explain her relationship with her mother’s memory is connected not only with overwhelming nature of postmemory, but also with its ability to conceal or even efface other experiences or emotions.
10 The title may be literally translated as “little extermination” or “little annihilation” (the word “little” being used here to stress that the survivors of the massacre in Sochy were mostly children), however, the fact that the authoress deliberately begins the word “Zagłada” with capital letter seems to show a direct relation to Holocaust (which is in Polish often called “Zagłada”) and Second World War. The ambiguity of the title may also be connected with Janko’s general opinion about wars and genocide, an issue she addressed e.g. in the interview for “Gazeta Wyborcza”: “Mała Zagłada cannot be finished (…) as wars, the acts of genocide, continue to happen”. D. Wodecka, *Zabiercie Auschwitz do Berlina. Z Anną Janko rozmawia Dorota Wodecka*, “Gazeta Wyborcza” 2015, 31.01.2015–01.02.2015, p. 18 [own translation].
To grow up with such overwhelming inherited memories, to be dominated by narratives that preceded one’s birth or one’s consciousness, is to risk having one’s own stories and experiences displaced, even evacuated, by those of a previous generation. It is to be shaped, however indirectly, by traumatic events that still defy narrative reconstruction and exceed comprehension. These events happened in the past, but their effects continue into the present\(^\text{12}\).

Thus, describing the situation of the second generation – of those who grew up immersed in their parents’ traumatic stories – is often a challenge, as their own emotions are embodied by painful family narratives, they even become displaced, forged or replaced by memories that had not been their own, that they had inherited from their parents and their generation.

The case of Janko is not an exception – the story she delivers in *Mała Zagłada* consists both of images provided by her mother and other family members (her mother’s siblings, also survivors of the massacre) and her own childhood and young adulthood memories, to which she not only returns, but which she also reflects upon. Such narration corresponds well with a great paradox of postmemory: Janko returns to her childhood, but the trauma of the Sochy massacre is not her own, rather it is borrowed from her mother, yet is entrenched so deeply in her own consciousness, that it can almost compete with her personal experiences and memory. Despite the fact that Janko had not witnessed the pacification of the village personally, she intercepts memories from her family and treats them almost like her own. “I took your history from you, mother, your apocalypse. You fed me with it when I was little (…) I have it in my blood”\(^\text{13}\), she explains, addressing her mother, whom she perceives to be the main source of the transmitted memory and trauma.

The mother’s and daughter’s stories intertwine with one another, as Janko purposefully merges two perspectives together, so that the narrator speaks with two voices, one belonging to the actual trauma survivor and the other to a person from the next generation, tainted with postmemory. This interesting mechanism of simultaneous perception is both a common feature of postmemory and a challenge to the reader, who may wonder on whose behalf the authoress speaks – her own, or her mother’s. Henri Raczymow describes this kind of situation as “somewhat paradoxical”\(^\text{14}\), as one is “supposed to speak”\(^\text{15}\) about some traumatic events from the past, yet – not being an actual witness of the very event – essentially “[has] nothing to say”\(^\text{16}\). However, due to the overwhelming nature of postmemory the need to speak, to write,

---

\(^{12}\) Ibidem, p. 107.

\(^{13}\) A. Janko, op. cit., p. 242 [own translation].


\(^{15}\) Ibidem.

\(^{16}\) Ibidem.
or, perhaps, in the words of Art Spiegelman, to “bleed history”17 – even though it is a history that was created, based on borrowed memories – seems to be omnipresent in the second generation. “I wanted to see the place my mother was led to after the pacification, to follow her footsteps”18, states Janko, and the insatiable desire to follow her mother’s footsteps is a constant psychological burden and an impellent of her writing. While the second generation does not desire trauma per se, it longs for the feeling of belonging, for continuity in their family history, for – as Raczymow may say – memory without holes19. The reason for such longing is connected with the fact, that children of survivors face a dire situation in which “both a personal and ethnic identity has been wiped out”20.

On June the 1st 1943 the village of Sochy was annihilated, and together with people who were slaughtered or houses that were physically destroyed, survivors’ family histories and feelings of stability or sense of security had been forsaken. Survivors of the Sochy massacre and their future children are left homeless21 in both the literal and metaphorical sense; they are not only devoid of their households or hometown they had to evacuate, but also the loss of home is connected with the loss of family and the sense of belonging. Instead, they are granted with a gap in family history, tattered memories mixed with emotions they often do not understand, constant anxiety and “inherited fear”22. As Janko confesses, the feeling of cultural extirpation (“I do not know where I come from”23), lack of stability and the dead weight of post-memory had not only been constantly present during her childhood, but continue to accompany her throughout her life. Thus, despite the absence of personal first-hand experience and even though the second generation is separated from their parents’

18 D. Wodecka, op. cit., p. 16 [own translation].
19 H. Raczymow, op. cit., p. 102. It is worth mentioning that the metaphor “memory shot through with holes” used by Raczymow is not unusual as Efraim Sicher also uses similar phrasing while writing about a “hole in memory”, “absent memory” or about “a void (...) which demands to be filled”. See: E. Sicher, *The Future of the Past: Countermemory and Postmemory in Contemporary American Post-Holocaust Narratives*, “History and Memory”, Vol. 12, No. 2 (Fall/Winter 2000), p. 64.
20 E. Sicher, op. cit., p. 63.
21 I use the term “homeless” in its metaphorical meaning referring to Adam Zagajewski’s reflection on the situation of the second generation presented in his essay *Two Cities*. As Zagajewski states, “a homeless person (…) is someone who by accident, caprice of fate, his own fault, or the fault of his temperament, did not want – or was incapable in his childhood or early youth of forging – close and affectionate bonds with the surroundings in which he grew up and matured”. It is worth pointing out that “surrounding” may here refer both to hometown and, figuratively, to a sense of belonging, stability or even: being anchored in family history. A. Zagajewski, *Two Cities. On exile, history, and the imagination*, trans. Lilian Vallee, Athens, Georgia 2002, p. 4.
22 A. Janko, op. cit., p. 9 [own translation].
23 A. Sańczuk, op. cit. [10.09.2015] [own translation].
past with “a break impossible to bridge”, their suffering and psychological scars are no less real.

“The impact [of the trauma – author’s note A. K.] was so tremendous that through her [Janko’s mother – AN A. K.] memory mine is also affected”, explains Janko, trying to portray the situation of the next generation in the interview for “Gazeta Wyborcza”. Her choice to describe the connection to the previous generation’s trauma with the term “impact” shows, that postmemory is often transmitted involuntarily, perhaps even without immediate awareness of the process itself. Both individual and collective memory of the second generation is “shaped by traumatic events that can be neither fully understood nor re-created”, explains Hirsch, stressing the fact that the process of trauma transmission is usually accompanied with confusion and a lack of understanding. Congruent with Janko, numerous other children of trauma survivors declare that memories or emotions they received from their parents are somehow implanted so deeply in their own consciousness, that it is often impossible to distinguish them from their own memories or explain the very process of transmission.

As observed in Mikołaj Grynberg’s *Oskarżam Auschwitz. Opowieści rodzinnie* – a collection of narrative interviews with children of Holocaust survivors – the trauma of war affects not only those who experienced it first-hand, but also those, who received it in postmemory. “It was our history”, explain in their interview Doron and Roger, sons of Krystyna Chiger, the authoress of *The Girl in the Green Sweater: A Life in Holocaust’s Shadow*, who survived Holocaust hiding in the sewers of Lvov. “Their [parents – AN A. K.] history was my history”, agrees Dahlia, also interviewed by Grynberg as a representative of the succeeding generation, whose mother had suffered in Auschwitz, Birkenau, Ravensbrück and Neustadt-Glewe. It is worth pointing out that Janko uses sentences and words similar to phrases that appear in interviews collected by Grynberg in his recent work, as she often expresses the inability to separate herself from her mother’s memories. “Since I remember I have always been thinking about war. I have lived in its context since childhood”, she writes, stressing that war-centered memories and thoughts became a primary reference point she used to define herself with, while growing up. This corresponds well

---


25 D. Wodecka, op. cit., p. 17 [own translation].

26 In Polish: “uderzenie”. Ibidem, p. 17.


30 M. Grynberg, op. cit., p. 212 [own translation].

31 A. Janko, op. cit., p. 171 [own translation].
with Anna Sawisz’s theories about memory and transmission, who states that the process of transmission is almost never neutral, and its reception depends strongly on the character of the source, as certain transmitters possess an ability to strengthen and validate the message\(^{32}\). Thus, it is not surprising that the memories Janko intercepts from her family almost result in merging her own identity with stories she received: “Sometimes I was imagining that I was you”\(^{33}\), she writes addressing her mother. Representatives of the second generation often continue to struggle with consequences of trauma transmission for the rest of their lives, as their identity is profoundly formed on the basis of borrowed memories they do not understand, yet cannot dismiss or reject. Hence, while postmemory is founded not on autobiographical experience, “the heritage of suffering”\(^{34}\), as Sicher suggests, it may result in genuine pain. The experiences may not be first-hand, but the memories feel nonetheless real and have a fair share in constituting a second-generation person’s identity.

This constant connection and struggle between inculcated memories of trauma and one’s own experiences and narrative finds its reflection both in the content and in the structure of the text of *Mała Zagłada*. The composition and the genre of Janko’s work are not easy to define: Janko’s mother’s story about tragedy in Sochy (sometimes presented as a monologue, sometimes delivered in a form of a dialogue between mother and daughter) is mixed with her own memories from childhood and reflection upon them. The authoress intentionally describes the situation of both herself and her mother concurrently, so that the two perspectives intertwine with each other and the structure of the text may remind the confusion Janko experienced growing up in the shadows of postmemory (“[borrowed history – AN A. K.] obfuscated my view of the world for decades”\(^{35}\)). On personal level, *Mała Zagłada* may be read as a dialogue between mother and daughter and the authoress’ attempt to understand both her mother – whom she often addresses, asks questions, even argues with (“Mother, it is not possible for you to remember it all in such a detailed way, because trauma disorganizes memories”\(^{36}\)) – and her own emotions and experiences. “It is almost as if this book is me diagnosing myself”\(^{37}\), she explains putting emphasis on the fact, that writing may serve as a form of personal therapy, a way of confronting confusion or fears. Committing thoughts and emotions to paper is a way of coming to terms with the past and allows Janko to comprehend the relationship she shares with her mother.


\(^{33}\) A. Janko, op. cit., p. 29.

\(^{34}\) E. Sicher, op. cit., p. 65.

\(^{35}\) A. Janko, op. cit., p. 242 [own translation].

\(^{36}\) Ibidem, p. 85 [own translation].

\(^{37}\) A. Sańczuk, op. cit. [10.09.2015] [own translation].
Sicher categorizes literary works created by representatives of the second generation somewhere “between autobiography and testimony”\(^{38}\), as they may be read both as important evidence of past tragedy (even though the traumatic event was not experienced first-hand) and, simultaneously, as a story, a biography of a person growing up surrounded by borrowed memories. Referencing her own work, Janko states, that her main aim as the author of *Mała Zagłada* was to reveal, to bring to light her mother’s story and enrich it with a touch of broader context and universal value\(^{39}\). The fact that the story she writes turns out to be just as much her mother’s as her own is, as Janko claims, not a literary device used to diversify the text of *Mała Zagłada*, but rather a consequence of her inability to separate her mother’s memories from her own narrative (a common trait of children of trauma survivors) and the personal need to feel connected with a history, she received while growing up. Janko’s aim to expose her family history and the need for self-diagnosis may be also read as a metaphorical search for her own narrative, the one she unravels in the process of writing. The shadows of postmemory can never cease to exist completely, however, as Janko proves, self-diagnosis of her state as the daughter of a trauma survivor allows her to address the subject on a more general level: “I discovered in my individual existence the absolute truth of the inheritance of trauma”\(^{40}\). Not only did the creation of *Mała Zagłada* serve as a personal means for learning and understanding her own emotions, motives or even behavior, but also, as one may see analyzing Janko’s literary work in broader perspective, it is a striving to explain the general phenomenon of postmemory and trauma transmission. Featuring her work with numerous literary references and theoretical background on the subject\(^{41}\), Janko proves that she aims not only to present her situation as a representative of the second generation, but also attempts to address the ongoing questions regarding borrowed memories’ influence on children brought up by trauma survivors. Instead of immersing oneself in postmemory, Janko proposes a healthy relationship between the past and the present. “I found my roots in this history”\(^{42}\), the authoress explains and compares *Mała Zagłada* to a “peculiar family album”\(^{43}\), a form of commitment to previous generations and their tragic past, an equivalent of regular family history, ties and childhood that had been taken away from her mother (and in consequence – from her) that tragic day in Sochy. Analysis of Janko’s literary work proves, that using writing as a method of deciphering both her mother’s story and her own biography, the authoress discovers that understanding her family history and her situation as a representative of the second generation may serve as a form of metaphorical anchorage and remedy for homelessness in a general sense.

---

\(^{38}\) E. Sicher, op. cit., p. 66.

\(^{39}\) A. Sańczuk, op. cit. [10.09.2015]

\(^{40}\) Ibidem. [10.09.2015] [own translation].

\(^{41}\) Janko references, among others, Swietłana Aleksijewicz, Daniel Goldhagen and Philip Zimbardo to provide a theoretical background to her biographical story. See: A. Janko, op. cit., p. 258–259.

\(^{42}\) A. Sańczuk, op. cit. [10.09.2015] [own translation].

\(^{43}\) Ibidem. [10.09.2015] [own translation].
Anna Kuchta, *Memory and influence. A story of trauma transmission in Anna Janko’s…*

**BIBLIOGRAPHY**


80
SUMMARY

The article focuses on the issue of postmemory (a term by M. Hirsch) basing on *Mała Zagłada* (published in 2015) written by Anna Janko, the daughter of Teresa Ferenc, who survived the massacre in Sochy (June the 1\st\ 1943). The main objective is not only to present the experience of „the second generation” in the context of the phenomenon of postmemory, but also to analyze the effect of transmitted memories and trauma on next generation representatives’ identity and narrative. Interpreting the subject of postmemory the authoress provides a theoretical background referencing, among others, the thought of M. Hirsch, E. Sicher and H. Raczymow.
Łukasz Dziura

I AM RIGHT, YOU ARE WRONG.
EVALUATION OF THE “EXPORTING”
OF MORALITY THEORY

Sociology of Law Department, Jagiellonian University

INTRODUCTION

Moral diversity appears to be infinite. It seems that everyone has a different answer to what it means to be a moral person. There are people who seek answers in religion or secular ethics, others will talk about the Golden Rule, improving the well-being of other people, or minimizing suffering. Ask the same question in Poland, Germany, Haiti, China and you will get a different answer. Can you beat women or children? Is a one month old infant already a human? Can you own another person? History shows that morality is ever-changing and there is no clear-cut definition of it.

In moral domain variety is vast and yet people often consider their own beliefs as the only right ones\(^1\). For those people moral diversity of the modern world creates a feeling of uncertainty and danger, which people are often motivated to minimize and solve. Many researchers tried to describe and explain this phenomenon. Such concepts as Webster and Kruglanski’s need for closure, Hardin and Higgins’s shared reality theory or McGregor and Jordan’s compensatory zeal theory are especially worth mentioning. In order to describe a more active side of the phenomenon, Benjamin Peterson, J. Allegra Smith, David Tannenbaum and Moira P. Shaw created two new constructs which based on the aforementioned theories: moral absolutism and moral exporting. They describe moral absolutism as a degree to which people believe that their definition of morality is objectively true\(^2\). Moral exporting was created to catch the tendency of some people to actively convince others to their moral beliefs. It is characterized by a willingness to actively promote and support one’s own moral

---

convictions, adding a strong, action-oriented component. What distinguishes their theory is their attempt to grasp the tendency of some people to actively convince others to accept their point of view.

OVERVIEW

The concept proposed by Peterson and others is highly based on works of other researchers, therefore it is only logical to start by explaining the groundwork. It will be helpful because the theory is not innovative, and it merely describes some people’s actions thanks to the knowledge of their cognitive motivation.

COGNITIVE DISSONANCE THEORY

The underlying theory for the abovementioned concepts, especially for moral exporting, is Leon Festinger’s theory of cognitive dissonance. Peterson is obviously influenced by an observation that people are usually motivated to reduce and solve a feeling of uncertainty and danger. Festinger states that the feeling of tension arises when two incompatible cognitive elements occur. This cognitive dissonance creates a motivational tension that people try to reduce or soothe.

Peterson repeats after Baumeister that social life is no different. When people start to notice a discrepancy between their own attitudes and the attitudes of others, they engage in a process of “social tuning” which main aim is to reduce uncertainty and compensate different points of view. For instance, people with high cognitive motivation (motivated to gain knowledge, often to make a clear-cut decision) are more willing to tune in to their nearest surroundings. The differences in cognitive motivation lead people to align to the attitudes of others, as well as to increase the group’s homogeneity. This can be noticed in various situations, for example during the time when a group needs to make a decision. When a majority of members think differently than an individual, it is more likely that this individual will tune in. This increases group’s homogeneity and can lead to the eventual internalization of decisions made by the group.

NEED FOR CLOSURE THEORY

Peterson based his concept directly on the “need for closure” (NFC). As Małgorzata Kossowska explains, Webster and Kruglanski proposed a new construct in order to describe and explain the differences between individuals who search for clear and certain

---

3 Ibidem, p. 208.
6 B. Peterson et al., op cit., p. 208.
7 Ibidem.
8 Ibidem.
knowledge which would reduce the feeling of cognitive uncertainty. It is not surprising that this seems similar to moral exporting. Peterson makes multiple comparisons between moral absolutism and NFC. Studies conducted by Webster and Kruglanski indicate that a high level of NFC is characterized by a shallow analysis of incoming information which “motivates to seek information corresponding to already existing knowledge structures”. As a result, individuals with high NFC create a simplified image of the situation which provides the feeling of knowledge explicitness, predictability and order. Such a view is extremely resistant to changes. Peterson describes moral absolutist as an individual who might engage in the process of moral exporting.

In contrast, individuals with low NFC process information differently and thus create a different worldview. They are more eager to experience uncertainty, so they are more open to new information, as well as to careful and precise analysis of a situation. Such individuals formulate quick and definitive opinions on new experiences less often, consider alternate interpretations more willingly and adapt to changes easier. Webster and Kruglanski point out that perhaps the most important observation is that social cognition and the process of establishing human interactions results from the way in which an individual processes information and formulate his or her own subjective opinions. These processes are strictly connected with individual NFC which has an influence on the readiness of an individual to be convinced by his partner, effect of availability of the construct on interpreting ambiguous information, or tendency of the members of a group to oppose against other opinions. Individuals that score low on NFC scale are irrelevant to Peterson’s theory. Such individuals are unlikely to engage in moral exporting because of their tolerance of different and conflicting worldviews.

---

10 B. Peterson et al., op cit., p. 211.
11 M. Kossowska, op. cit., p. 355.
13 Ibidem.
COMPENSATORY ZEAL THEORY

Peterson's main premise is that individuals engage in the act of convincing others because of their certainty is also deeply grounded in compensatory zeal theory. McGregor hypothesizes that people's attempts at convincing others is part of a defensive mechanism – compensatory zeal. Although in many situations confidence is actually not a part of a defensive mechanism, in other cases zeal serves as a cognitive equivalent of covering your ears and shouting “I'm not listening!”. McGregor thinks that zeal is so attractive because it relieves from uncertainty. Higher zeal is linked with freedom from the negative effects caused by conflicting goals. Fromm describes the correlation in this way: “zeal conviction gives an individual an image of the world which serves as a framework that allows one to answer the question where one stands and what one must do.” It means that conviction in the face of uncertainty is satisfying because it serves as an authoritarian judge resolving conflicting goals.

McGregor points out that “one of the remarkable things about conviction is that it can be so unreasonable and tenacious.” For some people beliefs of individuals with high zeal might certainly seem doubtful, or even bizarre. But these beliefs might also have a darker side. Most political and religious fundamentalists are convinced that only their worldviews are important, even if they are fully aware that their counterparts from other fractions may represent the same worldview. Likewise in conflicts inside the groups, we are going to find some fanatics who seem blind to the perspective of the other side and manifest intentions to annihilate the opposition or at least treat it with hatred.

McGregor's studies shed some light on motivational mechanism which are the basis of compensatory zeal. Individuals faced with unpleasant doubts react by exaggerating compensatory beliefs and thus get rid of the feeling of insecurity. Sartre wrote that the fundamental dilemma of existence is the uncertainty about what to do and how to live in the face of radical freedom offered by the absurdity of the universe. If personal insecurity is the main human concern, it seems likely that the compensatory belief can contribute to violent and zeal fueled conflicts that have plagued human history. McGregor concludes that the compensatory belief may have contributed to the violent cycles of threats and zeal that weigh so heavily on the

---

22 Ibidem.
23 Ibidem.
24 Ibidem.
modern world\textsuperscript{26}. Peterson never mentions why people become moral absolutists but his theory is compatible with defensive zeal mechanism. An individual scoring high on NFC will try to calm his cognitive dissonance by exaggerating his beliefs and by doing so his certainty will encourage him to engage in the process of moral exporting.

**SHARED REALITY THEORY**

Peterson also recalls shared reality theory by Hardin and Higgins. Its importance to moral exporting is minor and it will be only described in short, as it is very similar to the need for closure theory. Hardin and Higgins suggest that in the face of lack of social verification, experience is temporary, random and transitory\textsuperscript{27}. Only by acknowledgement by others and sharing it in a constant process of social verification which Hardin and Higgins called “shared reality”, such experience stops being simply a whim of subjectivity and gains a phenomenological status of objective reality\textsuperscript{28}. In other words, experience is important and credible only when shared with others. Authors suggest that implications of this hypothesis mean that an individual creates and maintains the experience of reality through sharing it in the process of social verification\textsuperscript{29}. What is more, social influence depends on and is regulated by shared reality, which function is to regulate the sense of self, ipso facto closing the cycle of dialogue\textsuperscript{30}. Peterson seems to refer to shared reality theory only in order to further stress the process of social tuning due to cognitive dissonance created by moral diversity. This has two implications for moral exporting. Firstly, expressing one’s views in the process of moral exporting validates these beliefs as objective reality. Secondly, reducing moral diversity by moral exporting strengthens shared reality.

**MORAL ABSOLUTISM AND MORAL EXPORTING**

Cognitive motivation will not always translate to the tendency to adapt oneself to others. As Festinger showed, an individual faced with cognitive dissonance can reduce the dissonance in a few ways. Due to the natural bias towards oneself and to the group to which one belongs, there is a strong tendency to consider both one’s views and the group’s as right. Baumeister called it egocentric bias\textsuperscript{31}. However, the mere presence of someone’s contrary point of view contributes to the rise of uncertainty\textsuperscript{32}. If an individual is able to tolerate to a certain extent the convictions of others and maintain his beliefs, the feeling of dissonance can be ignored. However, if someone’s


\textsuperscript{28} Ibidem, p. 31

\textsuperscript{29} Ibidem, p. 36.

\textsuperscript{30} Ibidem, p. 37.

\textsuperscript{31} R. F. Baumeister, op cit., p. 709.

tolerance is depleted, or an individual firmly sticks to his convictions, the state of dissonance can be difficult to ignore. In addition to rejecting the views of others as ridiculous, one of the ways to reduce the feeling of dissonance may be to convince an opponent to our point of view. By achieving a consensus of whose beliefs are correct, an individual not only eliminates the feeling of dissonance that is always present in the environment of moral diversity, but also confirms his beliefs.

McGregor states that the mechanism for intergroup relations is identical\textsuperscript{33}. People sharing the same beliefs are naturally categorized as in-group members, while others are seen as strangers. Groups can be a powerful source of common reality and confidence, and therefore – of sense of consensus\textsuperscript{34}. For example, a seeker of moral certainty can find a safe haven in religious groups, especially those that promote missionary work or fundamentalism. Such group can be convinced that their view of reality is the only true one. In consequence, the presence of other groups creates anxiety. For these groups opportunities to reduce dissonance may materialize in a form of conversion, imposition of beliefs, or direct elimination of other groups. Therefore it should not be a surprise that so many religions stress the need for missionary work, which main objective is, after all, a conversion of “infidels” through convincing them to a particular interpretation of morality. This behavior is consistent with the concept of moral exporting – the more conversions the group reaches, the less opinions causing the state of dissonance remain in the world.

Peterson goes one step further. While he agrees that homogenous groups provide a sufficient majority consensus, he hypothesizes that individuals with high cognitive motivation, in this case moral absolutists, will simply not be satisfied with the consensus provided by the group\textsuperscript{35}. They are more likely to feel the need to actively strive to convince others to their views by moral exporting. This is because the mere awareness that there are people who think differently is a threat to absolutists’ beliefs. In a sense, moral absolutists will be motivated to create a fulfilling consensus in others. Due to the fact that the theory of moral exporting is oriented toward study of individuals who actively persuade others to their philosophy, Peterson proposed a new scale for two constructs: moral absolutism and moral exporting\textsuperscript{36}. This scale is a result of Peterson’s hypothesis according to which individuals who score high on the scale of moral absolutism are more likely to undertake moral exporting. This is due to the persistent feeling of insecurity induced by dissonance between the world around them and their beliefs. The creation of a new construct – moral exporting – allowed Peterson to check whether individuals with strong moral convictions are more likely to impose their beliefs on others.

\textsuperscript{34}Ibidem, p. 986.
\textsuperscript{35}B. Peterson et al., op cit., p. 209.
\textsuperscript{36}See: Annex 1.
CRITIQUE

Peterson’s concepts may seem similar to some others theories – and indeed they are. In fact, even Peterson acknowledges this in his paper. Linda Skitka’s concept of moral convictions is a good example. Skitka states that moral convictions are experienced as an universal fact, which fosters moral exporting. This might suggest that the universality of moral convictions might be by itself a kind of cognitive motivation to achieve shared moral reality, and might encourage behavioral tendencies connected to moral exporting. In fact, this proves that Peterson may be right in stating that moral exporting might serve as one of possible ways of releasing moral absolutism. It also means that, as moral convictions are undoubtedly a part of moral exporting, they seem to be closer to Peterson’s construct of moral absolutism. Beliefs such as an absolutist view of morality seem to serve as a bridge between cognitive needs of certainty and closure and moral exporting. Yet, Peterson stresses that the construct of moral absolutism differs from the general theory of moral convictions. The latter seems to be connected directly to attitudes, whereas the idea of moral absolutism is in general devoid of the specific context and relates only to how moral convictions are seen on a scale of “good” and “evil”.

It should be stressed that there is a theory that is very similar, if not identical, to moral exporting, and that is the Jon Baron’s phenomenon of moralizing values. Baron explains that moralizing values are values that an individual tries to impose on others, regardless whether the recipient is interested or would benefit from accepting these values. He also distinguishes moral values and moralizing values. Baron defines moral goals as “goals that focus on achieving an end by both persuader and persuadee”, while moralizing goals as “goals independent of persuadee end”. Moral exporting is also driven by cognitive concerns over uncertainty in Baron’s theory. It means that some part of motivation may be egoistic (reduction of moral uncertainty) but it does not exclude a possibility that moral exporters would be driven by the wellbeing of others (for example “saving souls”). It is not surprising then for Pe-

37 B. Peterson et al., op cit., p. 223.
40 Ibidem, p. 903.
41 B. Peterson et al., op cit., p. 224.
42 Ibidem.
44 Ibidem, p. 1183.
46 Ibidem.
47 B. Peterson et al., op cit., p. 209.
Łukasz Dziura, I am right, you are wrong. Evaluation of the “exporting” of morality theory
terson to emphasize the active role of moral exporting onto others. Unlike Peterson,
Baron focuses rather on contents and motivation (and implications of thereof) of
moral exporting than on behavior as such.

DISCUSSION

It was shown that moral exporting is very similar to other theories. This implies that
without a wide scale studies moral exporting will remain a very weak predictor of
behaviors and intentions of behaviors. The problem of how moral exporting corre-
sponds to a particular behavior should be closely examined. It is not known whether
all moral convictions present the same value in cognitive uncertainty. Is weaker moral
exporting always going to mean a weaker desire to actively convince others? Or maybe
some moral dimensions show a better potential for “exporting” than the others? Moral
exporting may not necessarily depend on specific moral convictions, but it may still be
connected with different characteristics and moral dimensions. Peterson did in fact test
his theory on a group of 544 undergraduates, but it needs to be stressed that these stu-
dies were limited and performed in a specific academic environment. Moral absolutism
and moral exporting show potential, but there is a need to empirically test the theory
in Poland because of the societal, cultural, religious and economic differences between
American and Polish societies. A strong case can be made that moral absolutism and
moral exporting scales are promising. Moral exporting can be most useful in assessing
the need of members of religious groups to actively convince others to their worldview.
Some sociologists of religion have lately made a strong case that religious principles and
dogmas influence human actions and relations inside groups more than it was previo-
usly believed48. Moral exporting theory provides a tool to measure the differences not
only between individuals, but also between religious groups. It can help in establishing
the correlation between religious dogmas, beliefs and actions.

Another fields in which moral absolutism and moral exporting scales might be
useful are social psychology and political sciences. It might be especially valuable for
studies on political conservatism and authoritarianism. For a few decades psycholo-
gists have been exploring the hypothesis that ideological differences between the poli-
tical left and right are underlined by different psychological motives. There is a trend
to expand empirical studies on conservatism with avoidance of uncertainty, or need
for closure theories49. Moral exporting theory may very well further expand research on
the relationship between political support and cognitive motivation of individuals.

48 See G. Levy, R. Razin, Religious Beliefs, Religious Participation and Cooperation, “American Economic
No. 2, pp. 183–188; K. van den Bos, J. van Ameijde, H. van Gorp, On the Psychology of Religion:
The Role of Personal Uncertainty in Religious Worldview Defense, “Basic and Applied Social Psycho-
49 J. Tost, J. Glaser, A. W. Kruglanski, F. J. Sulloway, Political Conservatism as Motivated Social Cogni-
However, Peterson did not manage to explain sufficiently why some people are moral absolutists, and therefore moral exporters. He builds up on cognitive dissonance and need for closure theories, but it is still not clear whether they measure the same phenomenon. Moral absolutism scale is very different from NFC scale. It simply checks whether individuals see the world as right or wrong, not whether they are experiencing cognitive dissonance because of their cognitive uncertainty caused by different moral standards. This link between moral absolutism and cognitive uncertainty needs to be empirically tested because without it the whole theory might prove to be unreliable.

SUMMARY

Things that others believe in are important for an individual to define and confirm his moral worldview. This social confirmation of moral beliefs is a step that allows individuals to address and ease their cognitive anxieties. Of course different people feel a need to engage in such a process differently. For some, morality is like a bulldozer in the world of moral diversity – it encourages to create sharp definitions of unwavering and uncompromising morality. This moral absolutism must face the social reality test, which is a potential for the scale of moral exporting.

Moral exporting seems to present a useful way of describing tendencies of some people to impose their moral beliefs on others. Implications of moral exporting for many areas of study seem to be a sufficient reason for further empirical studies. One question especially comes to mind – will political conservatives be more likely to export their morality due to the fact that they should be scoring higher on moral absolutism scale? Regardless of that one thing is obvious – introducing those two new constructs presents an opportunity to answer the question “why”, and therefore allows a better understanding of cognitive motivations that underlay human actions.

One needs to keep in mind that Peterson’s research was conducted in the USA and thus it may not necessarily produce the same results in Poland. Polish studies on cognitive motivation, conservatism and authoritarianism show that it is impossible to simply implement foreign studies on Polish society. Moral exporting, though promising and undoubtedly useful, needs to be empirically tested and evaluated before conducting studies on a larger scale, let alone using it to measure other phenomena. Nevertheless, the potential usefulness of the theory is promising and it is worth a proper recognition and incorporation into Polish studies in sociology, social psychology and political science.
Łukasz Dziura, *I am right, you are wrong. Evaluation of the “exporting” of morality theory*

**BIBLIOGRAPHY**


**ANNEX 1**

Please take a moment to think about what “morality” means to you. How would you define it? More specifically, which moral values do you consider important (e.g. racial/ethnic/gender equality, freedom of speech, protecting the sanctity of life or the freedom to choose, being loyal to one’s group, etc.)? What attitudes and behaviors reflect your concept of “morality”? Once you have thought this through, please use the space below to express your personal definition of morality, using the moral values, principles, attitudes, and behaviors requested in the questions above to illustrate this definition. Take as much of the space as you need to fully describe your personal conception of “morality” (and what it means to be “moral”).

**MORAL ABSOLUTISM SCALE**

1. Right and wrong are not usually a simple matter of black and white; there are many shades of gray. (R)
2. There are absolutely clear guidelines about what is good and evil. These always apply to everyone, whatever the circumstances.
3. There is really only one proper way to think and behave morally.
4. “Morality” is relative to each person – there is no truly “correct” set of rules that should govern one’s conduct. (R)
5. Any other moral values or ways of thinking and behaving that conflict with my conception of morality are wrong.
6. The moral values and beliefs that help to enrich my life may not necessarily work for everyone. (R)

**MORAL EXPORTING SCALE**

1. When I meet someone who doesn’t share my moral values, I take the time to explain my views in an effort to convince them that they are worth living by.
2. Sometimes people live in places that operate under different moral values than these. In this case, it’s important to explain how their lives would improve by adopting these moral values as their own.
3. I have supported (or would support) organizations that advocate these moral values (including membership, giving time, and/or donating money).
4. I believe that these moral values should be reflected in this country’s legal system.

**SUMMARY**

In this article two new constructs of moral absolutism and moral exporting are presented. B. Peterson, A. J. Smith, D. Tannenbaum and M. P. Shaw hypothesize that individuals with high cognitive motivation, also called moral absolutists, will be more inclined to export their morality through an active process of imposing their views on others (i.e. moral exporting). The first part of the article is a description of theories underlying the constructs of moral absolutism and moral exporting. The second section describes Peterson’s theory in detail. The third part is a critique of new constructs which is provided through an analysis of their similarities to other existing theories and thus also through an assessment of their suitability and limitations.
For in the other powers which we possess we are in no respect superior to other living creatures; nay, we are inferior to many in swiftness and in strength and in other resources; but, because there has been implanted in us the power to persuade each other and to make clear to each other whatever we desire, not only have we escaped the life of wild beasts, but we have come together and founded cities and made laws and invented arts; and, generally speaking, there is no institution devised by man which the power of speech has not helped us to establish.\(^1\)

Isocrates, *Nicocles or the Cyprians*

For the ancient Greeks, there was no other such an evident difference between humans and animals as the ability to speak. It was the rhetoric talent that provided political career and success both in ancient Greece and Rome; it was the intelligible speech that differentiated Greeks from foreigners, onomatopoeically called barbarians (*barbaroi*); and, finally, it was the language that enabled humans to abandon the state in which the beasts had lived. As Isocrates observed, owing to the power of speech man has founded cities, invented arts, and – what is probably the most important – created laws. This has resulted from the differentiation between ‘the good’ and ‘the right’ that was made possible by the use of language.

The importance of speech in the ancient Greek culture is mirrored in the term *logos*, which means both ‘language’ and ‘reason’. The lack of intelligible language was an evident proof that animals did not possess reason; or, alternatively, the irrational beings (*zooa aloga*), as animals were generally called in Greek, would never be able to utter any meaningful sound. There was no speech without reason, as communication required rational choices, and no reason without speech, because it was language which enabled to develop the mind abilities\(^2\). This opinion had far-reaching

---


2. In fact it is difficult to indicate which observation (about animals as speechless or animals as irrational) antedates the other one. Stephen T. Newmyer suggests that in Stoic philosophy the notion that animals are not able to speak is the consequence of the belief that they do not possess reason (*Speaking of Beasts: The Stoics and Plutarch on Animal Reason and the Modern Case against Animals,* 1998, 58).
consequences, as most of the discussions on the moral status of animals in antiquity focused not on the question whether they are able to feel pain, but whether they are rational³.

However, there was one specific group of animals that seemed to undermine the view that beasts were not able to speak at all. While listening to the birds’ songs, some ancients could not hold back the impression that voices of these animals were meaningful and multifarious enough to be called a language, therefore they must have resulted from a rational decision. What is more, certain birds, such as parrots, were able to imitate human voices, becoming an excellent argument to refute the theory that no animal could utter articulated sounds⁴.

Therefore for those thinkers who denied animal rationality, bird communication posed a philosophical problem. On the other hand, for those who defended animal intelligence, it became one of the best arguments to support the view that beasts are both rational and able to use language within their species. The aim of this article is to analyse the theories on bird communication of those who assumed that man is the only species possessing reason and of those who affirmed that animals were able to utter meaningful speech. Regarding the first group, I will particularly focus on the thought of Aristotle and Stoics, while the second one will consist of analysis of Plutarch’s, Sextus Empiricus’ and Porphyry’s thoughts. I will indicate the main themes connected with the topic of bird communication, strategies used by individual thinkers when presenting the problem, and the main consequences of both denying and defending animal rationality in antiquity.

The most systematic study of animal communication in antiquity was conducted by Aristotle (384–322 BC). For this philosopher logos was an exclusively human feature. In Politics he explains that many animals have phone that reveals pleasure or pain and enables them to indicate those sensations to others, but only humans have speech (logos) to exchange information concerning what is advantageous and harmful, and therefore also what is right and wrong⁵. Additionally, according to Aristotle, only human language consists of phonemes (stoicheion) that can be combined into more complex units, while indivisible sounds of animals cannot form any structure⁶.

³ The most thorough investigation on this topic so far has been conducted by Richard Sorabji in his book Animal Minds and Human Morals. The Origins of the Western Debate (New York 1995).
⁴ Ancients, especially Romans, were fascinated by imitating abilities of parrots, as can be seen for example in Ovid’s Amores 2,6 and Statius’ Silvae 2,4, poems devoted to these birds.
In human language word has meaning established by convention and therefore it should be treated as a symbol, while animal voice is just a natural predisposition\(^7\). Even though Aristotle assumes that animal sounds do not base on symbols and cannot indicate any moral values, he is particularly interested in birds voices which seem to be different from those of other species. In *The History of Animals* he writes: “Certain species of birds above all other animals, and next after man, possess the faculty of uttering articulate sounds.”\(^8\) Birds owe this specific ability to the anatomy of their tongues. According to Aristotle, the language (*dialektos*) is the articulation (*diarthrosis*) of voice (*phone*) by the instrumentality of the tongue – vowels are produced through voice and larynx, while consonants through tongue and lips\(^9\). Many animals have *dialektos*, but only human tongue is free, broad and soft enough to pronounce various phonemes\(^10\). Nevertheless, birds’ tongues are also suitable for uttering varied sounds which make their language more advanced than that of other animals:

All [birds] are furnished with a tongue, but the organ is variable, being long in some birds and broad in others. (...) [The faculty of uttering articulate sounds] is chiefly developed in broad-tongued birds\(^11\).

In being broad is comprised the possibility of becoming narrow; for in the great the small is included, but not the great in the small. What has been said explains why, even among birds, those that are most capable of [uttering sounds]\(^12\) are such as have the broadest tongues; and why the viviparous and sanguineous quadrupeds, where the tongue is hard and thick and not free in its motions, have a very limited vocal articulation. Some birds have a considerable variety of notes. These are the smaller kinds. But it is the birds with talons that have the broader tongues. All birds use their tongues to communicate with each other. But some do this in a greater degree than the rest; so that in some cases it even seems as though actual instruction were imparted from one to another by its agency\(^13\).

It seems that according to Aristotle, birds are able to transmit not only simple sensations like pleasure and pain\(^14\) but also additional information. What is more, they are also capable of teaching their nestlings to sing what means that birds’ voice is not just natural predisposition, as in case of other species, but a result of education:

\(^12\) The original *phthengomenoi grammata* was translated by William Ogle as “pronouncing letters” but it is not consistent with the idea of Aristotle that only humans are able to pronounce individual phonemes.  
\(^14\) See S. T. Newmyer, *Animals in Greek and Roman Thought...*, op. cit., p. 61.
Of little birds, some sing a different note from the parent birds, if they have been
removed from the nest and have heard other birds singing; and a mother-nightingale
has been observed to give lessons in singing to a young bird, from which spectacle we
might obviously infer that the song of the bird was not equally congenital with mere
voice, but was something capable of modification and of improvement.\(^{15}\)

Therefore the language of birds, as capable of modifications, is much more develope
d than those of any other animals. But still, according to Aristotle, only humans
possess \textit{logos}. It can be exemplified by his view on the parrots’ mimicry of human
voice:

\begin{quote}
As a general rule all birds with crooked talons are short-necked, flat-tongued, and
disposed to mimicry. The Indian bird, the parrot, which is said to have a man’s tongue,
answers to this description.\(^{16}\)
\end{quote}

Aristotle admits that a parrot is described as having a man’s tongue (\textit{anthropoglotton}). It
is consistent with the popular idea that this bird has a human voice and can be taught
Greek, as it is described for example by Ctesias\(^{17}\). But even though parrot’s utterance
is articulated and consists of different phonemes, according to Aristotle it is nothing
more than a mere imitation – \textit{logos} is not involved in this process. Similar opinion can
be found in \textit{The Life of Apollonius of Tyana} by Philostratus (c. 170–248 CE):

\begin{quote}
...birds know what they learn from men; for the birds will wish you “farewell,” and say
“Good day” or “Zeus help you,” and such like, without understanding what they say
and without any real sympathy for mankind, merely because they have been trained to
move their tongue in a certain manner.\(^{18}\)
\end{quote}

It is also the philosophy of Stoics that has strongly influenced both ancient and
modern attitude to animals. According to their doctrine, humans owe nothing to
creatures that are irrational, as they cannot understand and share the concept of mo
rality\(^{19}\). Even if the soul (\textit{psyche}) of both humans and animals consists of eight parts,
the last part, \textit{hegemonikon} (‘governing principle’) only in humans developed into the
faculty of reason. As the meaningful language comes from the rational \textit{hegemonikon},
animals are not capable of speaking and their vocalisation arises from the impulse

\(^{15}\) Aristotle, \textit{Historia Animalium}, op. cit., 536b.
\(^{16}\) Ibidem, 597b.
\(^{17}\) Ctesias, \textit{Indika}, F45.8 [in:] A. Nichols, \textit{The Complete Fragments of Ctesias of Cnidus: Translation and
Commentary with an Introduction}, 2008 [A dissertation to the University of Florida].
livius.org/sources/content/philostratus-life-of-apollonius/ [30.09.2015].
\(^{19}\) See S. T. Newmyer, op. cit., p. 104.
As the consequence of being rational, humans possess the ‘internal reason’ (logos endiathetos) which gives rise to external ‘vocalised reason’ (logos prophorikos).

The Stoic philosopher Chrysippus of Soloi (c. 280–208 BC) notes that the phenomenon of birds communication is not quite relevant to this concept. As Varro reports, Chrysippus affirms that both children and some birds, such as crows and ravens, possess the ability of utterance that differs from the expression of other animals. However, he reports, they are not able to produce real words – their utterance is not the real speech (loqui) but a quasi-speech (ut loqui). It is because they are not aware of syntax. It means that certain birds and children possess the pure vocal utterance (logos phophorikos) but the meaningful inner language based upon reason (logos endiathetos) is an exclusive ability of fully developed humans, as only they are able to connect audible sound production with inner ideas.

The opposite view to the one of Aristotle and Stoics is presented by Plutarch (c. 50–125 CE) in his dialogue On the Intelligence of Animals. For Aristotimus, one of the characters of the dialogue, the birds’ ability to mimicry is an evident proof that animals possess logos as they are capable of uttering articulated sounds and learning. What is more, even untrained birds can utter such subtle voices that they often become an inspiration for poets:

As for starlings and crows and parrots which learn to talk and afford their teachers so malleable and imitative a vocal current to train and discipline, they seem to me to be champions and advocates of the other animals in their ability to learn, instructing us in some measure that they too are endowed both with rational utterance and with articulate voice; for which reason it is quite ridiculous to admit a comparison of them with creatures who have not enough voice even to howl or groan. And what music, what grace do we not find in the natural, untaught warbling of birds! To this the most eloquent and musical of our poets bear witness when they compare their sweetest songs and poems to the singing of swans and nightingales.

Regarding the sweet songs of a nightingale, even the Roman Stoic philosopher Seneca (c. 4BC – 65 CE) admits that it is more charming and melodious than any human voice, yet only man possesses reason (ratio). The example of a nightingale is expanded by Plutarch with the reference to the Aristotle’s description of this bird teaching her nestling. Plutarch observes that teaching requires more intelligence.

---

21 Ibidem; idem, Speaking of Beasts..., op. cit., p. 103.
24 Aristotle describing fish voices compares them to the sounds of birds (Historia Animalium, 535b).
than learning, therefore imitation is not the only ability of birds; they are as well capable of educating their young to improve their singing:

Now since there is more reason in teaching than in learning, we must yield assent to Aristotle when he says that animals do teach: a nightingale, in fact, has been observed instructing her young how to sing. A further proof that supports him is the fact that birds which have been taken young from the nest and bred apart from their mothers sing the worse for it; for the birds that are bred with their mothers are taught and learn, not for pay or glory, but for the joy of rivalling each other in song and because they cherish the beautiful in their utterance rather than the useful\textsuperscript{27}.

The anthropomorphism, a strategy frequently used by Plutarch, was quite a common way of describing animals in antiquity\textsuperscript{28}. It is evident in the story of a Roman barber’s jay (\textit{kitta}). The bird is described as able to mimic a variety of sounds: human language (\textit{anthropou rhemata}), animal voices (\textit{therion phthongous}), and sound of instruments (\textit{psophous organon}). It happened once that during a funeral trumpeters stopped in front of the barber-shop and played for a long time. Afterwards the jay remained silent for a certain period of time. Plutarch cites different opinions on this enigmatic incident: some people affirmed that the bird was stunned by trumpets or poisoned by a rival bird-trainer. But according to Plutarch, the jay did not lose its voice or ability to hear but it was silent deliberately, practising the imitation of the trumpet – as it finally reproduced the sound meticulously\textsuperscript{29}. For Plutarch, the conscious silence of the bird is an example of a self-instruction (\textit{automatheian}) and a proof of the rational operation. As Thorsten Fögen observes, according to Plutarch, birds do not imitate sounds randomly but make a conscious reflection on what they want to convey, what goes beyond blind mimicry\textsuperscript{30}.

It was also Sextus Empiricus (c. 160–210 CE) who disagreed with the conception that logos is an exclusively human feature. As a physician probably belonging to the so-called Empiric school, philosophically allied with the Sceptics, he denied the point of speculations on the human and animal nature because of inability of their comprehension\textsuperscript{31}. In his \textit{Outline of Pyrrhonism} Sextus presents several arguments against the “dogmatics” (\textit{dogmatikoi}), as he calls the Stoics, \textit{inter alia} about animal rationality. This rationality of animals, according to Sextus, is evident in the example of their communication. Although Empiricus in his work focuses mainly on dog intelligence, he also mentioned bird language and holistically analyses the phenomenon of animal communication:

\textsuperscript{27} Plutarch, op. cit., 973B.
\textsuperscript{28} J. Mossman, \textit{Plutarch on animals: rhetorical strategies in “de sollertia animalium,” “Hermathena” 2005, No. 179, pp. 147 ff.}
\textsuperscript{29} Plutarch, op. cit., 973C–E. See T. Fögen, op. cit., p. 222.
\textsuperscript{30} T. Fögen, op. cit., pp. 222–223.
\textsuperscript{31} See S. T. Newmyer, \textit{Animals in Greek and Roman Thought...}, op. cit., p. 64.
We observe that animals (...) give forth humanlike sounds, including jays and such others. Even if we do not understand the sounds of the so-called irrational animals, it is not at all unlikely that they are using language though we do not understand it but suppose it uniformly meaningless. We hear dogs giving forth one sound when they are warding off enemies and another when they are howling, and yet another when beaten and still another when they are fawning. Thus if one were to look closely at the matter, one would note a great variety of utterances in this and other sorts of animals in differing situations, so that it could readily be said, judging from these circumstances, that the so-called irrational animals have a share of external reason. If they are inferior to humans neither in the sharpness of their perceptions nor in internal reason, nor, to go further, in external reason, they should then be no less trusted than we in respect to their sensory impressions.

Sextus observes that birds, such as jays, utter humanlike (anthropinas) sounds. Contrary to Aristotle, Empiricus perceives such skill as a counterargument to the Stoic theory that only humans possess logos because jays also make meaningful, articulate sound. Their utterance is comprehensible but Sextus uses this example also as a starting point for a broader discussion on how we can judge the animal utterance as meaningless since we do not understand it. This argument, even though presented rather in order to challenge the “dogmas” of Stoicism than to defend animals, becomes a solid argument in the works of the second (besides Plutarch) most known animal defender of antiquity, Porphyry (c. 234–305 AD).

Porphyry joins Sextus in his critique of the Stoic conception of animal irrationality. He also mentions that we do not understand animal sounds, just as foreign languages, which resemble for us “the clangour of cranes”. According to Porphyry, beasts communicate in a manner that was given by the nature and their sounds are readily comprehended within their species. Moreover, there is no reason to assume that animals do not first think silently in the soul about what they experience before saying it – and therefore one cannot say they do not possess both kinds of logos – endiathetos and phorphorikos. “This is just as if crows should think that their voice alone is external reason, but that we are irrational animals, because the meaning of the sounds which we utter is not obvious to them,” adds Porphyry. He observes that even if sounds of animals are incomprehensible for us, people who live close to them, like shepherds or cowherds, readily understand animal messages, for example that they are hungry, thirsty or weary. Similarly to Sextus Empiricus, Porphyry suggests that the variety of voices uttered by animals is a proof that these sounds are

33 S. T. Newmyer, Animals in Greek and Roman Thought..., op. cit., p. 64.
35 Porphyry, op. cit., 3.2–3.
36 Ibidem, 3.5.
37 Ibidem.
meaningful, as there is a difference between utterances of an animal being terrified, summoning their young to food or fighting. In the discussion on birds language, Porphyry goes a step further than Plutarch and Sextus. He observes that “no one who has learnt our language is able to teach us through ours the meaning of what is said by brutes.” Therefore animal language seems to be unfathomable for humans and some people are given a false impression that animal sounds are meaningless. However, some myths and legends tell about fortunate individuals, in particular seers who were able to communicate with animals, especially birds, such as Melampus, Tiresias, and not much prior to Porphyry’s time Apollonius of Tyana. This ability allowed them to learn from birds about future events or incidents that had occurred in other places. Porphyry narrates that even his associate once had a servant who understood the meaning of sounds made by birds and claimed that all of them were prophetic. Porphyry adds that there are still some nations that understand the sounds of birds. Even augurs who practised divination while observing bird flight are classified by Porphyry as those who are capable of understanding the language of animals, as they learn to distinguish birds’ sounds.

Porphyry adds a piece of interesting information about the prophesying abilities of birds. Like most of the ancients, he perceives them as the messengers between people and gods:

The Gods, however, silently indicate their will, and birds apprehend their will more rapidly than men, and when they have apprehended it, they narrate it to men as much as they are able.

Porphyry also cites the fragment of Aristotle in which the nightingale teaches its young to sing as an example of animal intelligence. Contrary to Aristotle, Porphyry perceives animal ability to mimicry as the proof of reason. Interestingly, he does not conceal that birds such as parrots merely imitate human language, especially as a result of their keeper’s teaching, but he observes, basing on a legend about hyænas, that wild animals are also able to mimic human voice to deceive shepherds. Therefore, such imitation is not just a result of taming, but the proof of intelligence:

If, however, it appears that they imitate us, that they learn the Greek tongue, and understand their keepers, what man is so impudent as not to grant that they are rational, because he does not understand what they say? Crows, therefore, and magpies, the robin

---

38 Ibidem, 3.4.
39 Ibidem, 3.3.
40 Ibidem.
41 Ibidem, 3.4.
42 Ibidem, 3.5.
43 Ibidem, 3.6.
44 This legend has been cited also by Pliny the Elder (The Natural History, 8.44) and Claudius Aelianus (On the Characteristics of Animals, 7.22).
redbreast, and the parrot, imitate men, recollect what they have heard, are obedient to their preceptor while he is teaching them; and many of them, through what they have learnt, point out those that have acted wrong in the house. But the Indian hyaena, which the natives call crocotta, speaks in a manner so human, and this without a teacher, as to go to houses, and call that person whom he knows he can easily vanquish. He also imitates the voice of him who is most dear, and would most readily attend to the person whom he calls; so that, though the Indians know this, yet being deceived through the similitude, and obeying the call, they come forth, and are destroyed45.

Regarding birds taming, Porphyry gives also an example of a partridge which was taught by him to utter voice similar to human. Porphyry reports that the bird evidently tried to answer him, what may be also the proof of its reason:

When we were at Carthage, nurtured a tame partridge, which we caught flying, and which, in process of time, and by associating with us, became so exceedingly mild, that it was not only sedulously attentive to us, caressed and sported with us, but uttered a sound corresponding to the sound of our voice, and, as far as it was capable, answered us; and this in a manner different from that by which partridges are accustomed to call each other. For it did not utter a corresponding sound when we were silent, but when we spoke to it46.

It was also Celsus (2nd century CE), the author of an anti-Christian work entitled The True Word, who mentioned legendary people who can talk with animals, especially birds. His work survived only in fragments in Against Celsus by Origen but it includes observations on the nature of birds prophecy:

If, because man has been able to grasp the idea of God, he is deemed superior to the other animals, let those who hold this opinion know that this capacity will be claimed by many of the other animals; and with good reason: for what would any one maintain to be more divine than the power of foreknowing and predicting future events? Men accordingly acquire the art from the other animals, and especially from birds. And those who listen to the indications furnished by them, become possessed of the gift of prophecy. If, then, birds, and the other prophetic animals, which are enabled by the gift of God to foreknow events, instruct us by means of signs, so much the nearer do they seem to be to the society of God, and to be endowed with greater wisdom, and to be more beloved by Him. The more intelligent of men, moreover, say that the animals hold meetings which are more sacred than our assemblies, and that they know what is said at these meetings, and show that in reality they possess this knowledge, when, having previously stated that the birds have declared their intention of departing to some particular place, and of doing this thing or the other, the truth of their assertions is established by the departure of the birds to the place in question, and by their doing what was foretold47.

45 Porphyry, op. cit., 3.4.
46 Ibidem.
The argument of Celsus is directed against the Christian anthropocentric view of nature, including animals, which exist only to be divine signs interpreted by Christians. Resignifying animals as rational beings, Celsus tries to undermine Christian philosophy, especially the concept that all other beings had been created only to fulfil the needs of man. However, this fragment provides also interesting attitude to the prophesying abilities of birds. Similarly to Porphyry, Celsus supposes that birds are even closer to deity than humans, as they first learn divine messages.

Porphyry and Celsus belonged to the most influential opponents of Christianity in the ancient world. However, with the victory of this religion, the attitude towards animals have changed to their disadvantage. As Richard Sorabji proved, the ancient debate on the animal reason was multifarious and the image of animals as irrational beings had many opponents. Notwithstanding, Christianity was influenced only by one-side of this debate, the view of Aristotle and Stoics.

The role of Aristotle in the formation of later philosophical attitude to animals is ambiguous. On the one hand, his strongly anthropocentric view on human-animal relations has influenced the Christian theology, in particular works of Thomas Aquinas, and indirectly the thought of many later philosophers. On the other hand, his profound study of animal behaviour, including birds communication, provided several arguments to those thinkers whose goal was to undermine the irrationality of animals. Both Plutarch and Porphyry have adopted Aristotle’s description of the nightingale instructing her nestlings as the evident proof of animal intelligence.

Both Aristotle and Chrysippus of Soloi admit that birds surpass other animals in their communication abilities. According to Aristotle, it is owing to the specificity of their tongues that the bird language is next after human’s in regard to articulation. Also Chrysippus describes the language of certain birds as similar to children tongue and calls it a quasi-speech. Nevertheless, for both Aristotle and Stoics, no rational operation precedes the vocalisation of sound produced by birds. What is more, the imitative abilities of animals such like parrots are nothing more than a mere mimicry.

However, for Plutarch, Sextus Empiricus, and Porphyry, the imitation abilities of birds are the best argument that animals can utter articulate voices. Moreover, according to Plutarch, the imitation of voices requires the capability of learning, which is a rational operation. He observes that animals are able not only to learn but also to teach (the example of the nightingale) and even to practice self-instruction (as in the story of barber’s jay), which requires even more intelligence. The learning and self-instructing abilities of birds are also illustrated in Porphyry’s story of the partridge. Porphyry suggests that numerous individuals from the past (Tiresias, Melampus, Apollonius of Tyana) communicated with birds which enabled them to foresee some events in advance. The prophetic and divinatory capability of birds, according to Porphyry and Celsus, is the proof that these animals are even closer to gods than humans. Therefore, especially in the philosophy of late antiquity, the problem of birds ability to

---

48 R. Sorabji, op. cit., p. 2.
communicate goes beyond the mere question of their capacity of rational operation. It reaches the level of religious question and also in this case, according to Porphyry and Celsus, birds can prove that animals are not so much inferior to humans.

Birds were not the only animals that, according to ancients, proved that not only humans are capable of thinking. Nevertheless, because of the significance of speech in the Greek concept of reason, it was birds whose communication skills equipped numerous ancient philosophers with the arguments that might have refuted the view of Stoics. Even if these arguments are not quite convincing for us, we have to admit that birds singing is still one of the most charming and willingly used literary motifs.

BIBLIOGRAPHY


Katarzyna Kleczkowska, *Bird Communication in Ancient Greek and Roman Thought*


**SUMMARY**

The aim of the article is to analyse ancient Greek and Roman theories on bird communication. The author observes that the examples of bird communication were often used by ancient philosophers as arguments against the prevailing conception that only humans possessed reason. The article focuses mostly on the thought of Aristotle, Stoics, Plutarch, Sextus Empiricus, and Porphyry. It indicates strategies used by those thinkers when describing bird communication, the main themes connected with this topic, and the main consequences of the discussion on animal rationality in antiquity.
Taking office on the 1st of January 2003, President Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva, from the leftist Workers Party, declared that his administration would implement major policy shifts, including a redefinition of focal points of Brazilian foreign policy. Among changes that were to come in the country’s international agenda, reconceptualising and strengthening ties with Africa was one of the main objectives. These political declarations appeared when the president took off for his first official visit to the continent, accompanied by the members of the government and representatives of the business sector. By the end of his second term in 2010, with thirteen official journeys to the continent and twenty-three countries visited, President Lula became the Brazilian head of state who travelled to Africa many more times than his predecessors put together. The quest for stronger ties with Africa, a part of a broader strategy of international insertion termed by Brazilian policymakers “solidarity diplomacy”, required defining Brazil’s national role conceptions. The strong focus on development cooperation as the main sphere of mutual relations, manifested through both official discourse and a dynamically growing number of technical cooperation projects, could suggest that Brazil was playing the role of a donor in Africa. Yet, the reconstruction of national imaginaries visible since 2003 – executed by stressing the necessity of an increased national self-esteem, called *auto-estima* in Brazil, introducing mandatory classes of African culture and history in order to stress its

---


influence on the Brazilian culture – had a defining impact on how Brazil perceived its international roles. This was of particular relevance for the role of a donor, a role criticized by Brazilian diplomats, making claims that Brazil instead of being a donor was a development partner. In order to reconceptualise the role of a donor and adjust it to Brazil’s self-identification, the country’s policymakers strived to create an image of Brazil as distinctive from other states present in Africa. What is more, they endeavoured to redefine Africa’s image as Brazil’s partner.

In this paper I would like to address the analytical question about the way Brazil reconceptualises the role of a donor through discursive practices of its leaders. My research is anchored in the analytical framework of role theory, highlighting the important contribution of symbolic interactionism, especially George Herbert Mead’s analysis of the construction of the self and the other, made to the development of national role conceptions. Further, Brazil’s efforts aimed at the creation of a meaningful relationship with states in Africa, visible in presidential speeches of Lula da Silva and to a lesser degree, his successor and the incumbent Dilma Rousseff, can be better understood while applying gift theory to the analysis of the relationship between Brazil and Africa.

National role conceptions, defined by Kalevi Holsti as policymakers’ own definitions of the general kinds of decisions, commitments, rules and actions suitable to their state, and of the functions, if any, their state should perform on a continuing basis in the international system or in subordinate regional systems

have been a useful tool in explaining patterns of state behaviour. Until the beginning of the 21st century, internal state determinants, mainly military capacity, demographic and economic indicators, were considered main variables affecting the policymakers’ selection of national role conceptions. Since the beginning of this century, research highlights the importance of the realm of ideas and symbols in understanding the formation of national role concepts and state interactions. George Herbert Mead’s insights on social interactions, leading to the awareness of others and their impact on the creation of the self, are of particular interest for an analysis of perceptions, role concepts and creation of relationships between role partners.

International Relations scholars familiar with Mead’s work applied his observations on the formation of the human subject through the recognition of significant and generalized others constituting the society, to the level of states and interstate relationships. Symbolic interactionists’ findings, such as role taking and role making,

---


5 Significant others are agents of sufficient importance to impact an individual’s sense of self whereas generalized others are “the organized community or social group which gives to the individual his unity of self”. See: G. H. Mead, *Mind, Self and Society: From the Standpoint of a Social Behaviorist*, The University of Chicago Press, Chicago 1972, p. 154.
as well as role change and its sources further contributed to the understanding of shifts in state policies. If the application of symbolic interactionism to the analysis of interactions among states may cause concern, an argument in favour can be the fact that the American philosopher himself acknowledged such a possibility: “nations, like individuals, can become objects to themselves only as they «see themselves through the eyes of the other»”. Mead used his findings on the individual and society to state-level analysis.

Mead analyses the transgression of human subjectivity through focusing on others – this was the premise for interactions among subjects and participation in society. For communication was only possible if the subject was able to recognize significant and generalized others, identifying oneself in other members of the society. Self-cognition was possible by taking the other’s standpoint:

And only through the taking by individuals of the attitude or attitudes of the generalized other toward themselves is the existence of a universe of discourse, as that system of common or social meanings which thinking presupposes at its context, rendered possible.

The powerful concept presented by Mead was the idea of the self-constituted by the “I” and the “me”. In order for the subject to gain self-consciousness, it was necessary to objectify oneself – by becoming an object like other phenomena of the social world:

The individual experiences himself as such, not directly, but only indirectly from the particular standpoints of other individual members of the same social group, or from the generalized standpoint of the social group as a whole to which he belongs. For he enters his own experience as a self or individual, not directly or immediately, not by becoming a subject to himself, but only in so far as he first becomes an object to himself just as other individuals are objects to him or in his experience; and he becomes an object to himself only by taking the attitudes of other individuals toward himself within a social environment or context of experience and behavior in which both he and they are involved.

The process of the individual’s objectification possible through the recognition of the alter with its roles and perceptions of the individual, constitutes the “me” part of one’s self. The individual’s ability of identification as an object allows self-reflection and is seen as a process of reception and internal organization of alter’s attitudes towards the individual. The “me” is responsible for the adjustment of an individual’s attitudes in order to make them compatible with images and expectations of others:

---


8 G. H. Mead, Mind…, p. 156.

“the »me« is the organized set of attitudes of others which one himself assumes”\textsuperscript{10}. The importance of society with its others for the formation of the individual shows that Mead was abandoning a Cartesian vision of the subject, one in which the subject was self-sufficient in the process of self-cognition\textsuperscript{11}.

Yet, according to Mead, by interacting with others, not only was the individual constituted by society, but he also had the power to contribute towards society’s formation. The individual’s impact was possible because of the “I” part of the self, its reactions towards external attitudes and the constant dialogue between the “I” and the “me”. If the “me” was formed by becoming aware of the existence of significant and generalised others with their expectations towards the individual, the “I” was the “individual disposition”: “The »I« reacts to the self, which arises through the taking of the attitudes of others. Through taking those attitudes we have introduced the »me« and we react to it as an »I«.”\textsuperscript{12} It was an expression of the individual’s particularities, being independent of its external images and reflections of oneself. The “I” was the creative and impulsive element of the self, granting the individual its uniqueness and creativity, able to transgress the conformist indications of the “me”. Mead claimed that in many situations the “I” and the “me” would be compatible. However, situations of conflict were also possible if the “I” would not consent to expectations identified in the process of role-taking, as Mead termed the process of the subject’s adjustment to external expectations undertaken by the “me”. In cases of conflict, a transformation of the role would be possible.

Role-taking has been further described by Ralph Turner who defined it as “a process of looking at or anticipating another’s behaviour by viewing it in the context of a role imputed to that other”\textsuperscript{13}. As a definition of one’s own behaviour would require determining the expectations of others and one’s own expectations regarding the behaviours of others, the process of role-taking was enabling one’s own role making. The role assumed by the individual could be conformist – in accordance with others’ expectations and their roles. It could also be questioned by the individual’s “I”, leading to the quest for a role modification. Turner, similar to Mead, mentioned that the individual had the possibility to manipulate with the images it wished to provide to the others in order to change the way it was being perceived and thus change the others’ expectations.

One of the main features of roles acknowledged by researchers studying role theory was reciprocity. Reciprocity indicates that the realisation of a subject’s role requires identifying a social partner and the way the partner realises his role. It means also that both sides of the relationship have not only rights, but also obligations towards others. Due to different statuses which partners of the role may occupy,
reciprocity did not mean symmetric relationships, quite the contrary. Mutual obligations arising from reciprocity could be different, indicating existing differences of the partners – their different locations in the social hierarchy. Yet at the same time, the subject’s ability to influence the relationship with others by creating a different image of himself in the eyes of the other made role modification possible. At a later stage, this would cause role modifications of both partners due to the dynamic of role reciprocity, as modifications would not only include an individual’s role but also the kind of relationship between partners of the role, including its symmetry.

The conceptual framework of role theory contributes to the understanding of the kind of relationship Brazil is trying to construct in Africa. Main roles that can be identified are the roles of a donor and a recipient. Development cooperation was not the only element of the relationship that President Lula was willing to establish with African states, yet support for the continent’s development lay at the core of Lula’s speeches. However, the image of Brazil in Africa was constructed through stressing its distinctiveness from countries of the North – rich, developed nations, frequently with a colonial past, identified in the international aid architecture as “traditional donors”. If an image of Brazil visible in the official discourse of the Brazilian administration was to be determined, it was clearly that of Brazil as a non-donor.Emma Mawdsley identified four distinctive features describing the symbolic sphere of South-South development cooperation: the shared identity of a ‘developing country’, stressing mutual opportunity of cooperation, relevant, applicable development expertise and refusal of traditional, hierarchical donor-recipient relations. These features can be detected in Brazil’s discourse. Brazilian officials, referring to Brazil’s own past both as a colony and aid recipient, try to unveil unequal relationships with developed countries, sending out a signal to its significant others that the perception and expectations towards Brazil should be different:

The relationship that Brazil pretends to maintain with African countries is not a relation of an imperialist state with vocation of hegemony. We are already tired, we have been colonized, we have freed ourselves from hegemony. What we want now is partnership.

The term “development partner” is applied to Brazil and African states. Government representatives refuse to use the traditional expressions of “aid donor” and “aid recipient” for their paternalistic, neo-colonial connotations. It is stressed that Brazil enters in cooperation with partners that have an equal stand in the relationship – during a state visit to Mozambique, President Lula mentioned “We absolutely

do not want to have supremacy over anyone. We want equality in our relations.” Development cooperation researchers and policymakers acknowledge the challenge of categorizing states such as Brazil, India or South Korea, that are visibly distinct from traditional donors like the US, Netherlands or Japan. Despite existing divergence among these states, they mostly agree however, in applying the term “emerging donors” to a group of countries that are relatively new players, former recipients of aid, frequently being themselves developing countries, middle income countries or emerging economies. The main reason which may explain Brazil’s reluctance to use the term “emerging donor” and the quest to create an image of a partner focused on constructing a relationship of equality is the officials’ awareness of the asymmetries underlying the development assistance regime.

The features of the donor-recipient relationship can be further clarified applying gift theory to its analysis. Tomohisa Hattori, relying on the anthropological theory of the gift, reconceptualises the institution of development assistance into an act of gift exchange, typical in indigenous cultures. Gift theory allows to scrutinize the logic of reciprocity behind the relation between Brazil and African states, Brazil’s significant others and the country’s efforts to redefine the donor-recipient relationship. The anthropologist Marcel Mauss in his essay The Gift asserts that what is most important in the act of offering a gift is not the material value of the object, but the social obligation it creates. Mauss asserts that the gift is not free: it requires reciprocation. This obligation distinguishes the gift from other forms of social exchange. The act of giving creates a social relationship of inequality: as long as the recipient of the gift does not repay the donor by offering a gift in return, he risks losing his honour and prestige. Marshall Sahlins, who referred to gift theory in his studies on types of exchange, went even further, claiming that gift giving creates an unequal relationship between the superior and the inferior and that gift exchange was an expression of the distribution of power. Therefore, the act of development assistance understood as the equivalent of the gift in contemporary international relations is one of maintaining relationships of power. This has been observed by Hattori, who mentions that the maintenance of status quo has been indicated as the principal aim when engaging in development assistance. The asymmetry of the donor-recipient relation could only be reshaped by repaying the gift, an option that is not viable as in the international

17 Remarks by President Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva at a visit to the Centre of Brazilian Studies [on-line:] http://www.biblioteca.presidencia.gov.br/ex-presidentes/luiz-inacio-lula-da-silva/discursos [18.08.2015].
system providers of aid grants suspend indefinitely the obligation of repayment for the support received. Therefore contemporary donor states’ development assistance activities may be understood as instruments for the construction and reproduction of hierarchies in which donors can offer gifts, maintain or even strengthen their position by suspending any obligation of the aid recipient to set up his debt\textsuperscript{23}.

Brazil’s rejection of the donor-recipient dynamic becomes even more conspicuous when considering Silva’s argument that the logic of gift giving is justified by the discourse of solidarity. The idea of solidarity with Africa is present in both President Lula da Silva’s and Dilma Rousseff’s discourses. Even though Brazilian leaders promote the concept of “solidarity diplomacy”, they argue that solidarity with African states will allow to reshape the existing power relations\textsuperscript{24}. The way Brazil is trying to be perceived in Africa and establish its relation with the continent would therefore be contradictory to a donor’s aims and activities.

According to Marcel Mauss, the obligation to repay comes from \textit{hau}, the spirit of the thing that will haunt the individual who received the gift until the moment of repayment. If a gift is offered in return, the receiver recovers his honour. In São Tomé and Príncipe, the first African country visited in November 2003, President Lula made a statement he would repeat numerous times when travelling to Africa and discussing the question of cooperation: “this is the beginning of a repayment of the historic debt that Brazil has with Africa, that we will repay”\textsuperscript{25}. The Brazilian leader was placing Brazil in the position of a subject that has an obligation and owes Africa for the impact African slaves made on the construction of the Brazilian nation: its colour, cuisine, music and dance\textsuperscript{26}. This could be treated as a step the country’s leaders are taking to come to terms with the difficult past of slave trade for “Brazil needs to meet Africa to meet itself”\textsuperscript{27}. Africa in this context would not be treated as an aid recipient entangled in an asymmetric relationship. In his official speeches President Lula stressed that Brazil is the partner with the burden of the gift received from the continent. Development cooperation is therefore the act of repayment and Africa is a partner that not only offered Brazil a gift in the past but still, as the Brazilian leadership asserts, has a lot to offer\textsuperscript{28}.


\textsuperscript{27} Remarks by President Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva at the National Assembly of Angola [on-line:] http://www.biblioteca.presidencia.gov.br/ex-presidentes/luiz-inacio-lula-da-silva/discursos [19.08.2015].

\textsuperscript{28} Remarks by President Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva at a meeting with the Brazilian community of Senegal [on-line:] http://www.biblioteca.presidencia.gov.br/ex-presidentes/luiz-inacio-lula-da-silva/discursos [20.08.2015].
The image of the continent created in Brazilian presidential speeches is a subject that has been invisible or silenced for centuries. References to African invisibility have been made on many occasions by President Lula. The continent’s invisibility was contrasted with the visibility of Europe and the United States. In 2006 in Botswana President Lula declared that Brazil will never again look at the world without seeing Africa. Lula’s successor was making similar comments, referring to the lack of Africa’s own voice. During the speech delivered at the opening of the third Africa-South America Summit, President Dilma said: “The time has gone when we were part of a distant periphery, silent or silenced and problematic”. Referring to Africa as a silenced or invisible subject, Lula’s and Dilma’s speeches created the image of a postcolonial subject that has been muted and needs to regain its voice and visibility. The image of the weak African agent that existed on the international stage was a representation of the Other created by countries of the North or international organisations that were trying to influence development policies and deliver solutions for the global South on the basis of these representations. What the postcolonial subject should therefore do is to tell its own story: present a different, Southern perspective on world affairs. Brazilian leaders juxtaposed the image of a silenced and invisible continent that Africa had been in the past with the more assertive, fast growing and more stable Africa of the 21st century. African states were depicted as agents creating a continent which “is designing its proper destiny”. It was stressed by President Lula in Mozambique in 2010 that development would not be possible without a country’s ability to define and address its necessities. Brazil was therefore showing an awareness of Africa’s strengthened agency that came in line with the country’s principle of demand-driven development cooperation as well as value sets and modalities of cooperation offered by Brazil. Brazilian policymakers were making an effort to stress that this was Brazil’s way of perceiving the African continent.

Presenting a different image of the recipient affected also Brazil’s expectations towards African states – as strengthened subjects, they were able to offer many opportunities to their South American partner. As Emma Mawdsley in her analysis on South-South development cooperation noticed:

---


elite projections of national self-interest drive much of the decision-making about the provision of Southern development cooperation, including the choice of recipients, and its nature and conduct. This is not necessarily a problem – indeed, it can easily be construed as a strength of South-South development relations.

Yet, to what extent closer ties with Brazil may be beneficial in more substantial terms for African states should undoubtedly be the object of research interest in the upcoming years for analysts interested in the Brazilian development cooperation.

This paper has sought to analyse the Brazilian quest for a redefinition of the role of a donor and donor-recipient relation in order to engage in development cooperation with African states. Past experiences of being a recipient and Brazil’s interpretation of existing donor imaginaries as superior, paternalistic, creating neo-colonial ties with inferior recipients lead to a refusal of taking the role of a donor and its modification. This required the expression, during state visits and multilateral summits, through official speeches and declarations, of an alternative image of a Southern development partner with a similar history, culture and even a shared, Southern identity. Redefining the donor-recipient relationship required also strengthening the African agency, achieved at the discursive level by stressing the impact of Africa’s contribution to Brazilian culture as well as possible future benefits the continent could provide to its partner. Yet, efforts made during President Lula’s government may be jeopardized by Brazil’s current administration. Modifying images, expectations and patterns of relationships requires a long-standing effort if it is to convince significant others. Since 2011 and President Dilma in office however, the focus on Africa has been somewhat more blurry. If official declarations have remained in line with statements made by President Lula, the significantly smaller number of presidential visits to the continent, decreasing trade numbers and budget of the Brazilian Cooperation Agency responsible for technical cooperation projects make it quite clear that for Dilma, Africa is not the same important partner it was for Lula. Maintaining a more stable relationship with Africa might be a core premise for deepening ties with the continent and creating a feeling of affinity. It would also be essential for the redefinition of the donor-recipient relationship, one of the most disputed, contested and criticized political relationships of contemporary times.

33 E. Mawdsley, op. cit., p. 266.
34 As of August 2015, President Dilma made four visits to Africa.
Monika Sawicka, *Of roles and gifts – Brazil’s quest for a redefined relationship*…

**BIBLIOGRAPHY**


**ON-LINE RESOURCES**


SUMMARY

The paper seeks to analyse efforts undertaken by the Brazilian administration since 2003 to create a strengthened relationship with Africa with development cooperation at its core. It examines discursive strategies implemented by President Lula da Silva and, to a lesser extent, his successor President Dilma Rousseff, to reconceptualise the donor-recipient relationship ingrained in this kind of cooperation. Brazilian efforts to change existing imaginaries of paternalistic donors and submissive recipients engaged in a neo-colonial relationship to images of equal partners engaged in a mutually beneficiary relation will be analysed by applying the theoretical concept of role and gift theory to a content analysis of presidential speeches delivered during official visits to African states.
Ewa Kobylecka

Religious Education in Polish Schools: Teachers’ Intercultural Competence?

Institute for the Study of Religions, Jagiellonian University

INTRODUCTION

Religious education returned to the Polish public schools twenty-five years ago, shortly after the political transition. From that moment the state has undergone many changes. After 1989 Poland transformed into the country more open for relations with neighboring countries and is currently labelled as “pending for immigration”\(^1\). Free movement of people and traveling is possible, censorship was abolished and the democratic principles of freedom of speech were introduced. Accession to the European Union as well as the Schengen area transforms the country gradually, from an emigration and transit place to an attractive destination. What is more, the important role of migration and integration policy in the EU affects the growth of interest in this issue in Poland\(^2\).

Ongoing political and demographic changes are associated with the new tasks and challenges for the educational system, which should prepare students for living in society that is becoming far more culturally and religiously diverse. According to Bogusław Milerski, ideological and axiological issues, manifested particularly in religious differences, are an important area for perceiving and experiencing diversity\(^3\). Therefore, one of the forms in which intercultural education becomes a reality should be religious education. However, this requires adequate preparation of religious educators, so that they will be ready to work in a culturally diverse society.

---

Religious Education In Poland – The Legal Bases

Religious education was restored due to two documents: *Instruction of the Minister of Education* dated 3 August 1990, concerning the return of religious education to schools in the school year 1990/1991 and *Instruction of the Minister of Education* dated 24 August 1990, concerning the return of religious education to schools setting out the principles of cooperation with churches and religious associations outside the Roman Catholic Church. There were doubts about their legality but according to the judgment of the Constitutional Court of 30 January 1991, aforementioned instructions are consistent with law.

Chronologically, the next legal act regulating the presence of religious education in schools was the *Act of 7 September 1991 on the education system*. On its basis a directive defining detailed framework for religious education was introduced by the Minister of National Education. According to this act, religious education (and ethics) is voluntary and participation or non-participation in these classes cannot be the cause of discrimination. The directive also defines conditions for organizing lessons of different religions than Catholicism and ethics. It sets the minimum number of students for whom the classes can be conducted as seven in a given school, or three in an interschool group. What is important, religious education is based on the programs and manuals approved by ecclesiastical authorities who only respond to the Ministry of National Education. Religious education takes place twice a week, and an evaluation mark is placed on a final certificate. Interestingly, the same document allows to place the cross in the classroom. Other religious symbols are not listed.

The directive mentioned above present in details the way of organizing religious education in schools. However, the teaching of religion is guaranteed also in the legal acts of a higher order, which came into force in the 90.: *Concordat between the Holy See and the Republic of Poland* or *Constitution of the Republic of Poland*. Moreover, the professional qualifications are required from the religious

---

4 An objection has been expressed by Ewa Łętowska, then the Ombudsman. Already in August 1990 she appealed the Instructions to the Constitutional Court. She requested the recognition of Instructions as being inconsistent with the Constitution and applicable laws related to an education system, regulations between the State and the Catholic Church and the freedom of conscience and belief.
5 Dz. U. 1991 nr 95 poz. 425 z późn. zm., art. 12, ust. 1. *Public kindergartens, primary and secondary schools organize religious education at the request of parents, public secondary schools on request of either parents or students themselves; students decide about getting religious education after reaching the age of majority.*
6 *Ordinance of the Minister of National Education on the Conditions and Methods of Organizing Religious Education in Public Schools and Kindergartens from 14 April 1992 (with later amendments)* (Dz. U. 1992 nr 36 poz. 155).
7 *Concordat between the Holy See and the Polish Republic, signed at Warsaw on 28 July 1993* (Dz. U. 1998 nr 51 poz. 318), art. 12.
educators\(^9\) and adding the grade from religious education to the average assessments\(^10\) has a legal mandate.

The latest legal change, concerning religious education, was introduced in 2014 as a consequence of the verdict of the European Court of Human Rights in Strasbourg in \emph{Case of Grzelak v. Poland} (Application No. 7710/02)\(^11\). After that, The Court announced that the lack of access to ethics classes in Polish schools is a violation of the freedom of belief and non-discrimination\(^12\). As a result of this judgement, many limitations have been abolished. Since then, starting from the school year 2014/2015, ethics classes have been organized even for one student\(^13\). This legal change proves the impact of European legislation, in this case the European Convention on Human Rights, on national regulations.

CULTURAL AND RELIGIOUS DIVERSITY IN POLAND – THE NEED FOR INTERCULTURAL EDUCATION

Poland is perceived as culturally and religiously homogeneous country. This common observation is supported by statistics. According to the results of the latest \emph{Polish Census of 2011}, 94.8% of the population declares exclusively Polish national identity\(^14\) and 87.6% defines themselves as Christians belonging to the Roman Catholic Church\(^15\).

Despite of substantial homogeneity, as argued by Izabela Czerniejewska, intercultural education in Poland is needed and its shape should depend on the local specificity of cultural diversity. In Poland, on the one hand citizens interact with historical,

\(^9\) Agreement between Minister of National Education and the Conference of the Polish Episcopate on Qualifications of Religious Instruction Teachers from 6 September 2000 (Dz. Urz. MEN Nr 4 poz. 20).

\(^10\) Ordinance of the Minister of National Education on amending the ordinance on the conditions and manner of assessing, classifying and promoting pupils and students and conducting tests and examinations in public schools from 13 July 2007 (Dz. U. 2007 nr 130 poz. 906).

\(^11\) The applicants – parents and son – complained that Mateusz Grzelak (the son) who according to the wish of his parents resigned from religious instruction in primary school was not able to attend alternative classes of ethics and a mark for “religion/ethics” on his school report was absent.


\(^13\) Ordinance of the Minister of National Education amending the Ordinance on the conditions and methods of organizing religious instruction in public schools and kindergartens from 25 March 2014 (Dz. U. 2014 poz. 478).


\(^15\) Ibidem, p. 100.
cultural and ethnic minorities\textsuperscript{16}, and on the other hand – with the so-called “new minorities” meaning immigrant communities\textsuperscript{17}. According to Miroslaw Sobecki:

Only at school change of consciousness concerning an attitude to what is culturally different can be initiated on an adequate scale. The idea is to use the potential of school. Undoubtedly, its major strengths are an ability to build real competence and to equip [the students - E.K.] with reliable, proven and appropriately selected knowledge\textsuperscript{18}.

Intercultural education that can be defined as:

an educational and tutorial process aimed at shaping the understanding of cultural differences – ranging from subcultures in the local communities up to cultures of spatially distant societies – and to prepare for dialog interaction with representatives of other cultures. Through the critical reflection, it leads to strengthening own cultural identity\textsuperscript{19}.

aims to reach this goal. Though this aim cannot be achieved without adequate preparation of teachers.

\textbf{INTERCULTURAL COMPETENCE AND EDUCATION}

To take advantage of the potential of inter-religious education, teachers must obtain an appropriate competence. What is therefore an intercultural competence? In the humanities, it is widely understood as a complex and multidimensional ability, which is the result of a long-lasting process of acquiring knowledge, skills and reflection on cultural differences, required experiences and personality development\textsuperscript{20}.

One of the classic ways of thinking about intercultural competence in the humanistic approach is the Developmental Model of Intercultural Sensitivity (DMIS) created in the 80. by Milton J. Bennett. According to the author, the development of intercultural competence is related to significant qualitative change, namely the transition from ethnocentrism, understood as the perception of own culture as central to reality and avoiding cultural differences, to ethnorelativism – the perception of own

\textsuperscript{16} Ibidem, p. 92. The broader study on national minorities based on statistical data from \textit{Polish Census of 2011} can be found in the following publication: I. Czerniejewska, \textit{Edukacja wielokulturowa. Działania podejmowane w Polsce}, Toruń 2013, pp. 38–56.


\textsuperscript{20} E. Chromiec, \textit{Edukacja w kontekście różnicy i różnorodności kulturowej: Z inspiracji naukowych obszaru niemieckojęzyckiego}, Kraków 2006, p. 103.
way of thinking and behavior as one of many possible ways of thinking about reality and the search for cultural differences\textsuperscript{21}.

Another model, useful in the context of intercultural competence of teachers, was proposed by Darla Deardorff. It is based on the grounded theory\textsuperscript{22}. Similarly to Bennett, she sees intercultural competence as a process. According to Deardorff, the basis of intercultural competence are attitudes — respect, openness and curiosity. They are the foundations for the development of knowledge\textsuperscript{23} and skills\textsuperscript{24}. On the basis of the attitudes, knowledge and skills internal results such as flexibility, adaptability, ethnorelativism, and empathy are accomplished. As a result, one achieves behavior and communication that are adequate and effective in an intercultural interaction. It is called an external result\textsuperscript{25}. Significantly, this model has been already used with regard to the teachers. For this purpose, Deardorff developed two tools, intercultural competence self-assessment questionnaire and a list of questions tending to reflect on the different elements of own intercultural competence\textsuperscript{26}.

Deardorff defines intercultural competence as an ability to communicate efficiently and adequately in intercultural situations, according to knowledge, skills and attitudes of individuals\textsuperscript{27}. It means that the competence is mainly related to communication and can be successfully developed.

MODELS OF RELIGIOUS EDUCATION – INTER-RELIGIOUS EDUCATION

Religious education is present in public schools of almost all EU countries\textsuperscript{28}. It is no surprise that it appears in different forms, depending on the historical, cultural and religious contexts or legal regulations of a particular country.

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{23} Primarily: self-knowledge, cultural self-awareness, culturally specific knowledge, understanding different worldview and perceiving the world from the perspective of “the other”.
\item \textsuperscript{24} Observation, listening, evaluation, analysis, interpretation and the identification of associations.
\item \textsuperscript{25} K. Berardo, D. K. Deardorff, \textit{Building cultural competence: Innovative activities and models}, Sterling, VA 2012, pp. 45–47.
\item \textsuperscript{26} Ibidem, pp. 50–52.
\item \textsuperscript{28} France is an exception: there is a strict separation of church and state, and religion is considered a private matter of every citizen. Hence, it is not possible to legitimize the presence of any religion in the public area. More on this topic: B. Milerski, \textit{Religia a szkoła: Status edukacji religijnej w szkole w ujęciu ewangelickim}, Warszawa 1998, pp. 21–27.
\end{itemize}
According to Milerski, religious education can be confessional – associated with a particular religion, denominational (confessional-catechumenal or confessional-dialogical), or non-confessional. Confessional-catechumenal attitude is based on introduction to the liturgy of a particular religious community. Religious education is considered as a form of the mission of the Church in the school environment. Non-confessional attitude assumes informative and objective nature of religious instruction. In this way, teaching may be related to religious studies approach or it can be taught about different religions with an emphasis on one particular tradition. In contrast, the confessional-catechumenal and confessional-dialogical approaches not only emphasize the role of religious identification but also underline an ecumenical, philosophical and pedagogical dialogue.

A similar typology was introduced by John Hull who defines the following models of religious education: learning religion, learning about religion and learning from religion. Learning religion refers to the situation when one chosen religious tradition is taught from the inside and the purpose of the lessons is to strengthen the faith of students. Learning about religion implies an external, nonreligious perspective dominated by descriptive and historical approach. The third model (learning from religion) puts an emphasis on humanistic education of students and their spiritual and moral development.

Referring to the models described above, it should be pointed that intercultural education is present especially in the countries where non-confessional, learning about religion or confessional-dialogical, learning from religion models of education dominate. According to Milerski, from this perspective religious education is a part of the overall humanistic and social education, which fulfills its core tasks, including those intercultural. In this context, it seems reasonable to assume that:

The primary task in the process of preparing all students for harmonious life in a pluralistic society should certainly shape the understanding of the multiplicity of views and religious practices, and providing insight into the world of values and interests of individual national groups. (...) Religious education shares with other subjects an aim

30 Ibidem, p. 274.
to help pupils in raising their skills, knowledge and social competencies necessary to develop their personal and social life.

**Intercultural Competence Of Religious Teachers – Own Preliminary Studies**

The aim of the presented research was a preliminary diagnosis of the religious education in the context of intercultural competence of teachers working in public schools. Contact with the subjects was established via the Catechetical Department of the Metropolitan Curia in Kraków so the study includes only the Roman Catholic teachers. An invitation to participate in the study was sent to all catechists who have shared their email addresses with the Curia (approximately 300 people). Only five teachers responded to the message, so the results are preliminary and not representative. However even these few interviews broaden the knowledge on religious education in addition to intercultural competence of teachers and indicate the potential for its development.

The subjects are secular catechists working in villages near Kraków. The research method is a semi-structured interview which deals with such topics as: preparation and motivation to teach religion, religious education goals, an alternative to religious instruction (ethics), learning about other religions, and preparation for teaching about different religions and cultures.

When it comes to preparatory training, all respondents have a higher theological education – the Master’s degree or the Bachelor of Science. It is worth noting that all subjects have multi-directional education. In addition to theology they have completed, usually post-graduate, majors such as physical education, family and sexual education, ethics, special education, history, or art studies. Motivation to teaching religion is inner. Teachers have admitted that they are interested in religion personally and they are seeking to be a behavioral model to the younger generation.

According to the respondents, the purpose of religious education is first and foremost a transfer of religious knowledge (while not judging the practice) and deepening personal faith of their students. Religious education in primary schools is also intended to revise the prayer positions, texts of prayers, and proper behavior in a church. One of the respondents also indicated a desire to shape thinking about the values and distinguishing good from evil.


37 Licentiate of Sacred Theology is an academic degree bestowed on Catholic theology faculties of pontifical universities. It is part of the so-called Roman system of degrees and is not identical with the professional title of non-theological universities bachelor. Scientific bachelor is an academic degree higher than master’s degree, lower than doctorate.
Ethics classes are conducted only in one of the researched schools. Interestingly, they are also led by a professionally active catechist. According to him, the purpose of ethics classes is identical with the purpose of religious instruction, except that in the case of ethics, one does not refer to Christian values. In other schools ethics classes are not conducted because “the parents did not wish to”38, “because there is no such need” (all students attend religion classes – E. K.), or ethics classes failed to be organized (“there was a proposal but it collapsed”).

Learning about other religions is present in the content of teaching and in the curriculum (for example, one of the catechists mentioned a set of lessons “I respect and recognize the Others”) what is confirmed by all of the respondents. However, this is primarily the teaching about the three great monotheisms (Christianity, Islam, Judaism) limited to basic factual data or other sects of Christianity (ecumenism). Respondents even point out that their school is Catholic so there is no praxis to teach about other religions. If religion in school is conducted in the religious studies formula, it will be additional subject, focusing mainly on teaching the history of religion. Teachers, however, try to respond to students’ interest in different religions and the questions asked. Other religions are presented by students using multimedia such as photos or videos.

The greatest diversity of views expressed by the teachers concerns their preparation for teaching about other religions. Part of the respondents assessed their knowledge about other religions as very high, even though it was acquired many years ago, while studying theology. One of the respondents was convinced that she obtained all the necessary knowledge at university (“After all, I was at university!”). Some of the statements have shown the presence of stereotypes and intolerance towards Jews and Jehovah's Witnesses. It should be noted that the same person who has shown negative attitudes towards the followers of these religions denied the existence of prejudice (“Prejudice is the slogan for journalists. There is no such thing as prejudice.”). In contrast, some of the subjects showed a proactive approach, emphasizing the importance of self-education. They highlighted the role of the written word but also pointed other sources of knowledge about other religions and cultures such as their own trips abroad or friends confessing a different religion.

CONCLUSION

Religious education in Poland is dominated by a confessional approach. As presented in the first part of the article, Polish law assumes that it is a particular religious community, not the state which is responsible for the curriculum and the selection of the content of teaching. According to the core curriculum39 and the statements

---

38 This and the following quotes are statements of the respondents translated by the Author.
of the respondents, the main aim of the religious (Roman Catholic) education is the Christian formation of students and leading them to mature faith.

The goals set in this manner do not leave much space for the intercultural religious education proposed by Milerski. Thus the shift towards a non-confessional approach is not likely. As was mentioned by one of the respondents: “Religious education cannot follow this way because it won’t be a Roman Catholic religion teaching, it won’t be a catechesis”. The same subject has also added that:

Catechesis is not religious studies, it must be clearly stated (...). We will not speak in [name of the town] about the tolerance for Jews, as nobody has ever seen here any Jew.

However, as shown in the article, intercultural competence is a subject of a gradual, qualitative change, so it can be developed and trained. It is hoped that observed political and demographic changes in Poland, related to the migration processes and the development of intercultural education, will affect the broader interest of intercultural competencies of religious teachers. So that one can hear more often teachers’ statements such as the following:

I cannot imagine not to speak of other religions because the Christian religion is thirty percent of the world’s population. (...) You cannot be a man who believes that what he thinks is always on the top.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

LEGAL ACTS
Agreement between Minister of National Education and the Conference of the Polish Episcopate on Qualifications of Religious Instruction Teachers from 6 September 2000 (Dz. Urz. MEN Nr 4 poz. 20).
Instruction of the Minister of Education dated 24 August 1990 concerning the return of religious education to schools setting out the principles of cooperation with churches and religious associations outside the Roman Catholic Church.
Instruction of the Minister of Education dated 3 August 1990 concerning the return of religious education to schools in the school year 1990/1991.

Ordinance of the Minister of National Education amending the Ordinance on the conditions and methods of organizing religious instruction in public schools and kindergartens from 25 March 2014 (Dz. U. 2014 poz. 478).

Ordinance of the Minister of National Education on amending the ordinance on the conditions and manner of assessing, classifying and promoting pupils and students and conducting tests and examinations in public schools from 13 July 2007 (Dz. U. 2007 nr 130 poz. 906).


REFERENCES


This article concerns religious education in Polish schools. The main aim of the paper is to diagnose its potential to support intercultural education. The analysis is constructed upon the legal aspects that form the religious education’s dominant model. Furthermore, the need for intercultural education in Poland is rationalized. For this kind of education proper preparation of teachers and development of their intercultural competencies should be ensured. The term “intercultural competence” is clarified in the context of developmental models created by Milton Bennett and Darla Deardorff. Theoretical analysis provides the basis for research, which main point is to address the question whether religious educators are competent enough to conduct intercultural courses or not. The preliminary studies are based on five semi-structured interviews. They concern such issues as preparation and motivation for teaching religion, learning about other religions in frame of religious education, and the preparation for teaching about other religions and cultures.

Summary

This article concerns religious education in Polish schools. The main aim of the paper is to diagnose its potential to support intercultural education. The analysis is constructed upon the legal aspects that form the religious education’s dominant model. Furthermore, the need for intercultural education in Poland is rationalized. For this kind of education proper preparation of teachers and development of their intercultural competencies should be ensured. The term “intercultural competence” is clarified in the context of developmental models created by Milton Bennett and Darla Deardorff. Theoretical analysis provides the basis for research, which main point is to address the question whether religious educators are competent enough to conduct intercultural courses or not. The preliminary studies are based on five semi-structured interviews. They concern such issues as preparation and motivation for teaching religion, learning about other religions in frame of religious education, and the preparation for teaching about other religions and cultures.
Justyna Górniak

VARIETY SHOWS – A CARNIVALIZED PLATFORM OF COMMUNICATION FOR THE LGBTQ COMMUNITY IN JAPAN

UNESCO Chair for Translation Studies and Intercultural Communication, Jagiellonian University

THE CARNIVAL

I would like to start my considerations with a reference to Mikhail Bakhtin’s theory of carnival as it is crucial for the understanding of carnivalization and hence – its influence on Japanese variety shows. The author assumes a view of the carnival as an outlook on life, oppositional to hierarchy and official institutions. He underlines the ludic character of carnival resulting from the folk-tawdry culture that gave birth to the celebrations. The phenomenon can be described as the realization of a basic human need for breaking out from the multiplicity of rules in the everyday social life of an individual. And even against the rise of modern philosophy and science so closely connected with the ideas of order, harmony and hierarchy, this need does not seem to grow any weaker. On the contrary – the natural tendency of trying to find and assign meaning to the surrounding reality is accompanied by the equally strong inclination to periodically turn it upside down. And those are the moments of carnival.

Bakhtin described four categories of the carnivalistic sense of the world: (1) Free and familiar contact among people, which is characterized by suspension of laws and restrictions, temporary revocation of hierarchies and free familiarization between the participants, (2) Eccentricity; during the carnival everything that seems strange or inappropriate becomes its characteristic, (3) Carnivalistic mésalliances – the scholar uses this category to describe the unique aptitude of carnival for merging what might

---

1 A. Burzyńska, M. P. Markowski, Teorie literatury XX wieku, Kraków 2009, p. 157. Please note that all citations from foreign sources were translated by the author.
in everyday life appear opposite\textsuperscript{5}, and (4) \textit{Profanation} – in this category Bakhtin described “carnivalistic blasphemies, a whole system of carnivalistic debasings and bringings down to earth, carnivalistic obscenities linked with the reproductive power of the earth and the body, carnivalistic parodies on sacred texts and sayings, etc.”\textsuperscript{6} All of the aforementioned categories find realizations in different forms characteristic of the carnival. They make up for some general rules distinguishing the phenomenon. While analyzing the actors taking part in the carnival, it is important to point to the fact that one may assume one of two roles; either the role of the crowd or the jester. Moreover, even though the jesters are somewhat the heroes of the carnival, they do not stand at the top of any hierarchy. On the contrary; the familiar atmosphere and the strong connection with the folk culture of laughter makes them out to be catalysts for achieving the main goal – joining all participants in common laughter that has no regard for any authority. The carnivalesque laughter has great power; it can work as a “social glue”, connecting all types of people and helping them overcome crises\textsuperscript{7}.

\textbf{THE CARNIVALIZATION}

While it is not uncommon in the literature pertaining to the topic to find the terms \textit{carnival} and \textit{carnivalization} used interchangeably, it is important to stress that the latter word has, in most cases, a broader meaning, while the former should pertain to the form of folk customary celebrations (festival) which contains a substantial amount of theatrical and scenic elements\textsuperscript{8}. As to distinguish the phenomena incorporating the general rules of the carnival and containing elements reminiscent of the celebrations from the festival the term describes, Polish scholar Andrzej Belkot calls all of those phenomena “carnival-like” or “carnivalized”\textsuperscript{9}. In his considerations \textit{carnivalization} has six different meanings: in the first meaning it is the relativization of everyday life to the sphere of consumption (entertainment), in the second it describes the spreading of ludic experience in various fields of culture, thirdly – it is the blurring of the boundaries between what is described as high and low in a given culture (elite and popular), in the fourth meaning it pertains to the switching of the set of customary behaviors with contra-customary as an effect of the “normalization” of the carnival, the fifth meaning presents carnivalization as the act of referring to a general and socially understood image of carnival, and the last, sixth meaning of

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{5} Ibidem.
\textsuperscript{6} Ibidem.
\textsuperscript{7} Ibidem, p. 127.
\textsuperscript{9} Ibidem, p. 48.
\end{flushleft}
carnivalization is the use of carnival as a form of communication of injustice\textsuperscript{10}. Maciej Kowalewski in his work on carnivalization of protest defines the phenomenon briefly as “the influence of the topos of carnival on various forms of social reality”\textsuperscript{11}. In its simplicity, this definition seems to be useful in the analysis of most of the forms connected with the phenomenon.

It is crucial to note that it is the term carnivalization that seems to be actively present in the analyses of miscellaneous forms and phenomena of the 20\textsuperscript{th} and 21\textsuperscript{st} century. The term quite accurately describes the tendencies of Japanese entertainment, especially variety shows, which incorporate a number of characteristics described by Bakhtin as typical of the carnival. While it may raise doubts whether carnivalization is a positive tendency or if it can even still be called that in the Western culture, in which the expansion of freedom and toppling of the rules are slowly working their way into every aspect of life\textsuperscript{12}, the soil for the growth of carnivalesque forms in Japan is particularly promising.

THE JAPANESE CONTEXT

The need for carnivalization is usually stronger in times of crisis or in strongly hierarchical societies whose members have to abide by many different sets of written and unwritten rules. Living in the constraints of everyday life, full of hierarchies, which naturally contributes to the social pressure, Japanese struggle with a number of social problems resulting from the oppressive social environment they have to live in. Japanese mothers struggle with the roles assigned to them by society and all the expectations that come with it. As the husbands are often overworked and involved in the intricate web of relations and obligations at the workplace even long after the working hours, the women often have no choice but to become professional housewives — sengyou shuufu\textsuperscript{13}, responsible for bringing up children, running the house and, quite frequently, taking care of the elderly parents, all while being near the bottom of the family hierarchy. An increasing number of them also has to juggle their everyday responsibilities with part-time work, which often leads to an internal crisis of priorities and emotional drainage\textsuperscript{14}.

\begin{footnotes}
\end{footnotes}
In the view of the multiplicity of expectations members of the Japanese society have to fulfil and the inequalities in effect, the tendency to seek moments of freedom from them is not surprising. Japanese popular culture has given birth to many interesting phenomena where some rules are being turned upside down in a carnivalistic way. Variety shows are one of them. The main objective of these TV programs is very similar to the one of carnival, and so is the set of rules they incorporate. With laughter being of utmost value, they draw a picture of a wonderful world where everything is possible and even normal, including the presence of people who would usually be outsiders, such as those belonging to sexual minorities, including homosexuals, transsexuals, drag queens and cross-dressers.

On the one hand, Japanese variety shows are certain to provide entertainment and bring people closer to their true feelings instead of the façade they put up for the society. On the other, they might become a source of frustration, as the carnivalization does not seem to have much effect on their everyday lives. The magical and inclusive world of variety provides a necessary relief but it still is an element of a different reality, not the one its audience lives in. When it comes to the analysis of the sexual minorities context, it presents two basic problems. The first one pertains to the representation of LGBTQ members which is clearly biased and missing certain types, strengthening the stereotypes towards the community. The second one is the problem of carnivalization in Bełkot’s sixth meaning – communication of injustice and the matter of whether in this case carnivalization is not responsible for weakening of the message, and more generally speaking – the seriousness of the predicament of the community.

THE PROBLEM OF REPRESENTATION OF SEXUAL MINORITIES IN JAPANESE MEDIA

Japanese culture has an admittedly long history of homosexual representation, and the entertainers in variety shows quite often belong to the LGBTQ community. To name a few, there is Haruna Ai (new half – the winner of transgender beauty pageant “Miss International Queen 2009”), Kaba-chan (okama, transsexual entertainer and choreographer), Chris Matsumura (gei entertainer and actor, “feminine” gay), Mitz Mangrove (cross-dresser and impersonation artist), Matsuko Deluxe (cross-dresser, essayist and TV personality) and Osugi and Piko (“feminine” gay twin pop-culture critics). Most of these personalities are quite popular and often appear in variety shows. And there are still many new characters who are readily accepted by the seemingly unbiased variety scene. The problem is that many are exactly like them. In the course of my research of variety shows I have not encountered many types that would differ from the aforementioned radically. No high-profile female-to-male transgender entertainers, no openly lesbian TV personalities, no masculine openly gay critics or comedians. Furthermore, the problem is not discussed much, as the
representation is there and, supposedly, there is not much to complain about. Yet at the same time, it is undeniable that certain types are notably absent.

This situation in Japan was harshly commented by Ayako Hattori. While describing the situation of Japanese lesbians, she refers to it as “heterosexism”. She points to some specific aspects of the Japanese social and political system that puts lesbians through constant struggles. To start with, they are virtually non-existent in the culture and this situation is reflected in the language. There are quite a few words for other members of the LGBTQ community in Japanese: *new half* for transgender, *okama* for cross-dressers or *onee (kei)* for feminine gays (alongside the simple *gei*, taken from English ‘gay’). One word to describe lesbians in Japanese might be *onabe*, however that is in most cases restricted to a very masculine type of lesbian or a female-to-male transsexual. The term used by Japanese lesbians to describe themselves is *rezubian*, the Japanese transliteration of English ‘lesbian’. Linda Garber, in turn, comments:

> Far from being an aberration, however, sex between men had been a recognized and thoroughly documented choice for hundreds of years in Japan. A wealth of historical texts and visual art relays the discourse of male sexuality in Japan, where the generic term for male-male eroticism as early as the seventeenth century was *nanshoku*. The “companion term” *joshoku* refers to male “love of females”. (...) So far as I can tell from the English-language sources no parallel terms survive, if they existed, for women’s erotic inclinations.

The language is but a reflection of the Japanese approach to female homosexuality. The absence of positive depiction in popular media is not the cause but rather the effect and the reinforcement of the mentality which is deeply intolerant of lesbians. As Hattori points out, and as far as I have noticed, there are some representations but most of them are either male-oriented and leaning towards pornography or stereotypical and meant to discourage women from living their lives with female partners. Additionally, women who do not have a husband are perceived as just ‘pre-married’, in search of a husband who will provide for them. Effectively, big companies rarely award job positions to women, under the assumption that they will get married and quit soon thereafter. The socialization of women into heterosexuality is so strong that the choice to live one’s life with a female partner becomes virtually invisible. Sure, they are allowed to be visibly affectionate to their friends and even in public it does not raise any red flags. But when it comes to a stable livelihood, the

---

18 A. Hattori, op. cit., p. 6.
19 Ibidem.
problems start to pile up. They have difficulties in finding a stable job and part-time work has little restrictions pertaining to employee protection. Two women might have trouble renting an apartment together, and there are even cases where they need a male guarantor\textsuperscript{20}. They are denied any of the marriage privileges that make up for the stable lives of wives or widows. One might say that gay men who do not get married might have some similar problems. This, however, is not true. Males are placed on a pedestal. They can find good jobs, they can rent places to live in, and sometimes they can even expect to find a wife who will accept their sexuality and the need for sexual release with the opposite sex\textsuperscript{21}. Meanwhile, where the self-worth of males is legitimized just by them being men, the self-esteem of lesbians who are expected to accept their lower status as women is further diminished, not only by them being judged for not starting a family and getting married and the unsure future they look at but also by the biased representations of people of their kind in the media, or no representation whatsoever.

The relatively high number of LGBTQ entertainers in variety shows is, by large, an echo of the “gay boom” (jp. \textit{gei buumu}) Japan experienced in the early 1990s. It was a period during which “film, magazines, and television featured an unprecedented volume of images of gay men, transgendered people, and to lesser extent lesbians”\textsuperscript{22}. Contrary to a natural assumption, it was not instigated by LGBTQ activists; instead, the audience was for the large part heterosexual. Hence, it is not surprising that the contents lacked in gay rights’ postulates and became either a fantasy or a comedy show for the recipients. The strong fetishization of male-male relationship is best reflected in \textit{BL} (Boy’s Love) and \textit{Yaoi} (male homoerotic) \textit{manga} and light novels, the demand for which is stable, if not on the rise. They are usually quite unrealistic and the main characters are \textit{bishounen} (beautiful boys)\textsuperscript{23} which does little good for the actual members of the community. Variety shows, however, host many members of the LGBTQ community and have the potential to become an actual platform for them to speak up. And yet they are still performers and while appearing in that capacity they, often willingly, use and reinforce many stereotypes about themselves. In the view of how the depictions which are the aftermath of the 90s “gay boom” still fulfil one of the two purposes – fulfilling the fantasies of heterosexual audience (including the fantasy of an inclusive society) or serving purposes of entertainment, we are yet again brought back to the subject of carnivalization.

\textsuperscript{20} Ibidem.
\textsuperscript{21} M. McLelland, op. cit., p. 465.
\textsuperscript{22} L. Garber, op. cit., pp. 46–47.
\textsuperscript{23} M. McLelland, op. cit., p. 460.
THE INFLUENCE OF CARNIVALIZATION – A WEAKENED AND TRIVIALIZED MESSAGE?

Why are feminine gay, transgenders or cross-dressers shown in variety shows more often than other representatives of the LGBTQ community? A view of those TV programs as a carnivalized platform for communication might give some answers. Firstly, many of those TV personalities exhibit features characteristic of the Camp aesthetics which share a lot with the aesthetics of carnival. According to Anna Malinowska, “Carnivalization is an inseparable element of Camp practices”\(^\text{24}\). Camp, similarly to carnivalization, has guised itself in different forms; also alike, it fights against the hypocrisy and intellectualization of high arts and blends with the popular landscape, only to appear at certain points in the recipient’s sense of the world. It consciously ties itself to the category and industry of entertainment in order to reveal its tendency to connect marginal and dominant elements.

The main personalities of Camp carry many traits of the carnival characters. They are usually artificial, exaggerated beings, often asexual or carrying attributes of both sexes simultaneously. The more overt the masculine features of an individual, the more visible their feminine qualities become (as well as the other way around). The reason why hermaphrodites are so popular in Camp is because they have become the living essence of its values; they blur certain boundaries, in this case sexual ones, and are not afraid to transgress them. Queerness is a norm in Camp, as it is in carnival, hence the visual aspect of homosexuality and transvestitism (which is responsible for various stereotypes) becomes a frequent expression of its spirit\(^\text{25}\). Carnival is a space for blurring of gender roles and behavioral patterns socially assigned to them. Linda Parys underlines then that “both carnival and drag queen shows” – which she classifies as an expression of Camp aesthetics – “are marked by ambivalence, decorativeness, splendor and an ironic attitude to everyday life”\(^\text{26}\). The factors of entertainment and exaggeration will then be present both in Camp and any carnivalized platform drawing upon its aesthetics, such as Japanese variety TV shows. Hence the statement of gay activist Ito Satoru\(^\text{27}\) that “the lives of ‘ordinary’ gay men tend not to be reported by the media because to feature homosexuals whose daily lives are really no different from heterosexuals does not make interesting programming” is but a description of the natural consequence of such influences, albeit speaking in half-truths on the complexity of the issue.

Carnivalization in Andrzej Bełkot’s sixth meaning is characterized as means of communication of injustice, as carnival itself reveals the injustices through their suspension or inversion. Carnival, as an oppositional view, can help disseminate the main postulates of a revolt, and its ludic and familiar character allow for a more


\(^{26}\) Ibidem, p. 80.

\(^{27}\) In: M. McLelland, op. cit., p. 462.
peaceful communication\textsuperscript{28}. However not all scholars are optimistic about the presence of carnivalization in the contexts of various protests. Maciej Kowalewski believes that carnivalization is responsible for the weakening of protest and leads its participants to forget about the values it communicates\textsuperscript{29}. It lets everybody become a part of the protest and, unfortunately, the entertaining character of carnivalized revolts causes them to lose edge. The ideas and slogans, wide ranges of symbols, even the main personalities of the protest can be pulled into what often becomes a festival of fun and games. Thus, there is a high risk that they will lose their revolutionary allure and, at the same time, the persuasive power.

Variety shows give the members of the LGBTQ community in Japan more exposure than any other TV genre. However, the very rules of that genre might have the same effect on their communication and fight for acceptance as Kowalewski describes carnivalization to have over protest. Drawing upon the Camp aesthetics, the representatives of sexual minorities are depicted as eccentric, exaggerated beings, which hardly gives them any chance to show themselves as regular members of society. Inadvertently, they contribute to the stereotypes about their community. The fact that a lot of such entertainers willingly become the topic of jokes might give the viewers from outside the LGBTQ community the impression that it should be okay were they to make fun of its members. They become “gay\textsuperscript{30} monsters”\textsuperscript{31} – entities who are liked for their queerness but mainly viewed as somewhat amusing, yet in a way pitiful.

When it comes to appearing as models for the viewers struggling with their sexuality, yet another issue comes into the picture. More than once have I encountered a situation where the entertainers openly admit that they hide their nature in everyday life or laugh about all the work they have to put in to look “the part” on TV. Haruna Ai – \textit{new half} commented the appearance of cross-dressing impersonation artist Mitz Mangrove in one of variety shows:

\begin{quote}
Haruna Ai: If you’re \textit{onee}, you have to try harder. For example, Mitz, you know? Sometimes when she pulls her hair back and you don’t look real hard, she looks like Tokumitsu-san\textsuperscript{32} in women’s clothing. That’s why I’m telling you, you have to put make-up on the sides of your face, like baby hair, see, then it looks smaller and rounder, I do that, look…
Mitsu Mangrove: Yeah, and when she sweats, she sweats black.
\end{quote}

The entire conversation was aimed at getting laughs (and achieved that goal) but we can see that while Haruna Ai identifies herself as \textit{onee} and finds herself to be in the same group as her colleagues, she represents a stereotype: a transsexual who is shallow and focused only on appearances.

\textsuperscript{29} M. Kowalewski, op. cit., p. 216.
\textsuperscript{30} Please note that in this case the word ‘gay’ is equivalent to ‘happy’.
\textsuperscript{31} M. M. Bakhtin, \textit{Rabelais and His World}, Bloomington 1984, p. 156.
\textsuperscript{32} 74-year-old Japanese announcer and presenter for Nippon Terebi and TBS, Mitz Mangrove’s uncle.
A different undermining effect of using variety shows as means of communication of sexual minorities is that switching gender roles is also viewed as simply an interesting embodiment of carnivalistic turnarounds (as it has been throughout the history of carnival) – effectively, it is also used by other groups. An example for that tendency might be the show *Gakkou e Ikou Max* where dressing young boys in girls’ attire becomes a game and a means of tricking celebrities. In one of the episodes the boys themselves comment it to be “an interesting experience” while expressing their content at the attention they are given. The show might be entertaining but it is questionable whether getting attention will not become associated as the main motivation for everyone who dresses against the expected attire for their biological sex, including transsexuals, and even transgenders.

In another show we can watch a confession of a transsexual Kaba-chan:

> I usually dress like you guys do [the male band hosting the show]. Jeans or something. I’m actually quite jealous [of Haruna Ai who has changed her sex and therefore appears as new half], I would like to go out dressed as a woman. Somehow I don’t have the courage…

This statement is one of many members’ of the *okama* group who are cross-dressers or transsexuals but do not manifest it in everyday life. One could argue that it gives a ready model which advertises “staying in the closet”. That mentality is quite present in Japan already, albeit probably not only for that reason. It might, however, contribute to the weakening of the LGBTQ community’s rights movement all the same. Already some who could support it declare that being gay is a private issue, not to be shared with others, so they will not join the movement for that reason. Others who do not support the movement activities say that one cannot do anything about one’s sexual orientation, so they feel like there is no reason to fight for any specific rights. People who “resist the fetishization of sexual object choice both by gay organizations as well as society at large, and insist on being viewed simply as people, stressing that their same-sex attraction is not especially unusual or different” make up yet another group. As I have described earlier, lesbians often have to struggle with their self-worth and many do not have the confidence to live true to their sexuality or fail to even notice such a choice. The same situation can be seen when it comes to bisexuals; relatively few claim bisexuality as a long-lasting identity and their sexuality is often viewed as a sexual deviation, ultimately pushing them into building their lives

---

36 M. McLelland, op. cit., p. 466.
37 Ibidem.
38 Ibidem, p. 467.
in heterosexual relationships. Surprisingly, there are even more reasons for giving up the fight for LGBTQ’s rights than for “staying in the closet”. McLelland notices that “media directed at women in Japan, including women’s magazines and movies, often present gay men as preferable marriage partners for straight women because gay men, considered to be ‘feminine’ are understood as more sympathetic to women and their subordinated position in Japanese society”\(^{40}\). As women make the conscious decision to marry such men, they often feel like they have to forgive their sexual “acting out” with other men. Many gay men are then pushed into marriages they don’t even understand to be deceptive, bisexuals “make their choice” to be with a partner of opposite sex, lesbians have their voices taken away by the society and transsexuals are treated as a topic for jokes or part of a “freak show”. That is the negative, or questionable side of the media in general and specifically variety shows’ influence.

THE POSITIVE

The picture painted by my analysis might seem quite depressing and pessimistic. The presence of the representatives of the LGBTQ community in the media in this way, however, does not only have negative effects. To the contrary, one of the positive aspects of the 1990s “gay boom” is that “in creating a market for gay-themed material it also opened space for material created by gay men and lesbians themselves”\(^{41}\). Additionally, it has a positive tone in increasing the visibility of the group in general. They are shown in a peaceful, entertaining context which can serve to diminish apprehension towards them in society. Moreover, even the inaccurate depictions may serve as fuel for discussion of the errors and be a trigger for many to get acquainted with the actual state of affairs. It is of great importance to build awareness that what is communicated through variety shows is not the reality of lesbians, gays, transgenders, transsexuals, cross-dressers, or drag queens in Japan. Due to the carnivalization present in this medium, it is somewhat separated from everyday life. Lesbians and bisexuals are notably absent, gay men, transsexuals and transgenders are jesterized. Maybe it is a reflection of the way the society views the community. But maybe it is a means that socializes them to think that way. It may be both. Yet at the same time, I found out far more about the LGBTQ members from Japanese variety shows than any mainstream media in Poland. And while their situation is still clearly difficult, in the view of the new law of Shibuya ward, offering partnership certificates to same-sex couples (since April 1, 2015), one can hope that their needs are gradually becoming noticed, hopefully to become as visible in the public discourse as their comrades in variety shows.

\(^{40}\) Ibidem, p. 465.

\(^{41}\) L. Garber, op. cit., p. 46.
Sources

Multimedia

Gakkou e ikou Max!, 22.04.2008 [Tokyo Broadcasting System].

Bibliography

The article discusses the problem of communication of the LGBTQ community in Japan by means of variety shows. Drawing on Mikhail Bakhtin’s theory of carnival and carnivalization, the programs are viewed as a carnivalized medium. Certain features of Japanese social system are pointed out in order to shed light on the contrasts revealed between the reality of everyday life and the said form. In the context of the LGBTQ community, the paper discusses two main problems which impair its fight for acceptance and for rights of its members. This is viewed, to a point, as an effect of the carnivalization of variety shows. The first issue concerns the way of selection of the members who represent the community it in these shows. The article discusses the absence of certain types of representatives in the media, while recalling the general public’s approach to certain groups of sexual minorities in Japan and their situation. The second problem focuses on the trivialization of the LGBTQ’s communication in variety shows and the responsibility LGBTQ entertainers may have in the reinforcement of stereotypes about their own community. The author also considers the relation between carnival and Camp aesthetics. In view of their influence on the analyzed TV programs, the author tries to draw a connection between them and the broadly understood misrepresentations of LGBTQ in variety shows, as well as its members’ autoperception and others’ perception of them in everyday life.
The primary purpose of this article is to present and briefly characterize popular American late night program *The Daily Show* (further referred as *TDS*) on US TV channel Comedy Central and its host in years 1999–2015, outstanding TV personality and “fake news reporter” (as he tends to call himself) – Jon Stewart. Bringing closer the figure of Stewart and the formula of his show may allow us to take a more comprehensive look at a specific section of contemporary American television, the so-called *infotainment*. According to Oxford Dictionary, *infotainment* means “broadcast material which is intended both to entertain and to inform”, a term originated in the 1980s implying “a blend of information and entertainment”\(^1\). The Oxford Advanced Learner’s Dictionary in turn defines it synonymously as “television programmes, etc. that present news and serious subjects in an entertaining way”.\(^2\) Using Neil Postman’s *Amusing Ourselves to Death* (1985), selected video clips from *TDS* website\(^3\) and numerous publications addressing this issue, I will try to defend the observation that Stewart’s program does not fit to the rather pessimistic vision demonstrated by Postman. It rather represents a completely new quality which can be described as “reflective” *infotainment*.

* * *

In his groundbreaking yet controversial book *Amusing Ourselves to Death* (1985) Neil Postman – expanding some of the concepts made by his mentor and great predecessor, Marshal McLuhan\(^4\) – argued that the most characteristic feature of modern-day

---

\(^1\) See: http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/infotainment [29.09.2015].


\(^4\) Among which the most recognizable is his famous remark that “the medium is the message”, for example see: R. K. Logan, *Understanding New Media: Extending Marshall McLuhan*, pp. 353–354, New York 2010.
TV is its ability to convert certain substance (including hard news usually relating to essential public life issues such as politics, education, culture or religion) into “pure entertainment”\(^5\). He underlines the discontinuity and dumbfounding transiency of modern-day television coverage. The daily evening newscast usually consists of several dynamically changing segments on different, mostly grotesquely unrelated topics. Domestic, local and international stories are usually succeeded (and in some of the cases even preceded\(^6\)) by celebrity gossips, sports reports, weather forecasts and often finished with light-weight trivia. The whole transmission is frequently interrupted by commercials or unexpected “breaking news”. Length of a single message cannot exceed 90 seconds so as not to bore the audience. “The phrase serious television is a contradiction in terms”\(^7\) – concludes Postman. Although the term infotainment is not mentioned in Amusing Ourselves to Death, its author aptly diagnosed the condition of contemporary news media. Even if American TV differed significantly in 1985 than thirty years later (the enormous rise of commercial cable and satellite stations, like HBO, AMC, Showtime, FX surrounded by streaming media providers: Netflix, Amazon or Yahoo, is one of the many examples), Postman managed to anticipate the most actual and threatening disorders of today. Due to its overwhelming, all-embracing presence in the news media factor, infotainment has become a mayor subject of critical investigations, especially in the field of communication studies, which resulted in a serious amount of books and academic articles published in recent years\(^8\). This trend also applies to TDS, its “sister-shows”: The Colbert Report, Nightly Show with Larry Wilmore, Last Week Tonight with John Oliver and “competitors” such as Saturday Night Live or non-existent MADtv. The essence of these TV programs, influence they have on viewers, their authors’ perception of media and politics in general as well as their specific view on certain issues (financial recession, evolution, global warming, LGBT issues and others) are being analyzed with similar discernment. Influential institutions like Annenberg Public Policy Institute or Pew Research Center for the People and the Press employ large national surveys focused on TDS\(^9\) (and other similar productions). Involved in


\(^6\) Perhaps the CNN Headline News lead story from February 2, 2004, about the infamous Superbowl XXXVIII halftime show in which Janet Jackson’s breast was exposed by Justin Timberlake during their cameo (the so called nipplegate) followed-up by a breaking news update informing that ricin had been found in the mailroom of Bill First, incumbent Senate majority leader, seems to be a particularly illustrative example, see: B. M. Anderson, News Flash: Journalism, Infotainment, and the Bottom-Line Business of Broadcast News, San Francisco 2004, p. 1.

\(^7\) N. Postman, op. cit., p. 80.

\(^8\) To mention Bonnie Anderson’s News Flash released in 2004 and Daya Kishan Thussu’s News as Entertainment. The Rise of Global Infotainment from 2007 – both follow the traces left by Postman, although direct reference to Amusing Ourselves to Death appears only in the second one.

this matter are mostly social scientists, arranging quantitative researches in order to formulate some general conclusions, along with more humanist-oriented scholars, using divergent interpretative tools and strategies, such as already cited Postman’s understanding of TV news as entertainment. I will try to make use of some of these findings, at least fragmentarily, in the further part of the article.

In response to a widespread misunderstanding, Andrew Postman insists in his introduction to the 20th anniversary edition of *Amusing Ourselves to Death* (2005) that his father “was not a curmudgeon (…) nor did not he fear TV across the board (as some thought)”\(^{10}\). Neil Postman indeed was impressed by technological advancement of television, “the all-but-imperceivable residue of the electronic big bang of a century past”\(^{11}\). He appreciated its public availability, and saw nothing wrong or threatening in the so-called “junk television” — including two NBC productions: action-adventure series *The A-Team* or comedy *Cheers*\(^{12}\) — if it does not try to be something different than it really is, i.e.: “pure entertainment”:

> Our television set keeps us in constant communion with the world, but it does so with a face whose smiling countenance is unalterable. The problem is not that television presents us with entertaining subject matter but that all subject matter is presented as entertaining, which is another issue altogether\(^{13}\).

Troubles begin when something that is ”junk” pretends to be gold. In this situation we are surely able to “amuse ourselves to death”.

* * *

Since 1999 — when Jon Stewart, former host of short-lived MTV *The Jon Stewart Show*, took over the lead from Craig Kilborn and converted the previous talk-show & celebrity news oriented format of *TDS* into more political direction – it seems to look as ”junk” version of professional ”hard news” daytime/evening programs broadcast by public TV channels, like *CBS/NBC Evening News, ABC Nightline, PBS News-Hour*, and those emitted by 24-hour cable news stations: CNN, MSNBC, CNBC or FOX News. However, as I tend to prove it subsequently, this first impression should be viewed as misleading. Even though Jon Stewart describes *TDS* as “fake news” and himself as “fake news reporter”, the show is still news in some way or, as Geoffrey Baym calls it, “an experiment in journalism”\(^{14}\) and Stewart remains a reporter.


\(^{11}\) Ibidem, p. 79.

\(^{12}\) Ibidem, p. 160.

\(^{13}\) Ibidem, p. 87.

Szymon Pietrzykowski, *Making Politics and TV News Entertaining: Jon Stewart’s…*

(according to 2009 TIME Magazine readers’ poll – a very trusted one\textsuperscript{15}). Aside from interviews with invited guests and musical appearances (mandatory part of practically every late-night show nowadays), he spends most of the airtime commenting, mainly in irreverent, sarcastic tone, the most important news of the passing day. Bearing in mind that the commentary material is almost wholly delivered by above-mentioned TV newscasts, it provides a perfect opportunity to pinpoint or ridicule certain omissions, understatements and other wrongdoings aired on another channels. Hmielowski, Holbert and Lee include pointing out or highlighting incongruent information as one of the four potential dimensions of an individual’s affinity for political humor\textsuperscript{16}. On the other hand, the reliance on external sources may easily be a double-edged sword. If their producers decide to aim more attention on some trivial celebrity story than another tragic incident in Iraq or Afghanistan, it is highly probable that it will not appear also in Stewart’s list of things to screen and comment.

There are two further elements in *TDS* that imitate (and mock) ordinary news programs. The first one is the usage of various graphic data presentations. The graphics – which in regular programs often overwhelm the content or distract viewers’ attention from its essence – effectively correspond here with the satirical character of conveyed message. The headlines emerging right next to Stewart rely on ridiculously funny word plays and pop-cultural references. For example: the fiercely debated removal of the Confederate Flag from the South Carolina statehouse ground was accompanied by a graphic depicting mentioned flag with a vintage, 1980s inscription *Flagdance* familiar to the logo from the 1983 movie *Flashdance*\textsuperscript{17}. The second element(s) are the “senior correspondents” – Stewart’s co-workers who “parody their good-looking but sometimes ill-informed network counterparts”\textsuperscript{18}. Each episode contains at least one segment in which Stewart invites them to speak about deliberated matter. Like in “authentic” media, each of *TDS* stuff member, has his/her own title, sometimes mimicking those that actually are in use: Senior (Investigate) Foreign Correspondent (Jason Jones), Senior International Correspondent (Trevor Noah\textsuperscript{19}), White House Correspondent (Rob Corddry), Senior Meteorologist (Aisif

\textsuperscript{16} The three remaining ones are: humor contributing to a sense of superiority; the use of humor to relieve stress or anxiety; the ability of humor to facilitate interpersonal relationships, see: J. D. Hmielowski, R. L. Holbert, J. Lee, *Predicting the Consumption of Political TV Satire: Affinity for Political Humor, ‘The Daily Show’, and ‘The Colbert Report’*, “Communication Monographs”, March 2011, Vol. 78, No 1, pp. 100–102.
\textsuperscript{19} Starting from September 28, 2015 Trevor Noah will replace Jon Stewart as *The Daily Show* host.
Mandvi); most times referring to the field they are reporting on in a wittily exaggerated or politically incorrect way, i.e.: “Senior Playstationologist”, “Faith and Values Correspondent”, “Senior Gay Correspondent”. Besides acting as self-proclaimed experts (“Senior [fill-in-the-blank] Correspondents”\textsuperscript{20}), they host or participate in original reporting segments under satirical recurring titles. Among many of them especially noteworthy are: \textit{InDecision X} which follows the most important events of each election year\textsuperscript{21}; \textit{Mess O’Potamia} featuring events in Iraq after the 2003 US invasion\textsuperscript{22} and \textit{Crisis in Israfghyianonanaq} of similar character (its title is a portmanteau containing Israel, Afghanistan, Syria, Lebanon, Iran and Iraq\textsuperscript{23}); \textit{America Freaks Out} which parodies the nationwide hysteria on security issues beginning with 9/11 2001\textsuperscript{24}; in \textit{Are You Prepared?!}, \textit{America Freaks Out} spin-off Samantha Bee assess whether Americans are prepared for a potential catastrophe; Steve Carell and Stephen Colbert, two hosts of now-defunct \textit{Even Stepven} “discuss major issues and instead litter their debate with issues, rancor, and attacks”\textsuperscript{25}, by this means mocking current political talk-shows, such as CNN \textit{Crossfire}.

In their exchange of comments, Stewart takes the “traditional satirist’s role of skeptical and bemused observer”\textsuperscript{26} whilst the correspondent “often makes the jokes, albeit showing straight face”, showing signs of ignorance or willful misrepresentation leaving Stewart even more clueless than he was at the beginning. As claimed by Judith Barad, the fact that practically everyone can be named as “expert” or “senior correspondent” on any subject “tears off the masks of arrogance and self-deception, which ignorance to masquerade as wisdom and knowledge”\textsuperscript{27}. Nevertheless, aside playing fools, the “correspondents” are able to fool their numerous interviewers who often claim to know a lot about certain matter or to reveal the matter as foolish – a frequent circumstance in the so-called Larry Wilmore/John Oliver Investigations or Jason Jones interviews with foreign/domestic activists or politicians. They experience innumerable “failures”: John Oliver did not succeed, for example, to convince the gun rights lobbyist Phillip Van Cleave that effective gun control can lead to a significant decrease in a number of mass shooting accidents, as it happened in Australia


\textsuperscript{21} The presidential race between Barack Obama and Mitt Romney was labeled as \textit{Democalypse 2012}, a close reference to the Mayan Calendar announcing the end of the world on December 22, 2012, see: #\textit{Democalypse 2012}, http://www.cc.com/topics/36mbog/democalypse-2012 [29.09.2015].


\textsuperscript{24} See: #\textit{America Freaks Out}, http://www.cc.com/search?keywords=america+freaks+out [29.09.2015].


\textsuperscript{27} J. Barad, \textit{Stewart and Socrates: Speaking Truth to Power} [in:] \textit{’The Daily Show’ and Philosophy}, p. 73.
since 1996. Van Cleave, who stubbornly insisted on the Second Amendment from 1791 providing the right to keep and bear arms as “sacrosanct”\textsuperscript{28} guarantee of civic freedom, described the Australian experiment as a “whoop-de-do”\textsuperscript{29} and remained immune to Oliver’s further argumentation.

This particular interview may resemble, to a certain extent, the manner in which Stewart and his staff characterize various responses towards LGBT rights movement analyzed by C. Wesley Buerkle. In his article he uses Kenneth Burke’s poetic categories through which the society reacts to miscellaneous socio-political crises and turbulences\textsuperscript{30}. Burke distinguishes three mayor types of reactions: acceptance, rejection and transition\textsuperscript{31}, to which correspond eight subcategories, more commonly known as frames or attitudes: the epic, tragedy, comedy, elegy, satire, burlesque, grotesque and didactic\textsuperscript{32}. Each of them can be adjusted to one of the three prevailing groups, for instance both rejection and acceptance can be “told” in a comedic manner. Buerkle concludes that the general position of TDS cast in relation to queer issues is positive and supportive, although sometimes they happen to duplicate, deliberately or not, some stereotypical clichés. This demonstrates how “volatile” the nature of their humor can be\textsuperscript{33}. With regard to the tension that some people are associating with the emancipation of LGBT community, dominant frames in the footages concerning those issues are comedy and burlesque. According to Buerkle, TDS correspondents and Stewart himself (so the people who chose the acceptance strategy) in the way they approach various rejecters refer to the rhetorical figures of a “fool/clown” (align with the comedic frame) and a “buffoon” (frequent component of burlesque). In relation to the first one, comedy “offers redemption rather than seeking the destruction of the unsalvageable so long as the target of ridicule demonstrates worthiness of redemption”\textsuperscript{34}. Stewart & co. do believe that rational exchange of arguments might change their views and soothe most fears. As mentioned by Burkle:

\begin{quote}
The buffoon, unlike the clown, receives no sympathy for wrongdoing [I allow myself to interpret it as other person’s patience and understanding – SZ. P.], so banishment becomes the only option (…). The reductionism of the burlesque response dismisses the need to consider the motivation for bad behavior; it desires to see nothing more than the external features and exploit those flaws to their fullest\textsuperscript{35}.
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{28} See: Gun Control Whoop-de-doo [00:25], http://www.cc.com/video-clips/hs2p8t/the-daily-show-with-jon-stewart-gun-control-whoop-de-doo [29.09.2015].
\textsuperscript{29} Ibidem [02:41].
\textsuperscript{32} Ibidem, p. 34–91.
\textsuperscript{33} C. W. Buerkle, op. cit., pp. 195, 200–201.
\textsuperscript{34} Ibidem, p. 193.
\textsuperscript{35} Ibidem.
What is equally important, the audience feels a closer affinity with a fool/clown than a buffoon, thus the latter easily becomes a target of “conscienceless abandon”\(^ {36}\). After several spectacularly failed attempts to undertake discussion, TDS staffers have decided to accept the irreformability of their interlocutors and to accent it by showing it (and them) publicly.

Coming back to the Oliver-Van Cleave interview, I assume it can serve as an example of progressive switch of Oliver’s attitude towards his guest. TDS correspondent, “armed” with a proven political reference (“which America decided to ignore”\(^ {37}\)), perhaps may truly believe that he will manage to alter his opponent’s opinion. But after some time Oliver switches his strategy from comedy to burlesque and Phillip Van Cleave is treated more like a “buffoon” than just a “fool” or a “clown”. “If guns aren’t the problem,” Oliver asks in the final question, “then what is the problem?”. “People” – instantly answers Van Cleave. “You know what,” Oliver quickly retorts, “after spending a great amount of time with you, Philip, I’m starting to believe that that’s partially true”\(^ {38}\). The audience burst into laughter, while the lobbyist did not get the irony in Oliver’s comment. In opposition to Postman’s famous remark, it should be assumed then that the mayor function of presented skit – and enormous number of other TDS contents – is not solely limited to deliver “pure entertainment” watched by its recipients with a “kind of idiot’s delight”\(^ {39}\). In fact, it is something (much) more than that.

* * *

In his book *Berlin Cabaret* (1993), on Berliner satirical clubs during the Weimar Republic era, Peter Jelovic distinguishes two forms of “cabarets”. Whilst *Cabaret* is a common term that indicates strip shows, burlesques, stand-ups and other lowbrow comedic appearances, *Kabarett* (written with K and ended with double T) is “reserved for social criticism or political satire”. These terms were used interchangeably in German language during years 1918–1933 and became differentiated since the end of the II World War\(^ {40}\). In the article ‘*Cabaret* and Antifascist Aesthetics’ – referring to Bob Fosse’s movie from 1972 – Steven Belletto assigns to the first category the “decadent”, “hedonist” Sally Bowles (Liza Minnelli) who on the verge of the future Nazi regime remains consistently indifferent towards “the real world of war and politics”\(^ {41}\), wherein the figure of Emcee, played by Joel Gray, whose numbers “are characterized by ambiguity, irony, and uneasiness”\(^ {42}\) belongs to the second

---

\(^{36}\) Ibidem.

\(^{37}\) See: *Australia & Gun Control Aftermath* [00:15].

\(^{38}\) Ibidem [05:41–05:59].

\(^{39}\) N. Postman, op. cit., p. 99.


\(^{42}\) Ibidem, p. 609.
one. Using these features as his working tools, Emcee successfully ridicules the fascist ideological and aesthetic order based, among others, on anti-Semitism, racial supremacy or strict social control with zero tolerance for any differences or acts of disagreement.

If it seems that the current political life and its media coverage look like *Cabaret*, then *TDS* will be Kit Kat Klub where Jon Stewart and his “Senior Correspondents” star as Emcees, doing their *Kabarett* on every weekday from Monday to Thursday. Stephan Richter states an assumption that “there indeed is something ominously Weimaresque about the rise of Jon Stewart”43. Stewart’s sharp, politically-edged humor is parallel to the one used by pre-war cabaret performers, especially in the late 20s/early 30s, and this specific fact, if enough attention is paid to existing historical experience, “may signify bad news for the United States – and the world as a whole”44. Even if Richter’s allusion sounds convincing and finds support in Katherine Tren dacosta’s words concerning the segment *Mess O’Potamia* (“As things go from bad to worse, *TDS* went from good to brilliant”45), it is difficult, however, to find close similarities between Weimar Republic and George W. Bush presidency. Unlike Germany in 1933, the American democracy after 2001 remains stable, despite certain limitations in consequence of 9/11 and the subsequent “War on Terror” (ironically deconstructed in *America Freaks Out* segment) or more structural problems like low voter turnout or declining participation in deliberative democracy (which – according to *America: A Citizen’s Guide to Democracy Inaction*, a textbook parody written by *TDS* crew – can lead to a “Constitutional Robocracy”46). The coming of the Obama administration did not mark the “end of history”. Conversely, another tension in the Middle East, this time related with ISIS, forced Stewart to resurrect *Mess O’Potamia/Crisis in Israfghyianonanaq* segment in 201447. He continually criticizes various absurdities in politics or media and harshly opposes when freedom of speech (and other human rights) are being broken, as in the case of Bassem Youssef – host of the Egyptian TV show *Al-Bernameg*, very much inspired by *TDS* – who was arrested in 2013 simply for poking fun at incumbent president Mohammad Mursi48.

44 Ibidem.
If Jon Stewart’s voice may be heard as Cassandric – in a way that resemble Weimar cabarets or Karl Kraus (1874–1936), Austrian journalist of Jewish origin, creator and chief editor of satirical magazine Die Fackel (The Torch), for whom feuilleton-writing constituted a true form of art\(^{49}\) and who remained one of the very few people in the interwar Vienna that managed to keep open-minded facing the rise of fascism in Austria and Germany – it is not because of politics and/or politicians. It is mostly due to the modern news media which alarming condition was aptly diagnosed by Postman. Using heavy “armory” (satire, irony, parody, wordplays, graphic visuals, slapstick, rants, self-deprecation, dress-ups, impressions and others) Stewart effectively ridicules its major shortcomings, including mediocrity and commercialism. He does it in the most efficient and witty way: through laughter. Taking advantage from TDS “fake news” character and his position as America’s leading political satirist, Stewart is able to do things the more “professional” newscasters are not allowed to do. Brian Williams, former host of NBC Nightly News, understands this accordingly: “Many of us on this side of journalism track often wish we were on Jon’s side,” he says. “I envy his platform to shout from the mountaintop. He’s a necessary branch of government”\(^{50}\).

From time to time Stewart decides, however, to abandon his usually comedic tone and to tackle some issues more seriously or undertakes certain initiatives that go far beyond a 20-minute TV show\(^{51}\). In his 2004 appearance on Crossfire he criticized the show’s excessively confrontational formula “You’re doing theater when you should be doing politics,” he turns to bewildered hosts, Tucker Carlson and Paul Begala, who, expecting a completely different attitude from Stewart, did not find any reasonable arguments to refute this accusation\(^{52}\). In consequence, CNN authorities agreed with Stewart’s opinion and decided to remove Crossfire from channel’s schedule. On October 30, 2010, Stewart and Colbert organized a public gathering in Washington, DC entitled The Rally to Restore Sanity and/or Fear. This event was designed as a direct response to Restoring Honor Rally held on August 28, 2010 by conservative radio and FOX News commentator Glenn Beck. In a more general sense, it can be presumed as opposition against a worrying tendency which Terrance MacMullan described as removal of intellectuals from American public sphere (including television)\(^{53}\). In recent years, MacMullan notices, various writers, philosophers, publicists and others, individuals with enormous theoretical wisdom and seeking for truth, have been


\(^{50}\) Ch. Smith, *America is a Joke*, http://nymag.com/arts/tv/profiles/68086/index1.html [29.09.2015].


\(^{52}\) See: the whole transcript of this interview: http://edition.cnn.com/TRANSCRIPTS/0410/15/cf.01.html [29.09.2015].

replaced by TV pundits like already mentioned Beck, Bill O’Reilly or Sean Hannity who exchanged truth for “truthiness” – a new word invented by Stephen Colbert which means “a quality characterizing a truth that a person making an argument or assertion claims to know intuitively from the gut or because it feels right without regard to evidence, logic, intellectual examination, or facts”\textsuperscript{54}. Stewart’s and Colbert’s rally highlights (in a clever, humorous way) the necessity of bringing back the former clarity of essential concepts: truth-lie, good-evil. What is more, Stewart expressed himself artistically and politically several times. In 2014 he released a feature movie entitled \textit{Rosewater}\textsuperscript{55} based on the story of Maziar Bahari, Iranian journalists arrested after he gave an interview to Jason Jones in 2009\textsuperscript{56}. He actively supported signing a special legislation providing healthcare to September 11 responders, later known as James Zartoga 9/11 Health and Compensation Act of 2010, named after NYPD officer who was involved in the rescue and recovery actions near Ground Zero and died of a respiratory disease in 2006\textsuperscript{57}.

In Jon Stewart’s case there is indeed a longing for old-days bravery and professionalism in the news media, hidden behind the mask of comedy and “fake news” reporting. Hosting the Oscars in 2006, he praised \textit{Good Night and Good Luck}, George Clooney’s movie about a dissident radio and TV broadcaster opposing to Senator Joseph McCarthy’s anti-Communist witch hunting, and Bennett Miller’s \textit{Capote} by saying: “Both films about determined journalists defying obstacles in the relentless pursuit for the truth. Needless to say, both are period pieces”\textsuperscript{58}, he added immediately. Stewart tries not to limit his activity solely to pointing out other people’s errors and making fun of them – he notices the positives, thereby denying the tendency observed by Jakob Norberg in Karl Kraus’s writings, mainly that one of his main objectives as a satirist was to completely purge the world he criticized\textsuperscript{59}. For example: in the way in which ABC News reporter Martha Raddatz was moderating the 2012 VP debate between Joe Biden and Paul Ryan – forcing them to recognize their failures, catching up numerous understatements and bullshit-talks they committed during


\textsuperscript{59} J. Norberg, op. cit., p. 41.
its course, frequently asking for a more specific response – Stewart saw a rare example of journalistic excellence. In a thematic segment Raddatz luminescent portrait dazzles Stewart who expresses his astonishment: “I don’t know what it was but it was amazing! The lost language of journalism being spoken on modern television! (…) I thought this craft had been completely forgotten. Why can every chair be made like this...”60. Stewart himself seems to be an idealist61 dressed in jester’s clothes.

In conclusion, TDS mayor purpose is to present politics and TV news in an entertaining way, although – contrary to Neil Postman’s view on the nature of television – “pure entertainment” is not everything that it offers. The extensive national survey arranged during the 2004 election links the biggest turnout among young voters under 30 in more than a decade with a grooving popularity of TDS (and analogous comedic formats)62 as news sources, in particular for viewers in the specified age category, somehow confirms Stewart’s ever-growing ambitions and capabilities not only to ridicule but also to transform the surrounding media and political reality (expressed in several manifestations outside TDS studio). The new situation in which the now former TDS host is regarded as one of the most trusted public personas entails a whole range of new obligations and responsibilities which, as I believe, Stewart is able to bear. By speaking unseriously (but not trivially, in most of the cases) about usually very serious matters – politics and the condition of present-day media are among the most debated ones – TDS indeed offers a new, refreshing quality in contemporary news media. Because its producers and contributors do not avoid social criticism and occasionally demonstrate signs of perhaps naïve idealism, it is possible to consider this show as a model example of “reflective” infotainment.

**BIBLIOGRAPHY**


SUMMARY

With Jon Stewart as its host in years 1999–2015, The Daily Show, late-night TV program aired on Comedy Central, has quickly become a pop culture phenomenon and Stewart himself – one of the most recognizable faces on US television. As stated in the title of this paper, the main purpose of Stewart and his co-workers is to present politics and TV news in a funny, entertaining way, although delivering “pure entertainment” (in which Neil Postman, influential American culture critic, saw a dominant trend in modern-day electronic media) is not the essence of their work. I attempt to demonstrate that besides its generally comedic tone – Stewart defines the formula of his show as “fake news” and the program’s cast as “fake reporters” – The Daily Show offers refreshing, politically critical content. Therefore it seems legitimate to characterize The Daily Show as “reflective” infotainment and to locate Stewart close to tradition of Karl Kraus and Weimar Kabarett performers.
NAVY BLUES: HOW CONTEMPORARY AMERICAN SAILORS’ WIVES COPE WITH SEPARATION OR LOSING THEIR Husbands TO SEA BY FINDING SUPPORT ON THE INTERNET

Chair for Translation Studies and Intercultural Communication,
Jagiellonian University
Department of Linguistics, University of California, Berkeley

INTRODUCTION

Sailing has been deeply rooted in American culture from the very beginnings of its formation. However, searching for new lands or opportunities has its price: separation. Whether it is temporary or permanent, separation affects both sailors and their families. How do sailors’ wives navigate through the complex emotions that occur when their husbands’ ships set sail?

The expression “navy blues”, taken from the Los Angeles Times article on women coping with separation¹, evokes two associations related by two different meanings of the one word – “blues”. On the one hand, it denotes the color of the uniforms sailors wear or the color of the ocean, and on the other hand, it pertains to the emotions that a woman may experience after her husband leaves. This paper will thus tackle the different types of longing, grieving, and the deployment syndrome. This will serve as a background for the analysis of the Internet resources available to women who seek help with these issues.

The aims of the paper are therefore to investigate the sources of psychological support for contemporary American sailors’ wives and widows accessible on the Internet and to present representative examples of such along with some feedback from the users. Hopefully, the article should also become a voice in the general discussion of the use of modern technology, with special emphasis on the Internet, as a source of help and support.

SAILORS’ WIVES AND WIDOWS

Contemporary American sailors work mainly in the navy, trade, or tourism. The focus of this paper will be the situation of the sailors from the United States Navy which was established in 1775. As of 6 November 2013, the personnel on active duty amounted to 323,951 individuals. The Navy Training or Deployment Cycle consists of intermediate and advanced training phases, deployment, maintenance availability, and reconstitution. Depending on the type of operation force, the deployment’s length will be different, and it lasts several months on average.

According to USA Today, as of 23 June 2010, there were 13.6 million widows in the United States. Among them, many have lost their husbands to sea, which is tackled in this paper.

MISSING VS. GRIEVING

There is a variety of emotions that women may experience once their husbands are away or, in the worst scenario, are never coming back. The most predominant one is longing – “(...) a phenomenon that involves an intense wish to remove the physical, mental or spiritual distance which separates the self from anyone or anything deemed desirable”.

McGraw, a philosophy professor, suggests that there are three types of longing: yearning, missing, and grieving. What distinguishes them is their character and the types of consequences that might follow. In missing there is a possibility of re-establishing shared intimacy. In yearning there has been no union; one hopes to establish it in the future. In contrast, a grieving person “ultimately gives up any »earthly« hope of reunion” since the loved one has passed away. This discussion will focus specifically on missing and grieving.

John H. Sklare, a personal coach, differentiates between healthy and unhealthy missing. A healthy way of missing is when a person feels “a bit lost and lonely” or their “heart aches slightly”, yet it does not impede on her everyday activity. The unhealthy

---

8 Ibidem, p. 39.
missing involves much more intensive and more painful emotions the weight of which is so dire they render the missing party unable to perform day-to-day tasks.

It is worth noting, however, that both types of missing refer to temporary separation. Separation caused by divorce or death brings a slightly different range of emotions called grief. It is a natural and highly personal way of reacting to any type of loss. Although common, it varies from person to person in its length, intensity or complexity.\(^10\)

**THE DEPLOYMENT SYNDROME**

Does absence really make the heart grow fonder? Major Riggs, an Iraq war veteran who is now a religious-support resource manager, writes:

> Marriage will succeed or fail based on everything you do before a deployment. If you have a strained marriage, the deployment will have a greater adverse impact. Absence will only make the heart grow fonder if you have a strong marriage to begin with.\(^11\)

What women are likely to experience after their husbands’ departure may be called the deployment syndrome, popularly called the “navy blues” or the “cruise blues”\(^12\). It can be applied to both women and men; however, women are bound to experience forced separation far more often, which may result of the higher number of men in the navy.\(^13\) Inadvertently, women are thrust into a “continual cycle of arrival and departure”\(^14\). Hagmark-Cooper, a PhD in maritime history, compares the syndrome to the change of seasons: the preparation for the sailor’s departure (fall), the husband’s absence (winter), the preparation for the man’s return (spring), and the reunion (summer)\(^15\).

During the period of readjustment to the new reality in which the husband is gone, the wives take over men’s responsibilities. Around 90% of the wives successfully readjust by becoming more active: shopping, meeting with friends, spending time with their children, developing careers, or devoting more time to hobbies, which makes them spend less time thinking about their husbands’ absence. The remaining 10% are the women who “withdraw, go into a shell, have no friends, no neighbors, no church, no family”\(^16\). Therefore, the latter are most likely to look for support on the Internet.

---


\(^12\) E. Turner, op. cit.


\(^14\) E. Turner, op. cit.

\(^15\) H. Hagmark-Cooper, *To Be a Sailor’s Wife*, Newcastle upon Tyne 2012.

\(^16\) E. Turner, op. cit.
The US Navy\textsuperscript{17} divides the process into the following stages: anticipation of loss, detachment and withdrawal, emotional disorganization, recovery and stabilization, anticipation of homecoming, renegotiation of the marriage contract, reintegration and stabilization.

What is the difference between missing and the deployment syndrome? The latter is a broader phenomenon with a more systematic character. Missing is just one of various emotions present in the deployment syndrome. Similarly, it may involve both the healthy missing and the unhealthy one – in which case professional help should be sought.

**HOW THE INTERNET HELPS WOMEN**

Women who experience negative emotions often look for support on the Internet. We will now focus on why they do it, why it helps them, and in what ways.

Nowadays women can easily look for websites related to their problem, especially social platforms, blogs, or forums. They may feel isolated in their pain, which makes them seek others in a similar situation. They may be afraid or ashamed of speaking about their feelings to a relative or a therapist. Instead, they read other women's stories or try to contact them.

The therapeutic power of blogging and discussing problems on the Internet has been a popular subject of analysis among researchers who study reasons why we blog\textsuperscript{18}, the therapeutic process of writing about emotions\textsuperscript{19}, writing on blogs and social media sites\textsuperscript{20}, or specific types of blogging, e.g. on death\textsuperscript{21}.

Following are the examples of various sources of help that women are likely to find on the Internet. A brief comment on each will be provided in order to show how and in what way women can benefit from a given source.

**BLOGS**

Nowadays blogging is one of the most popular ways of expressing one’s views on the Internet. “Blog is short for weblog. Log means »diary«, as in a captain's log on


a ship”22. The blog is a modern type of diary, but while a diary is usually kept private, a blog is public and the author wants others to read it.

What we have observed is that women create blogs for two main reasons. The first one is to share their own stories and emotions. Writing about their feelings is a way to process them. The other reason is to share some positive content with their readers to comfort them: quotes, pictures, music, or personal stories. Paradoxically, many people who have experienced a tragedy in their life start to see the world differently and become more optimistic. And often when they have overcome their difficulties, they want to help people who are still coping with some.

The first example is a 26-year-old Christina Rush who has been married to a navy man since 2008. On her blog, The Journey of a Navy Wife, she writes about her everyday struggles related to the deployment:

> Basically the point of this blog is to say, no matter where he is... There are little things that make him feel close to home. No matter where he is, I will always have something here to remind me of him. And those things will always bring a smile to my face and added proof there can be bits of happiness during deployment if you allow it23.

Rush shares her daily life with the readers, always trying to inspire them with hope: “Deployment CAN be a positive experience. Only you can determine how it will affect you”, or speaking about herself: “I thrive during deployment, I do not wish to merely survive”24.

Good Grief: A Young Widow’s Journey is another interesting blog; however, it is targeted at readers dealing with different emotions, namely, widows. Its author, Noel, is a 34-year-old widow who lost her husband when she was 30:

> It’s been amazing to me all of the things that I’ve learned. As an American, we have so few customs when it comes to grief. There is no structure to our grief. There is no manual for how to be a widow or how to handle one. I was thinking that I would use this to share what I’m going through. Maybe it will be helpful to other widows and to people who know widows25.

She recalls important moments of her journey and shares her insecurities while also trying to convey messages of hope to her readers.

The analysis of the blogs’ contents shows that not only do bloggers describe their pain, but they also write about simple matters. Blogs serve as both a modern type of diary to their owners and a source of help to their readers who may solely enjoy reading, not necessarily with the aim of interacting with the author in mind.

---


FORUMS

Likewise, forums are a means of expressing opinions and views on the Internet. In his book on social media, Brown writes:

> Social media sites like forum sites can allow people to voice out their opinions and concepts without the need to reveal their whole self and become the object of rejection and ridicule. These social media sites are more focused on what and how you can make other people benefit from you.\(^{26}\)

Unlike blogs, forums have a more fixed structure and are moderated, which gives less freedom to their members than a blog. It is often easier for women to connect and interact using forums. Here they can discuss different topics openly, remaining anonymous if they like, which might be helpful for women who write about their negative emotions. Because of the shared experiences, nobody is going to judge women for who they are. They open up to other women who are more likely to understand them than someone who has never experienced deployment or grief, but may be in their vicinity.

Among numerous forums and discussion groups, the following are worth mentioning. Navywives.com is a web portal run by “a retired Marine couple”, as they call themselves, BJ and Cindy. Their experiences have inspired them to create a large network with various sections: legal issues, moving day, poetry, music, and links to sister sites. Navywives.com (also Militarywives.com) offers help not only to navy wives, but to military wives in general. Its forum is divided into sections depending on the type of military forces and includes a Navy Wives Forum and Marine Wives Forum. As of 21 November 2013, a total of 13,116 members have registered on the forum.\(^{27}\)

Navy for Moms has been created to bring solace to mothers of sailors. It has developed into a gigantic network with discussion groups. Wives can join a group called “Girlfriends, Fiancés, and Wives of Sailors” (3361 members), or “NAVY WIVES ON N4M” (1034 members)\(^{28}\), to name a few. Registration is simple and takes a few minutes. Anyone can add a thread to the discussions. Moreover, there is a chat where women talk about their everyday problems and challenges. Having registered, I was warmly welcomed by the community. One of the members even sent me a private message offering help in my research. I quickly realized that the women there were very hospitable, warm and helpful.

Basing on observations and the analysis of contents we can conclude that the most important aspect of forums is interaction. Women can join conversations, share their stories, find understanding, support and form strong friendships on forums. This is what makes them feel less lonely. If they do not have the confidence or energy to interact themselves, they can simply read threads without responding to them.

---


ASSOCIATIONS AND ORGANIZATIONS FOR SAILORS’ WIVES

As can be seen, blogs and forums can help grieving widows and women missing their husbands or those suffering from the deployment syndrome. Associations and organizations are yet a different source of support. Depending on their aims they can be divided into two groups.

The Naval Service Training Command is a governmental site providing necessary information for sailors and their families, e.g. “Family Guide” with tips for those whose loved one has just joined the Navy, or “Military Spouse Info”. Programs targeted at those who stay on shore while their spouse is at sea, such as the Fleet and Family Support Program (FFSP), are also joined by many navy wives. This particular program provides day-to-day services to Navy families from its 80 sites located all over the world.

Another non-profit organization, Navy Wives Club of America, is “the only federation of sea service spouses and [its] (...) purpose is both educational and charitable”\(^{29}\). Its mission started in 1936 when a group of military spouses got together to offer guidance to people during the deployment. Psychological support is offered, as well as assistance in searching for available resources. The organization’s motto reads, “They also serve, who stay and wait”.

ASSOCIATIONS AND ORGANIZATIONS FOR SAILORS’ WIDOWS

Owing to different needs, widows seek resources created particularly for them. Here are the most noteworthy ones.

The Seamen’s Widow and Orphan Association\(^{30}\) was founded in 1833 and is based in Salem, MA. As it acts locally and is not geared towards a mass audience, it is not extremely popular, but it is remarkable for its tradition in supporting widows and orphans. With no political or religious connections, they base their funds on voluntary donations. Moreover, “[e]ach member of the Board of Managers personally delivers monthly stipends directly to a beneficiary”\(^{31}\).

Gold Star Wives of America, founded in 1945 by the war widows of World War II, is a non-profit organization with nearly 10,000 members\(^{32}\). Its chapters are located in 26 states and the members meet once a year at the National Convention. GSW was established to offer support, both financial and psychological, to widows and widowers of the military. As they claim, it is “the only service organization capable of providing services to the active duty and service connected military widow”\(^{33}\).

---


\(^{31}\) Ibidem.

\(^{32}\) As of 20\(^{th}\) November 2013.

Although the Society of Military Widows’ website\(^{34}\) does not look very attractive, it contains a lot of information with a checklist of administrative matters. The board and members are widows who assist “as a support network, as friends, and, sometimes, simply a shoulder to cry on”. Another organization that deserves attention is the American Widow Project. It was founded in 2007 by Taryn Davis, shortly after her husband was killed in Iraq. As a 21-year-old widow, she realized that there were not enough resources to help young widows at that time. She encountered other American women who had gone through similar tragedies and traveled across the United States to listen to their accounts. This has developed into one of the most remarkable organizations whose purpose is to provide help to widows.

It all started with a profile on Myspace.com. Davis created it as she wanted to reach other young widows who, as she says, react differently to a loss than a 50-year-old widow. She wanted to find women who would go out with her, talk about everyday problems or simply “be there” for her and for whom she could also be of help. To her surprise, the community grew rapidly.

Then she created a website. It is divided into sections: an events newsletter, resources, ranging from scholarships and grants to suicide prevention websites, and lists of books, songs, as well as quotations on grief and hope. A great part of the AWP is its members: one can find a massive amount of widows’ stories and links to blogs, forums, etc. Moreover, the Project operates a hotline – whenever the widow feels overwhelmed with her grief, she can contact someone from the AWP. What is noteworthy is that no professional counselors are involved and all support is provided by other widows.

The founders decided to create another project called WidowU\(^{35}\). Thanks to the AWP women can live past the tragedy; they can smile again. But they begin to ask questions such as: “What should I do next?”. Davis’s answer is: try WidowU\(^{36}\). It offers courses on health and fitness, education, pursuing one’s passion, and overcoming obstacles. On completing these four courses, the widow can attend advanced ones. Women are very enthusiastic about the courses; the feedback has been overwhelmingly positive\(^{37}\).

The AWP has helped a number of widows by creating a large social network, and mostly letting them believe they are not alone in their journey. It has earned many awards, including accolades, especially to Davis as its founder\(^{38}\).

THE PURPOSE OF THE RESOURCES

All of the organizations, associations and websites mentioned above have been created for one purpose: to help and support. What else do these resources have in common?

The vast majority of them were established by people who had experienced a tragedy. Generally, there are two reasons why they created a website/blog/organization. First, women want to express their pain, and to be heard, so this is for them. Instead of bottling up the emotions, people choose to share them with others, even though (or sometimes because) they are strangers. Blogs constitute the largest part of this group. Some of the bloggers may in fact not care what their readers are like or how many of them there are. What matters is that someone does read what they write. Others may, in turn, not care if there are any readers at all because what is really important is that they express their feelings.

The other reason is the wish to help other people. Their experience enables women to reach others, and also makes them more trustworthy. What is created for this purpose are mostly the forums, where both wives and widows can interact informally. There are also more formal organizations designed to support both wives and widows.

A perfect example of how all of this is combined is the American Widow Project[^39]. It started on a social platform to express feelings, and then it developed into a network for interaction with blogs, forums, etc. Then there was a further step: events organized in real life. Not all of the widows want to interact, but this is not a problem: they can still view the contents. Once they are ready to speak to others, they have forums. And then, women decide to go further than the AWP and social media and meet in person, participate in events, etc. But still, although there are many friends in the AWP community, the Internet is the starting point for all of their actions, the place where it all begins, a base made by women for women.

WOMEN’S FEEDBACK

Now, what about the reception? Two of the most representative resources will be analyzed in detail.

As mentioned earlier, the NavyForMoms community offers help to mothers, wives or girlfriends of sailors. Here are some of the opinions on this social network that can be found in different threads for the members[^40]:

This Navy For Moms site is so awesome and will help you so much. Reading what everyone is going thru really helps. I can’t imagine not having this site to get on everyday (HuffyMom23).


[^40]: The quotations are presented exactly the way they look in the Internet (spelling, punctuation, etc.); I Miss My Husband. Navy for Moms [on-line:] http://navyformoms.com/profiles/blogs/i-miss-my-husband [20.11.2013].
All of the parents, spouses, cousins, grans & gramps have been through this grieving process and this group I found will help you talk with others, help others and learn from this site. Stay strong and come aboard with us here...... God Bless....... (New2Navy).

When it comes to the support for widows, below there are several opinions on the American Widow Project and WidowU taken from both websites.

My motto today is NEVER GIVE UP. We can take our tragedies and turn them into victories to help others! Just as Taryn [Davis] has with the AWP! I hope that my story helps someone out there and that I get to meet some of you one day (Chelsey Stimson).

I am now one of the women I read about in the article just weeks before my husband died. I am a military widow, and as much as I hate the circumstances that have brought us together I am absolutely certain that I couldn't find myself amongst a stronger, more compassionate group of women (Halee).

I share this tragedy in hopes of letting another widow of similar circumstance know that you are not alone (Alexandra Hall).

The physical challenges forced me to look within myself and face my fears. By focusing on the things Taryn was teaching us, I was able to channel my fear into something far more constructive (Anonymous).

These are only a few examples of the gratitude the members of this community feel. When asked about their contribution for the widows, one of the board members, Tara Fuerst, answered:

I think what we do is successful, but we are always evolving to meet the needs of the widows we serve. There are always ways to develop more and to meet the changing needs of widows as they continue on through their journey.

**CONCLUSION**

What has been presented is the negative aspect of separation called navy blues. A wide range of emotions make a person helpless because the everyday reality changes, and “[i]n fact many Navy wives feel more like throwing punches than kisses at their husbands right before they leave, and many relate that homecoming is more stressful than blissful”

---

43 T. Fuerst, PhD project. Message to Kamila Midor. E-mail [19.06.2013].
44 E. Turner, op. cit.
the terrible moment each military widow experiences when two officers visit her and say those dreadful words: “The Secretary of Defense regrets to inform you….”

Both Navy wives and widows, who usually are young women, might feel lonely and abandoned in their suffering. As a result, they seek help on the Internet which can give them a lot of support. The resources are varied: from simple ones, such as blogs and forums, to more complex, such as discussion groups and social networks, to the most extended ones – the associations and organizations. All of these share one purpose: to bring solace and give hope. We can draw conclusions from women’s comments; what they seem to value most is that there are other people who know or imagine what they feel. When a person goes through a difficult time, they often feel like they are the only one in the world who feels this way. Thanks to the websites and organizations, women get connected and help one another. Sometimes being heard is what they need most.

Resources can be divided into two groups: those for the authors (to express emotions, to be heard) and those for the readers (to comfort them, to enable them to interact on forums and social platforms, to provide them with individual support via formal organizations). Sometimes both purposes may be present. The Internet makes it possible for women from different geographical locations to realize they are not alone. Women who transition from a passive participation (reading) to an active one (discussing) can benefit from anonymity; it is easier to write about problems when one remains anonymous. Perhaps, when women see that there are others like them, they start to trust them and no longer feel the need to be anonymous. Eventually they decide to meet others in real life.

What is the future of these resources? It seems that they will constantly develop so that the women get help and are not defeated by the storm of their emotions. And if they do, there will be people who have experienced it too, and who will support them in rebuilding their lives and arouse hope that the blues will eventually end.

BIBLIOGRAPHY


Brown G., Social Media 100 Success Secrets, Newstead 2008.


Davis T., Big AWP Announcement, Film [on-line:] http://goo.gl/waciWN [28.11.2013].


Fuerst T., PhD project, Message to Kamila Midor, e-mail [19.06.2013].

Hagmark-Cooper H., To Be a Sailor’s Wife, Newcastle upon Tyne 2012.


SUMMARY

The expression ‘navy blues’, taken from the Los Angeles Times article on women coping with separation, refers to a mixture of emotions that the women may experience after her husband leaves, which is studied in this paper.

The first part of the paper is a brief comment on American sailors and their wives, with a focus on the deployment cycle, followed by a passage on missing and grieving from the psychological perspective.

The second part is an overview of possible sources of help available online for contemporary American women who find themselves in such a situation. The review includes a collection of websites where a wife/widow may ask for support, express her feelings and anxieties, or merely contact other women in a similar position.

The aim is to present the problem of ‘navy blues’ and contribute a voice in the discussion on how modern technology may serve as a source of help with the issue.
Kamil Burski, Jaryna Smertyha

THE INFLUENCE OF SOCIETY ON SPATIAL PLANNING IN THE COMMUNE – LEGAL ASPECTS

Faculty of Law and Administration, Jagiellonian University

Spatial planning is the main instrument of spatial policy. In Spatial Planning and Development such qualities as spatial requirements, including urban planning and architecture, architectural and landscape requirements of environmental protection, protection of monuments and cultural goods, the economic advantages of space are taken into account. The relationships of all the modalities and functional, socio-economic, environmental, cultural, compositional and aesthetic requirements are taken into account in the solutions adopted in acts of planning. It also determines the way of performing property rights. According to Art. 140 of the Civil Code\(^1\), property rights are the rights of an owner to use and dispose the things in accordance with the socio-economic purpose of its rights, in particular the capacity to collect benefits and other income of things within the limits set by the laws and rules of social intercourse, with the exclusion of other people. Art. 140 presents the laws without closer definitions, what means that we should not determine the ownership of individual provisions, but the whole legislation. This can be both civil law and the provisions of other areas of law, especially administrative law. There are many special laws that interfere deeply in the sphere of property rights\(^2\), including the Act of 27 March 2003 of Spatial Planning and Development\(^3\) which is the main point of reference for our further consideration in the text. This law comprehensively defines the principles of spatial policy, moreover, the scope and manner of conducting matters connected with earmarking land for specific purposes and establishing the rules for the land and buildings. To increase community involvement, co-care and responsibility for decisions made by the local authorities and make their’s decision more flexible and less routine, the local authority is compelled to adjust the scope of its activities to

---

1 Dziennik Ustaw 2014, item 121, as amended.
3 Dziennik Ustaw 2015, item 199, as amended.
the real needs and expectations of society, not just visible from its level⁴. Necessary and desirable thing is to provide citizens and civil entities such legal instruments that would affect the shape of the solutions adopted in the planning process. Such instruments can also be found in Polish administrative law. This phenomenon, known in the literature as *public participation*, we can define as: forum of exchanges that are organized for the purpose of facilitating communication between the government, citizens, stakeholders, interest groups, and businesses regarding a specific decision or problem. This definition explicitly excludes activities such as protest, expert workshops and serving as governmental officials. It is inclusive of public hearings, public meetings, focus groups, surveys, citizen advisory committees, referendums, initiatives, and negotiations, among other models⁵. The purpose of this paper is to present forms of public participation in decision-making on the creation of the spatial planning, using the method of formal and dogmatic study of law. The reference point was the analysis of normative acts, literature and case law jurisprudence.

The formulation and conducting of spatial policy in the municipality is the responsibility of the municipality. The study of directions of spatial management and local spatial development plans are adopted in order to determine it. In the science of administrative law, these acts are called planning acts. Jan Zimmermann defines it in such a way that acts of planning concern the behavior of public administration predicted in the future. They also determine and condition the behavior, defining their terms and circumstances under which they are to be taken. This essence of planning acts means that they use specific rules of law, and there are a lot of doubts whether these are rules of law or not. Zimmermann rightly notes that the administration must provide their own development and its own actions in the future, and there can be no question of its proper functioning without this. That also means that planning acts refer to financial (budgets), strategic (e.g. the development strategies of municipalities, provinces, etc.) and economic and spatial issues (spatial planning acts)⁶. In accordance with Art. 4 paragraph 1 of the *Act of Spatial Planning and Development* the destination of the area, the deployment of public purpose investments and the way of using and zoning of land take place in the local spatial development plan. The local development plan has a special place among the acts shaping the spatial order, and it is because this is an act of local law. This means that its findings take the form of regulations prevailing in the area of a given municipality. The *Constitution*⁸ gives acts of local law the status of the sources of law of general application in Art. 87 paragraph 2 and Art. 94. These acts have the following characteristics:

---


⁷ Dziennik Ustaw 2015, item 199, as amended.

⁸ Dziennik Ustaw 1997, No. 78, item 483, as amended.
they are established by the bodies of local self-government and territorial organs of government administration, they are applied in the territory of the authorities which have established them and they are issued on the basis and within limits specified in the law. Therefore, the provisions of the local plan, unlike the findings of other acts affecting the spatial order, involve not only public authorities, but also other stakeholders, including property owners covered by the provisions of this plan. Thus, they can form the basis for individual and specific decisions issued in administrative cases. In accordance with Art. 35 paragraph 1 item 1 of the Act of 7 July 1994 Construction Law before the decision on building permit or a separate decision to approve the construction project, the competent authority shall verify compliance of the construction project with the provisions of the local spatial development plan. These plans are very important because they determine what the owner of the property will be able to do with it. For example, whether there can be built a shopping center or a detached house, and if building is permitted, what should be the parameters for height, housing density, etc. These are specific legal acts that include both general standards, which refer not only to general principles of development of the area, but also to concrete standards, which set specific purposes, for example the real estate unit, what Zimmermann rightly pay attention to. The findings in local spatial development plans must not be contrary to the findings of a study of conditions and directions of spatial development and the basic act of planning which defines the spatial policy of the municipalities, including local zoning rules. The findings of the study, in accordance with Art. 9 paragraph 4 of the Act of Spatial Planning and Development are binding for the municipal authorities in the preparation of local plans. In the jurisprudence it emphasizes that the situation of non-compliance, or even contradictions between the local plan and the findings of the study, must justify the cancellation of the whole or part of the local plan. Municipal authorities, acting within the scope of the power of planning must respect the findings of the study adopting the local development plan. It is even stated by the Regional Administrative Court in Gdansk in its judgment of 24 September 2014, Ref. II SA / Gd 340/14, LEX No. 1534098. It is consistent with the position taken previously by the Supreme Administrative Court in Warsaw, which in the judgment of 5 July 2011, Ref. II OSK 666/11, LEX No. 1083676 considered that the adoption of arrangements inconsistent with the content of the study should be considered as actions in breach of the principle of drawing up a local development plan and causes invalidity of it. However the legislator tipped in Art. 9 paragraph 5 of the Act of Spatial Planning and Development that the study is not an act of a local law. Taking into account the fact that the adoption of local plans is, in principle, optional, and in their absence,

---

11 Dziennik Ustaw 2014, item 1409, as amended.
12 Dziennik Ustaw 2015 item 199, as amended.
13 Ibidem.
in the case of a change in land development or construction of buildings, the mayor must give zoning and land development decision. Study findings that are not universally binding legal act will not affect the terms and conditions set out in this decision. The solution adopted by the legislature has been criticized widely in public debate and doctrine, since there was no positive effect on the spatial order. Moreover, there were many cases of corrupting mayor in order to obtain through administrative proceedings favorable zoning decision. This way is faster and less complicated than the procedure of preparation of the study/local plans. In my opinion, there should be the rule of the law on spatial planning and development requiring the mayor to issue a zoning decision that is not in conflict with the findings of a study of conditions and directions of spatial development.

The municipal council has the exclusive competence to enact municipal spatial planning acts. The acts are adopted according to the special procedure laid down in the rules of the Act of Spatial Planning and Development\textsuperscript{14}. Because of the particular importance of spatial planning acts and considering the fact that they are related directly to one of the fundamental social orders and development right, these procedures must take into account as far as possible the participation of citizens in decision-making processes. Reliable and effective exercise of official authority in a civil society requires maintaining a permanent dialogue of the representatives and the voters, as well as the creation of mechanisms of cooperation with citizens. They should be given the possibility to take part in the exercise of public authority. It will also help to balance opposing forms of representative and direct democracy. The principles of social dialogue and civil society undoubtedly require the participation of legal protection groups, in consideration of our case self-governing community, direct participation in the relevant decision-making processes. As Iwona Niźnik-Dobosz rightly observes, nowadays the performance of public administration is in the stage of transition from a representative democracy to participatory democracy. It takes place on the basis of the constitutional notion of civil society where participatory democracy is a representative democracy deepened with a pluralist collective method for making decisions by, legitimized democratically, public authority (public sector). The primary function of administrative law is controlling of social processes, \textit{inter alia}, by providing legal capacity of public power to create balanced and versatile consulted decisions in public matters with the involvement of stakeholders\textsuperscript{15}. The aim of civic participation, according to Dariusz R. Kijowski, is gaining social acceptance for actions of public authorities and citizens’ confidence as the conditions of effectiveness of its decision\textsuperscript{16}. The literature emphasizes that public involvement

\textsuperscript{14} Ibidem.


beyond the act of voting is desirable due to the fact that it helps with civic education (educational function), increases the real control of citizens over power (function of legitimacy of the decision), helps to create the identification of the local community (integration function), and creates additional opportunities for the exchange of arguments (deliberative function). In my opinion, while securing elements of participation the social impact on planning procedures appears to be necessary in order to avoid problems and social conflicts arising from the findings acts. The need for taking into account the social factor in the decision making process in local government is a consequence resulting directly from the preamble of the Constitution principle of subsidiarity. Ensuring the participation of the public and other competent authorities in procedure of adopting the study of conditions and directions of spatial management or local spatial development plans is essential in order to crash a strategic vision of local public authorities with the views of others.

Residents of municipalities that form the self-governing community are the primary subjects of power in the community. In accordance with Art. 11 paragraph 1 of the Act of The Local Self-Government, they take the decision during voting (through elections and referendum) or through the municipal authorities elected by themselves. According to the dominant in the jurisprudence view, the Act of Spatial Planning and Development clearly rules out the possibility of conducting a local referendum relating to the planning assumptions. Such approach took the Supreme Administrative Court in Warsaw in its judgment of 13 November 2012, ref. II OSK 2467/12, LEX No. 1291975 and in the judgment of 20 March 2014, Ref. II OSK 344/14, LEX No. 1483403. The courts have argued this position with the fact that the Act of Spatial Planning and Development formalized the procedure for public participation in lawmaking planning, and these forms did not mention a local referendum; at the same time it gave the right to decide on planning for local councils.

Both during the procedure of making the study of conditions and directions of spatial development (Art. 11 of the Act of Spatial Planning and Development) and local spatial development plan (Art. 17 of the Act of Spatial Planning and Development) once the municipal council made a resolution on the accession to prepare or change study or plan, the mayor has a duty to announce it in the local press. It can be done with the announcement, as well as customary, accepted in a town (for example by hanging notices on bulletin boards). At the same time the mayor determines the form, place and deadline for submitting proposals for study or plan, but it cannot be earlier than 21 days from the date of publication. The right to make proposals has

17 P. Swaniewicz, Partycypacja społeczna w realizacji polityk miejskich [in:] Partycypacja obywateli i podmiotów obywatelskich w podejmowaniu rozstrzygnięć publicznych na poziomie lokalnym, ed. M. Stec, M. Mączyński, Warszawa 2012, p. 36.
18 Dziennik Ustaw 2013, item 594, as amended.
19 Dziennik Ustaw 2015 item 199, as amended.
20 Ibidem.
21 Ibidem.
any person, regardless of the status of the owner of the property or legal interest. The Supreme Administrative Court in Warsaw with the judgment of 4 September 2009, Ref. II OSK 1359–1308, LEX No. 597220 confirmed the fact that the legislator at various stages of preparation and adoption of the plan has not made property owners located in the area parties to this proceeding within the meaning of Art. 28 of Administrative Proceeding Code what means that the right to make proposals is not based on the legal interest of the complainants. The law does not explicitly recognize the right to make proposals for a study/plan for everyone, but an open invitation to submit these proposals means that there are no restrictions. The legislator did not provide a specific form for the proposal. Therefore, it is also possible to present them in electronic form. A period of 21 days cannot be shortened but can be extended, which results directly from the use by the legislator of the words “not less than 21 days”. The use of shorter term will lead to a challenge of the legality of the resolution. Yet, based on the previous Act of 1994 of Spatial Development, the Supreme Administrative Court in Warsaw in its judgment of 4 November 1999, Ref. IV SA from 1683 to 1698, LEX No. 48260, said that the time limit of 21 days should fall on the office working days, so as to create a real opportunity for citizens to familiarize themselves with the planned legal regulation. Lateness of proposals and remarks will leave them without consideration and the ability to restore the deadline – he procedure of preparation of study or plan is based on a chronological sequence of actions, which follow one after another in such a way that the results of completed activities directly affect another. Restoring the deadlines for submitting applications become redundant, since the project is a subject to the various stages or even has already been adopted. The mayor has a duty to consider all proposals for study or plan. The law neither requires the determination by the authority examining how to include proposals in the plan, nor the reasons for the rejection of the applications. In accordance with Art. 7 of the Act of Spatial and Planning Development, a mayor’s decision of not granting applications cannot be appealed to an administrative court. In the initial stage of the functioning of the Act, during the proceedings of the planning, entities possessing a certain interest had the right to challenge draft regulations in the form of a complaint to the administrative court. Such a legal solution undoubtedly prolonged the planning process. Currently, a resolution on the local plan may be challenged after the completion of the planning proceeding. A mayor, after diagnosis of the applications, opinions and approvals of competent authorities

22 J. Goździewicz-Biechońska, Partycypacja społeczna w tworzeniu prawa na przykładzie miejscowego planu zagospodarowania przestrzennego, „Samorząd terytorialny” 2008, No. 7–8, p. 38.
23 Dziennik Ustaw 2013, item 267, as amended.
25 Ibidem., p. 128.
26 Dziennik Ustaw 2015, item 199, as amended.
required by law, shows the project of study/plan to the public and publish it on the municipal office website for at least 21 days. Nowadays, local communities can influence the content of the study or local plan during public discussion on the adopted solutions organized by the mayor. The entity to which the legislator grants the right to participate in public discussion has not been explicitly specified. So we can presume that it may be any person, regardless of the legal interest. Any findings and conclusions from the discussion have to be documented in the protocol. They provide formal documentation of the act. We can observe relatively weak status of the discussions compared to other solutions, e.g. submitting comments and proposals, which must be obligatorily considered. The Supreme Administrative Court in Warsaw in its judgment of 20 June 2006, Ref. II OSK 277/06, LEX No. 266913 confirmed that the characteristic of “public discussion” is searching views of specific social groups (self-governing community or communities that have an interest). This discussion has a form of a consultation, so its results are not binding for the municipal authorities.

After publishing the project of study of the conditions and directions of spatial developing or local spatial developing plan, citizens, legal entities and organisations without legal entity are invited to comment on the draft. The deadline is determined in the announcement, however, it cannot be less than 14 days from the end of the period lining project in case of the plan. In case of the study the deadline cannot be shorter than 21 days. There is no requirement of having a legal entity to the property, which remark refers to, or legal interest to comment on the draft. It is important that the right to submit comments on the study is not entitled to authorities that have competence for prior opinions and reconciliation of the project. We should agree with it because acquainting with their opinions is the part of the previous stage of the planning process, making remarks again could constitute an unwarranted extension of the process. Public authorities, including the authorities reconciling the plan, have the right to submit remarks to the draft of the local plan. The literature emphasizes that the content of the remarks to the draft can be freely shaped by the applicant. In particular, these remarks should not be related to any areas covered by the study, nor confined to an area of a particular purpose. They both can have functional character (changing the allocation for the site) and those connected with widening or narrowing the area for a specific purpose. The substantive content of the comments on the draft can rely on the fact that it expresses dissatisfaction with one or more of its findings in this project, it can also indicate alternatives to those adopted in the project. When deciding how to consider remarks on the draft of a local plan, both


the municipal council and its executive body must tell citizens that they are taken into account, or rejected, but justify it accurately and convincingly. In fact the appellant should know the argument of the council and estimate whether they fall within the limits of the law. For the diagnosis of the condition of remarks a brief mention of the manner of their recognition in the list of remarks without indicating specific reasons rejecting comments cannot be considered. If there is no such position of the municipal council, it may result in the annulment of the local plan. In a similar vein, the administrative courts take a position on the settlement of remarks to the study of conditions and directions of spatial development. Settlement of the council has to be substantive and be accompanied by its assessment of the merits of attention in the aftermath of which attention can be accepted or rejected. It means that the council cannot limit itself to consider “list of remarks” not covered by the authority issuing the draft of study but must be familiar with their content and subject to a vote each comment from the list, and do not settle collectively with the entire list in one voting. Solutions included in the Act, regarding the obligation to settle substantive opinion on the draft local plan/study, should be viewed positively. The nature of the solutions is essential for the credibility, taking into account the social factor in government decision-making. Public participation does not have to rely on the transfer of decision-making decisive voice for citizens because it is the domain of direct democracy. The solutions adopted by the legislator, however, limit full flexibility in decisions of authority and make them start a dialogue with the public.

The processes of planning are not easy, especially if there are the processes at the crossroads of many conflicting interests – the municipalities, private investors, various organized groups within the local communities and individuals. The procedures for planning in the Polish legal system includes elements of social participation, almost at every stage. The very fact of accession to the drafting and presentation of the project, subjects for publication and requires adequate notice, so that every citizen will be able to read this. The legislator allows a maximum group of people without having to show a legal interest, speak directly about the study or the provisions of the local plan – through institutions of conclusions and observations, and the institution of the public debate on adopted solutions. The effectiveness of social participation, however, largely depends on the current state of civil society, whether the units are willing to take the challenge involved in the life of the local community. It also depends on taking into account the voice of society and giving an opportunity to provide alternative ideas. Certainly an important threat to the public participation in planning is poor country covering with local spatial development plans. It leads to the issue of zoning decisions, bypassing the planning procedure taking into account public consultation. At this point we should agree that either these decisions should be

30 Judgment of Supreme Administrative Court in Warsaw of 15 kwietnia 2008, Ref. II OSK 17/08, LEX No. 470949.
31 Judgment of Provincial Administrative Court in Olsztyn of 17 marca 2015, Ref. II SA/OI 1248/14, LEX No. 1770321.
eliminated from legal transactions and commit to mandatory adoption of local plans or be linked with the provisions of the study. Undoubtedly, it would be a step that strengthens the importance of public participation in the process of decision-making.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

LEGAL ACTS


Act of 14 June 1960, Administrative Proceeding Code, as published in Dziennik Ustaw 2013, item 267, as amended.

Act of 23 April 1964, Civil Code, as published in Dziennik Ustaw 2014, item 121, as amended.


Act of 27 March 2003 of Spatial Planning and Development, as published in Dziennik Ustaw 2015 item 199, as amended.

LITERATURE


Summary

The article presents an institution of public participation in decision-making on the creation of the spatial planning acts – the study of conditions and directions of spatial management and local spatial development plans. Authors discussed in detail and commented on public participation at every stage of the creation of these documents, presenting at the own demands.
**MASKA** (Magazyn antropologiczno-społeczno-kulturowy) to czasopismo naukowe wydawane przez Katedrę Porównawczych Studiów Cywilizacji UJ i zrzeszające studentów oraz doktorantów szeroko rozumianych nauk humanistycznych, z naciskiem na badania kulturowe i społeczne w obrębie m. in. antropologii, socjologii, filozofii i orientalistyki.

MASKA to kwartalnik ukazujący się nie tylko w wersji papierowej, ale także elektronicznej. Artykuły przyjmowane do czasopisma muszą być powiązane z tematem numeru (podanym każdorazowo z kilkumiesięcznym wyprzedzeniem) i opatrzono recenzją pracownika naukowego ze stopniem co najmniej doktora. Artykuły, recenzje, reportaże i felietony przeznaczone na stronę internetową przyjmowane są na bieżąco, a ich recenzja naukowa nie jest konieczna. O zamieszczeniu tekstu w czasopiśmie bądź na stronie zawsze decyduje Redakcja MASKI.

Zachęcamy do nadsyłania artykułów do kolejnych numerów MASKI. Szczegóły dotyczące naboru znajdują się na stronie internetowej.

strona internetowa: [www.maska.psc.uj.edu.pl](http://www.maska.psc.uj.edu.pl)
e-mail: redakcja.maska@gmail.com